APPENDIX B
Historic Resources

THE CITY OF NEW YORK LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 Centre Street, 9N, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-7700 www.nyc.gov/landmarks

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING/LA-CEQR-M 8/11/2008

Project number **Date received**

Project: 15 PENN PLAZA 139 WEST 32 STREET BBL 1008087501

[ ] No architectural significance

[X] No archaeological significance

[ ] Designated New York City Landmark or Within Designated Historic District

[ ] Listed on National Register of Historic Places

[X] Appears to be eligible for National Register Listing

[ ] May be archaeologically significant; requesting additional materials

Comments: The LPC is in receipt of the draft EAS and SEIS for the above cited project. The text is acceptable for historic resources and archaeology.

There are no archaeological concerns for the project site.

8/21/2008

SIGNATURE DATE

Gina Santucci

24891_FSO_GS_08212008.doc

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission

1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818

http://nyc.gov/landmarks

Mary Beth Betts
Director of Research
mbetts@lpc.nyc.gov

March 26, 2008

William N. Hubbard, President
Center Development Corporation
437 Madison Avenue
New York, NY 10022

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Hubbard:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

CENTER DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

March 14, 2008

Robert B. Tierney, Esq.
Chairman
Landmarks Preservation Commission
One Center Street, 9th Floor
New York, NY 10007

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania

Dear Bob,

I am writing to urge you to reconsider the Commission's position on the captioned property.

This hotel is both a structural and cultural landmark.

Physically, it is an imposing example of beautiful design and solid construction, from the era in which Warren and Wetmore designed Terminal City, which it mirrors.

It is also an icon with respect to the City's cultural and musical heritage.

Sincerely yours,

William N. Hubbard III
President

cc: Kent Barwick, Municipal Art Society
Simeon Bankoff, Historic Districts Council
Roger P. Lang, New York Landmarks Conservancy

437 MADISON AVENUE
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10022
TEL: 212-755-5555
FAX: 212-755-4231

PLEASE REPLY TO:

1890 PALMER AVENUE
LARCHMONT, NEW YORK 10538-2058
TEL: 914-833-2600
FAX: 914-833-2605

PLEASE REPLY TO:

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

MARY BETH BETTS
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
MBETTS@LPC.NYC.GOV

February 14, 2008

Assembly Member Richard N. Gottfried
New York State Assembly
250 Broadway, Room 2232
New York, NY 10007

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Assembly Member Richard N. Gottfried:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North NY NY 10007 Tel: 212-669-7700 Fax: 212-669-7960 TTY 212-669-7788
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

December 13, 2007

Assemblymember Richard N. Gottfried
New York State Assembly
250 Broadway 2232
New York, NY 10007

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, Manhattan

Dear Assemblymember Richard N. Gottfried

Thank you for submitting a request for evaluation. Staff will review the material and keep you informed of the process. We appreciate your interest in historic preservation and in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts
Director of Research

cc: Robert B. Tierney, Chair

RICHARD N. GOTTFRIED
75TH ASSEMBLY DISTRICT

CHAIR
COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

NEW YORK STATE ASSEMBLY

822 LEGISLATIVE OFFICE BUILDING, ALBANY, NY 12248
TEL: 518-455-4941 FAX: 518-455-5939

250 BROADWAY, RM. 2232, NEW YORK, NY 10007
TEL: 212-312-1492 FAX: 212-312-1494

E-MAIL: GOTTFRR@ASSEMBLY.STATE.NY.US

COMMITTEES:
RULES
HEALTH
HIGHER EDUCATION
MAJORITY STEERING

CHAIR
MANHATTAN DELEGATION

November 30, 2007

Robert Tierney, Chair
Landmarks Preservation Commission
One Centre Street, 9th Floor North
New York, NY 10007

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Bob:

I am writing in support of Manhattan Community Board 5's November 2007 resolution urging the Landmarks Preservations Commission to evaluate and consider the merit of a designation hearing for the Hotel Pennsylvania, located at 401 Seventh Avenue.

The Hotel Pennsylvania is a significant building, designed by the firm of McKim Mead & White as one of three landmark-worthy buildings, together with the old Pennsylvania Station and the Farley Post Office. The hotel opened in 1919 as the City's largest, and one of the world's largest, hotels, with the world's first high-rise hotel elevator. Its façade is distinguished, attractive, and in good repair.

It is also one of a significant group of masonry buildings on Seventh Avenue, including the Affinia Hotel (built as the Hotel Governor Clinton) on 32nd Street across from the Pennsylvania Hotel, Macy's, and the Nelson Tower on 34th Street. The building's historic significance is enhanced by the fact that the hotel's phone number, Pennsylvania 6-5000, is the longest continually used telephone number in service to this day and that it hosted some of the country's finest musical groups. McKim, Mead & White designed the Hotel Pennsylvania to be what they thought was fitting to greet travelers emerging from the firm's original Pennsylvania Station.

I hope the Commission will calendar a hearing for this important building so it can be preserved for future generations of New Yorkers.

Best regards.

Very truly yours,

Richard N. Gottfried
Assembly Member

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

MARY BETH BETTS
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
MBETTS@LPC.NYC.GOV

February 14, 2008

David Siesko, Chair
Community Board 5
450 Seventh Avenue, Suite 2109
New York, NY 10123-2199

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Siesko:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North NY NY 10007 Tel: 212-669-7700 Fax: 212-669-7960 TTY 212-669-7788
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

January 9, 2008

David Siesko
CB5
450 7th Avenue 2109
New York, NY 10123

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, Manhattan

Dear Siesko

Thank you for submitting a request for evaluation. Staff will review the material and keep you informed of the process. We appreciate your interest in historic preservation and in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts
Director of Research

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FIVE
450 Seventh Avenue, Suite 2109
New York, NY 10123-2199
(212) 465-0907
fax: (212) 465-1628
office@cb5manhattan.org

David Siesko, *Chair*

Vacant, *District Manager*

November 9, 2007

Hon. Robert B. Tierney
Chair
Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building
One Centre Street, 9th Floor North
New York, NY 10007

RE: Hotel Pennsylvania designation.

Dear Chair Tierney:

At the regularly scheduled monthly meeting of Community Board Five on Thursday, November 8, 2007, the Board passed the following resolution recommending designation by a vote of 21 in favor; 8 opposed; 1 abstention, 2 present not entitled to vote:

WHEREAS, On Tuesday October 2, 2007, concerned members of the public appeared before Community Board Five at our Landmarks Committee meeting seeking support in the effort to designate as an individual landmark the building at 401 Seventh Avenue, located between West 32nd and West 33rd Streets, known as the Hotel Pennsylvania; and

WHEREAS, A subcommittee was formed in order to research and evaluate the history and worthiness of the building, and the potential to designate this as a historic landmark, so that this could be reported back to the committee at our meeting on Tuesday October 30, 2007; and

WHEREAS, In 1917, the prominent architectural firm of McKim Mead & White was commissioned to design and construct a hotel to accommodate the passengers of the Pennsylvania Railroad; and

WHEREAS, The firm of McKim Mead & White is credited as the creator of such renowned architecture as the Washington Square Arch (1889), the second Madison Square Garden, at Madison Square (1890), the Cable Building at 611 Broadway (1892), the Morningside Heights campus of Columbia University (1893), the Bowery Savings Bank's first headquarters (1893), the New York Herald Building (1894), the University Club (1899), the Pierpont Morgan Library (1903), the Manhattan Municipal Building (1909-1915), the Metropolitan Museum of Art (1911), the James A. Farley Building – New York City's General Post Office, (1912-1914) and New York's Pennsylvania Station, constructed between 1904 through 1910; and

WHEREAS, Despite being known for its Beaux Arts architecture at the turn of the 20th century, the firm remained active into the 1960's, long after the founders had passed away, one of their last works being the design of the prominent National Museum of American History in Washington DC, which opened in 1964; and

WHEREAS, The chief designer of the hotel is the architect William Symmes Richardson, who also helped design the Pennsylvania Station, as well as the National City Bank Building in New York, the Girard Trust Company Building in Philadelphia and the Bank of Montreal, Canada. Mr. Richardson had joined the firm of McKim Mead & White in 1906, and remained a working architect until about 1925; and

WHEREAS, The renowned hotelier Ellsworth Statler – who was later named by the American Hotel Association as "Hotel Man of the Century" – was contracted to manage this property. When The Statler Hotel Pennsylvania opened its doors in 1919, it was considered to be the largest hotel in the world. The original hotel had 2,200 bathrooms, 3,537 beds and the world's first "high rise" elevators. Statler remained involved with the hotel for many years and eventually purchased this altogether in 1949; and

WHEREAS, Through the 1930's and 1940's the hotel's Café Rouge was considered to be one of the most popular nightclubs in New York. Among the big bands that performed here were Duke Ellington, Count Basie, the Dorsey Brothers, and most notably the Glenn Miller Orchestra. The hotel's phone number, Pennsylvania 6-5000, is immortalized in their hit tune, and is New York's longest continually used telephone number. It remains the same to this day; and

WHEREAS, After 1954, when the Statler Company merged into Hilton Hotel Corporation, the property has had several owners, and several names. Statler's name remained on the hotel until 1983, when this was renamed The New York Penta Hotel. The original historic name Hotel Pennsylvania reappeared in the 1990's; and

WHEREAS, There has been restorative work performed to the hotel in the mid 1980's and at the early part of this century; and

WHEREAS, Hotel Pennsylvania is bounded on the west by Seventh Avenue and on the north and south by West 33rd Street and West 32nd Street respectively. The building was erected on a site measuring 200' X 400'. There are 22 floors from street level to roof, including three levels in the penthouse. On the ground floor there are lobby entrances from West 32nd Street and West 33rd Streets to the lobby, and a ballroom entrance on West 33rd Street; and

WHEREAS, The base of the building is constructed of Indiana Limestone with Milford Pink Granite at the grade levels. Much of this has been painted over. The rusticated stone façade is punctuated by a series of pilasters, the predominant number of these having scrolled capitals. At the Seventh Avenue entrance to the hotel, there are six massive stone columns capped by an ornate stone balustrade; and

WHEREAS, In between the windows of the first two floors there are several Rosso Levanto Marble decorative spandrels, many of the third floor windows appear to be original, with ornamental metal framing, six paned over six, in matching pairs. Windows from the fourth floor and above are predominantly one over one, there is stone dentil course between floors three and four; and

WHEREAS, Above the fourth floor there is a pronounced setback in the overall structure. Rising from the limestone base, the majority of the building is constructed of tan colored brick. At West 32nd Street, the building forms four individual towers partially conjoined at the building's center. These were constructed to maximize the exposure to sunlight and airflow. At West 33rd Street the two central towers are fully conjoined; and

WHEREAS, The façades above the 17th Floor are heavily ornamented in stone and terra cotta, including fluted pilasters and a massive ornamental limestone cornice. The penthouse structures above appear to be habitable space at the Seventh Avenue side of the building, and for mechanical usage at the east; and

WHEREAS, As it is today, boasting 1,700 hotel rooms and approximately 500,000 square feet, Hotel Pennsylvania is New York's fourth largest hotel; and

WHEREAS, In 1998 Vornado Realty Trust entered into an agreement to increase its interest in the Hotel Pennsylvania from 40% to 80, and then in 1999, by acquiring Planet Hollywood International's 20% interest in the hotel, Vornado owned this outright, and in connection with the 1999 transaction, Vornado also terminated the licensing agreement with Planet Hollywood for an Official All-Star Hotel; and

WHEREAS, Demolition plans have been announced for the hotel and a 2,500,000 square foot office tower will be built by 2011 on its site, a building of this size would have significantly more square footage than The Empire State Building, although this may not be as tall; and

WHEREAS, Upon evaluation of the information pertaining to the architecture and rich cultural history of the hotel, during Community Board Five's October 30th Landmarks Committee meeting, the subcommittee voiced opinions both in favor and against designation; and

WHEREAS, After hearing opinions both in favor and against designation, the committee voted to recommend in favor; therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That Community Board Five strongly RECOMMENDS DESIGNATION as an individual landmark, the building at 401 Seventh Avenue, known as the Hotel Pennsylvania.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this matter.

Sincerely,

David Siesko
Chair

Howard Mendes
Chair, Landmarks Committee

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

MARY BETH BETTS
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
MBETTS@LPC.NYC.GOV

February 14, 2008

Simeon Bankoff
Executive Director
Historic Districts Council
232 East 11th Street
New York, NY 10003

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Bankoff:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North NY NY 10007 Tel: 212-669-7700 Fax: 212-669-7960 TTY 212-669-7788
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

January 9, 2008

Mr. Simeon Bankoff
HDC
232 East 11th Street
New York, NY 10003

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Bankoff

Thank you for submitting a request for evaluation. Staff will review the material and keep you informed of the process. We appreciate your interest in historic preservation and in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts
Director of Research

HISTORIC DISTRICTS COUNCIL

THE ADVOCATE FOR NEW YORK CITY'S HISTORIC NEIGHBORHOODS

232 East 11th Street New York NY 10003
tel 212-614-9107 fax 212-614-9127 e-mail hdc@hdc.org

December 4, 2007

Hon. Robert B. Tierney, Chair
New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street
New York City, New York 10007

Dear Commissioner Tierney:

The Historic Districts Council requests that the Landmarks Preservation Commission consider the Hotel Pennsylvania in Manhattan for designation as an individual New York City landmark.

After designing Pennsylvania Station and the Farley Post Office, the architectural firm of McKim Mead & White was commissioned in 1917 to design and construct a hotel to accommodate the railroad's passengers. The elegant hotel, managed by renowned hotelier Ellsworth Statler, opened two years later. Its Café Rouge was one of the most popular nightclubs in the city during the 1930's and 1940's featuring such performers as Duke Ellington, Count Basie, the Dorsey Brothers and the Glenn Miller Orchestra who immortalized in song the hotel's phone number, Pennsylvania 6-5000.

Much discussion, planning and money have gone into the planning of the revival of the Pennsylvania Station area. It is ironic that the Hotel Pennsylvania, designed by the same architectural firm as the station, should not be part of these plans. Additionally in this boom time of New York City hotels, what was thought to be the largest hotel in the world at the time of its opening should not consigned to the dustbin of history.

We respectfully ask that a designation hearing be held for this significant, endangered building.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

Simeon Bankoff
Executive Director

cc: Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer
City Council Speaker Christine Quinn
State Senator Thomas J. Duane
Manhattan Community Board #5
Assemblymember Richard Gottfried

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

MARY BETH BETTS
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
MBETTS@LPC.NYC.GOV

February 14, 2008

Yoichiro Yoda
11 Mercer Street #4A
New York, NY 10013

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Yoichiro Yoda:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, neither the property's exterior nor its interior appears to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

THE CITY OF NEW YORK LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 CENTRE STREET, 9TH FLOOR, NEW YORK, NEW YORK, 10007
TEL: (212) 669-7700 FAX: (212) 669-7960

REQUEST FOR EVALUATION

The Landmarks Preservation Commission is responsible for safeguarding the architectural, historical and cultural heritage of New York City.

The Commission's Research Department is pleased to accept requests from the public for the evaluation of the architectural, historical or cultural significance of properties throughout the five boroughs. If a property appears to meet the criteria for designation as a Landmark, the staff may recommend it for consideration by the Commission.

To request an evaluation, please fill out this form and return it to the address below. Please provide as much information about the property as you can and, if possible, include a photograph.

Thank you for your interest in the work of the Commission.

PLEASE TYPE OR PRINT

Your Name	Daytime Telephone No.
YOICHIRO YODA	(917) 562-4159
Mailing Address	**Apartment**
11 Mercer Street	4A
City	**State** / **Zipcode**
New York	NY / 10013
Today's Date	
12/3/07	

PROPERTY TO BE EVALUATED

401 Seventh Avenue New York, NY 10001-2062
Address

Hotel Pennsylvania
Name (if any)

Hotel
Building Type (Original Use)

Mckim, Mead and White
Architect (if known)

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION PLEASE INDICATE BELOW ANY ADDITIONAL INFORMATION YOU MAY HAVE CONCERNING THE PROPERTY: HISTORY, SIGNIFICANCE, PRESENT CONDITIONS, CURRENT STATUS, CURRENT USE, etc.

I truly hope that the Hotel Pennsylvania will become an interior + exterior landmark. I think some people have forgotten, or do not realize about the historic + beautiful parts of the hotel that still DO exist, such as the stairs leading to the mezzanine level of the lobby, the original ballrooms, elevator call panels, the famous Cafe Rouge (where Glenn Miller performed) We need to learn from past mistakes and not repeat them. If we lose the Hotel Penn, we lose more than a hotel, we lose our diminishing historic heritage. It would be the shame of the century. Greed is destroying our city. Hotel Pennsylvania should be viewed as a monument of our glorious past, and as a gift to our future generations of Newyorkers, and the world.

Thank you very much.
Yoichiro Yoda
Artist/Historian

PLEASE RETURN THIS FORM TO: Mary Beth Betts, Director of Research
Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor, New York, N.Y. 10007

Rev. 9/99

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

MARY BETH BETTS
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
MBETTS@LPC.NYC.GOV

February 14, 2008

Marc Knasnow
310 West 18th Street #5A
New York, NY 10001

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Knasnow:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

MARY BETH BETTS
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
MBETTS@LPC.NYC.GOV

February 14, 2008

Gregory Jones
363 West 30th Street #8A
New York, NY 10001

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Jones:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

MARY BETH BETTS
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
MBETTS@LPC.NYC.GOV

February 14, 2008

Cheryl Piziali
29534 Mulane
Farmington Hills, MI 48334

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue, Manhattan

Dear Ms. Piziali:

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We want to thank you for your submission and for your interest in historic preservation. We hope that your interest in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission continues.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission

1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North New York NY 10007 (212) 669-7801 Fax (212) 669-7818

http://nyc.gov/landmarks

July 13, 2007

Mr. Eric Corley
323 East 8th Street 4D
New York, NY 10009

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Corley,

In response to the information you submitted concerning the property referenced above, a senior staff committee of the Landmarks Preservation Commission has reviewed the property for consideration as a potential landmark. At this time, the property does not appear to meet the criteria for designation and will not be recommended to the full Commission for further consideration as a New York City landmark.

We appreciate your interest in historic preservation and in the works of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts

The New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
1 Centre Street, 9th Floor North NY NY 10007 Tel: 212-669-7700 Fax: 212-669-7960 TTY 212-669-7788
http://nyc.gov/landmarks

February 1, 2007

Mr. Eric Corley

323 East 8th Street 4D
New York, NY 10009

Re: Hotel Pennsylvania, Manhattan

Dear Mr. Corley

Thank you for submitting a request for evaluation. Staff will review the material and keep you informed of the process. We appreciate your interest in historic preservation and in the work of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

Sincerely,

Mary Beth Betts

Mary Beth Betts
Director of Research

6

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation
Historic Preservation Field Services Bureau
Peebles Island, PO Box 189, Waterford, New York 12188-0189 518-237-8643

Bernadette Castro
Commissioner

October 30, 2003

Nathan J. Riddle
Historian
Allee King Rosen & Fleming
117 East 29th Street
New York, New York 10016-8022

RE: No. 7 Subway Extension-Hudson Yards Rezoning & Redevelopment
Eligibility Determinations
New York County, NY
03PR00864

Dear Mr. Riddle:

Thank you for requesting the comments of the State Historic Preservation Office concerning your project's potential effect upon historic resources. I have reviewed the documentation which you provided in accordance with the provisions of Section 14.09 of the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980.

Based on the documentation submitted, the properties listed below do not appear to meet the criteria for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places.

- Westyard Distribution Center, 386-404 Tenth Avenue
- 544-556 West 30th Street
- The former John H. Young Studios, 536 West 29th Street
- Former State Bank and Trust Company, 681-685 Eighth Avenue
- Market Diner, 572 Eleventh Avenue
- 300 West 38th Street
- 301 West 37th Street
- 369-371 West 35th Street
- 355 West 29th Street

The remaining properties appear to meet the National Register criteria. Many of the eligible properties in the study area can be organized thematically by historic context according to National Park Service guidelines (*National Register Bulletin 16B: How to Complete the National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form*). A historic context is a body of information about related properties organized by theme, place, and time. Based on the information provided we have identified the following historic contexts within the study area boundary: the Garment Industry; the Printing Industry; the Residential, Institutional, Industrial and Commercial Development of Hell's Kitchen; the Industrial History of Chelsea; and the Commercial Development around Penn Station.

An Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action Agency
printed on recycled paper

SR/NR-eligible Garment Industry Resources:
Resources associated with the garment industry are generally located between Sixth and Ninth Avenues and West 25th and West 42nd Streets. Fur industry properties are found in the southern portion of this area. Eligible historic resources representing New York's Garment Industry retain sufficient period integrity and meet Criterion A in the areas of commerce or industry. Many of these resources also meet Criterion C in the area of architecture as intact examples of garment lofts.

- 345-353 Seventh Avenue
- Seventh Avenue Building, 323-335 Seventh Avenue
- Kheel Tower, 311-315 Seventh Avenue
- Shapman 8th Avenue Building, 553-555 Eighth Avenue
- Former American Union Bank Building, 540-552 Eighth Avenue
- Thirty-Six Thirty-Seventh Arcade, 520-528 Eighth Avenue
- 509-519 Eighth Avenue
- Hoover Building, 501-507 Eighth Avenue
- 322 Eighth Avenue
- Harding Building, 440-448 Ninth Avenue
- 263-267 West 40th Street
- 251-255 West 39th Street
- Former Kermacoe Building, 257-267 West 39th Street
- 323-327 West 39th Street
- Shapman Building, 252-258 West 37th Street
- Garment Wear Arcade, 306 West 37th Street
- 315-325 West 36th Street
- 144-154 West 30th Street
- Fur Craft Building, 242-246 West 30th Street
- 214-222 West 29th Street
- 231-239 West 29th Street
- 241-245 West 29th Street
- 249-251 West 29th Street
- Industrial Building, 150-154 West 28th Street
- Fur Towers, 156-160 West 28th Street
- Fur Art Building, 236-240 West 27th Street
- Nelson Tower, 446-456 Seventh Avenue
- Fairmont Building, 239-241 West 30th Street

SR/NR-eligible Printing Industry Resources:
Eligible resources associated with New York's Printing Industry in the study area boundary are largely concentrated in Hell's Kitchen and Chelsea. Printing industry resources that meet the criteria for listing retain sufficient period integrity and meet Criterion A in the areas of commerce or industry. Many of these resources also meet Criterion C in the area of architecture as intact examples of printing loft design.

- Hill Building, 469-475 Tenth Avenue
- Master Printers Building, 406-416 Tenth Avenue
- Zinn Building, 210 Eleventh Avenue
- United Publishers Building, 231-249 West 39th Street
- Finck Building, 316-326 West 39th Street
- 344-348 West 38th Street
- Underhill Building, 438-448 West 37th Street
- 424 West 33rd Street
- 406-426 West 31st Street

SR/NR-eligible Residential, Institutional, Industrial, and Commercial Resources in Hell's Kitchen: The southern portion of Hell's Kitchen (also known as Clinton) falls within the study area boundary. (Hell's Kitchen is generally defined by West 34th to West 59th Streets and from Eighth Avenue to the Hudson River.) The eligible historic resources that represent various aspects of Hell's Kitchen's development include residences, institutional buildings (religious, educational, cultural), industrial buildings, and commercial buildings. These resources retain sufficient period integrity and meet Criterion A for their association with the historical development of the neighborhood. Many of these resources also meet Criterion C for their architectural design.

Residential Resources (Hell's Kitchen):

- 523-539 Ninth Avenue
- 347-353 West 44th Street
- 446-448 West 44th Street
- 454 West 44th Street
- 309 West 43rd Street
- 417-419 West 43rd Street
- 435 West 43rd Street
- 500, 502, and 506 West 42nd Street
- 274 West 40th Street
- 408 West 39th Street
- Former Barbour Dormitory, 330 West 36th Street
- 346 West 36th Street
- 367 West 35th Street
- 463 West 35th Street
- William F. Sloan Memorial YMCA, 360 West 34th Street
- Webster Apartments, 419 West 34th Street

InstitutionalResources (Hell's Kitchen):

- Former Second German Baptist Church, 407 West 43rd Street
- St. Raphael Roman Catholic Church and Rectory, 502-504 West 41st Street
- Christ Church Memorial, 334-344 West 36th Street
- West Side Jewish Center, 347 West 34th Street
- St. Michael's Roman Catholic Church Complex (includes church, rectory, vestry, convent, and school)
- Glad Tidings Tabernacle, 325-329 West 33rd Street
- Former New York Public Library, West 40th Street Branch, 457 West 40th Street
- Former Manhattan Opera House, 311 West 34th Street
- Actors Studio, 432 West 44th Street

Industrial Resources (Hell's Kitchen):

- Former Otis Elevator Company, 246-260 Eleventh Avenue
- Former New York Edison Company, 308-312 West 36th Street
- 343-345 West 39th Street
- Former Franco-American Baking Company, 509-517 West 38th Street
- Former Pinehill Crystal Spring Water Company, 500-504 West 36th Street
- 500 West 37th Street
- Former Gledhill Wall Paper Company, 541-545 West 34th Street

Commercial Resources (Hell's Kitchen):

- Cheyenne Diner, 411 Ninth Avenue
- River Diner, 452 Eleventh Avenue

SR/NR-eligible Industrial Resources in Chelsea:
The northwestern section of Chelsea falls within the study area boundary. (Chelsea is generally bounded by West 14th Street, West 30th Street, Sixth Avenue, and the Hudson River.) The resources meet Criterion A for their association with New York's industrial history and many meet Criterion C for their industrial design.

- Former Hess Brothers Confectionary, 502-504 West 30th Street
- Former Charles P. Rodgers and Co. Building, 517-523 West 29th Street
- Former W. & J. Sloane Warehouse, 541-561 West 29th Street
- 550 West 29th Street
- Former Berlin-Jones Envelope Company, 547-553 West 27th Street
- 241-245 West 26th Street
- 537-547 West 26th Street
- Standard Oil, 551-555 West 25th Street

SR/NR-eligible Commercial Resources near Penn Station:
There are a few eligible resources associated with the commercial development around New York's Penn Station. Property types in this thematic group include commercial office buildings and hotels. These resources meet Criteria A and C.

- Hotel Pennsylvania, 401 Seventh Avenue
- Former Equitable Life Assurance Company, 383-399 Seventh Avenue
- Former Governor Clinton Hotel, 371-377 Seventh Avenue
- New Yorker Hotel, 481-497 Eighth Avenue
- Pennsylvania Building, 225 West 34th Street
- Former J.C. Penney Building, 330 West 34th Street

Other SR/NR-eligible resources in the study area (separate from the thematic groups identified above):

- Lincoln Tunnel Entrance Plaza, Eleventh Ave. and West 39th St.
- Lincoln Tunnel South Ventilation Structure, 491 Eleventh Avenue.

Both of these resources are eligible as contributing components of the Lincoln Tunnel (determined eligible on 2/21/03). The Lincoln Tunnel is eligible under Criterion C in the areas of engineering and architectural design. The ventilation structures of the Lincoln Tunnel are notable for their streamlined Art Deco detailing. The Lincoln Tunnel also meets Criterion A in the areas of automobile transportation and regional planning.

- St. John the Baptist Roman Catholic Church and Convent, 207-215 West 30th Street.

Designed by Napoleon LeBrun, St. John the Baptist Church (1872) meets Criterion C as an example of Gothic-inspired ecclesiastical architecture.

- St. Francis Roman Catholic Church Complex, 129-143 West 31st Street.

The church, built 1891-92, meets Criterion C as an intact example of Renaissance Revival style architecture. Contributing buildings include a monastery and a school.

- Former French Hospital, 326-330 West 30th Street and 329 West 29th Street.

This former hospital building was erected as a hospital by the French Benevolent Society in 1928-29. It meets Criterion C as an example of Classical Revival institutional architecture. It may also meet Criterion A in the areas of health/medicine and social history.

Unevaluated Resource/Documentation Request:
As discussed, our office determined in 1989 (Route 9A project) that the High Line was not National Register-eligible. Based on information that was recently submitted by the Save Gansevoort Market Task Force, we have reversed our determination and noted that the section of the High Line that runs from

Horatio Street to West 16th Street is a contributing element of the National Register-eligible Gansevoort Market Historic District. In order to assess the integrity of the remaining section of the High Line that runs north of Gansevoort Market into the project area, we are requesting that you map and photograph the High Line and note which portions have been altered.

Comments on Study Area:
OPRHP will defer to NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission's request to retain the 400-foot study area boundaries.

If you have any questions regarding this review, please call me at (518) 237-8643, ext. 3266. Please refer to the Project Review (PR) number noted above in any correspondence.

Sincerely,

Kathleen A. Howe

Kathleen A. Howe
Historic Preservation Specialist

enc: Resource Evaluation

cc: Gina Santucci, LPC
Hollie Wells, MTA NYC Transit

THE CITY OF NEW YORK LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 Centre St., 9N, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-7700

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

MTA/DCP/ 03DCP031M — 10/29/03

PROJECT NUMBER — DATE RECEIVED

PROJECT 7 SUBWAY REZON/HUDSON YD

[ ] No architectural significance

[ ] No archaeological significance

[X] Designated New York City Landmark or Within Designated Historic District

[X] Listed on National Register of Historic Places

[X] Appears to be eligible for National Register Listing and/or New York City Landmark Designation

[X] May be archaeologically significant; requesting additional materials

COMMENTS

The LPC is in receipt of "Chapter 9: Architectural Historic Resources", revised working draft chapter dated 9/19/03. The following items in Table 9- 1, "Designated and eligible architectural resources within the project study area", should be revised as follows. The Baltimore & Ohio Railroad Warehouse, 11th Ave. at W. 26th St.; R.H. Macy and Co. Store, block bounded by 7th Ave., Broadway, and W. 33rd and 34th Sts.; Candler Building, 220 W. 42nd St. and 221 W. 41st St.; Times Square Hotel, 255 W. 43rd St.; and Holy Cross Roman Catholic Church Complex, 329-333 W. 42nd St. and 334 W. 43rd St. all appear eligible for LPC designation. Table 9-2, "Potential architectural resources", should be revised as per the attached three page printout. The SHPO and LPC concur that the 400' study area should be used for the project analysis.

cc: SHPO
PCP

H:\03dcp031m.at.wpd

Gina Santucci — 11/18/03 ~~11/18/03~~

Potential Architectural Resources Table 9-2

appears

Map and Photo Ref. No.		Name or Building Type	Address	LPC el.	S/NR el.
Transportation Structures and Other Public Infrastructure					
needs to be added to list		Penn Station Service Building	236-248 West 31st Street	X	X
	21	Lincoln Tunnel Entrance Plaza	Eleventh Avenue and West 39th Street		X
	22	Lincoln Tunnel Ventilation Structure	491 Eleventh Avenue		X
	23	Former NY Edison Co.	308-312 West 36th Street		X
needs to be added to list		Morgan General Mail Facility	Ninth Avenue		X
Garment Lofts					
needs to be added to list		Loft building	345-353 Seventh Avenue		X
	25	Seventh Avenue Building	323-335 Seventh Avenue		X
	26	Kheel Tower	311-315 Seventh Avenue		X
	27	Shampan 8th Avenue Building	553-555 Eighth Avenue		X
	28	American Union Bank Building	540-552 Eighth Avenue		X
	29	Thirty-Sixth Thirty-Seventh Street Arcade	520-528 Eighth Avenue		X
	30	Loft building	509-519 Eighth Avenue		X
	31	Hoover Building	501-507 Eighth Avenue		X
	32	Loft building	322-326 Eighth Avenue		X
	33	Harding Building	440-448 Ninth Avenue		X
	34	Loft building	263-267 West 40th Street		X
	35	Loft building	251-255 West 39th Street		X
	36	Former Kermacoe Building	257-267 West 39th Street		X
	37	Loft building	323-327 West 39th Street		X
	38	Shampan Building	252-258 West 37th Street		X
	39	Garment Wear Arcade	306 West 37th Street		X
	40	Loft building	315-325 West 36th Street		X
	41	Loft building	144-154 West 30th Street		X
	42	Fur Craft Building	242-246 West 30th Street		X
	43	Loft building	214-222 West 29th Street		X
	44	Loft building	231-239 West 29th Street		X
	45	Loft building	241-245 West 29th Street		X
	46	Loft building	249-251 West 29th Street		X
	47	Industrial Building	150-154 West 28th Street		X
	48	Fur Towers	156-160 West 28th Street		X
	49	Fur Art Building	236-240 West 27th Street		X
Other Loft and Industrial Building Types					
needs to be added to list		U.S.S. Intrepid	Hudson River		X
needs to be added to list		Hill Building	469-475 Tenth Avenue		X

2 of 3

				appears LPC ed	s/NR ed
	51	Master Printers Building	406-416 Tenth Avenue	X	X
	52	Westyard Distribution Center	386-404 Tenth Avenue		X
	53	Otis Elevator Company	246-260 Eleventh Avenue	X	X
	54	Zinn Building	210 Eleventh Avenue		X
	55	United Publishers Building	231-249 West 39th Street	X	X
	56	Finck Building	316-326 West 39th Street		X
	57	Warehouse	343-345 West 39th Street		X
	58	Loft building	344-348 West 38th Street		X
	59	Former Franco-American Baking Company	509-517 West 38th Street		X
	60	Underhill Building	438-448 West 37th Street		X
needs to be added to list		NY Terminal Warehouse Company	Eleventh Avenue and West 27th Street		X
	61	Warehouse	500 West 37th Street		X
	62	Former Pinehill Crystal Spring Water Company	500-504 West 36th Street		X
	63	Factory Former Gledhill Wall Paper Co.	541-545 West 34th Street		X
	64	Loft building	424 West 33rd Street		X
	65	Loft building	406-426 West 31st Street		X
	66	Former Hess Brothers Confectionary Factory	502-504 West 30th Street		X
	67	Manufacturing building	544-556 West 30th Street		X
	68	Charles P. Rodgers & Company Building	517-523 West 29th Street		X
	69	John H. Young Studios	536 West 29th Street		
	70	Former W&J Sloane Warehouse and Garage	541-561 West 29th Street and 306 Eleventh Avenue		X
	71	Manufacturing building	550 West 29th Street		X
	72	Former Berlin & Jones Envelope Company	547-553 West 27th Street		X
	73	Garage	241-245 West 26th Street		X
	74	Garage	537-547 West 26th Street		X
	75	Nelson Tower	446-456 Seventh Avenue	X	X
	76	Hotel Pennsylvania	401 Seventh Avenue	X	X
	77	Equitable Life Assurance	383-399 Seventh Avenue	X	X
	78	Governor Clinton Hotel	371-377 Seventh Avenue	X	X
	79	State Bank and Trust Co.	681-685 Eighth Avenue	X	X
	80	New Yorker Hotel	481-497 Eighth Avenue	X	X
	81	Cheyenne Diner	411 Ninth Avenue		X
	82	Market Diner	572 Eleventh Avenue		
	83	River Diner	452-454 Eleventh Avenue		
	84	Commercial building	300 West 38th Street	X	X
	85	Commercial building	301 West 37th Street		X
	86	Pennsylvania Building	225 West 34th Street		X

			appears JC el	S/NR el
87	Former J.C. Penney Co.	330 West 34th Street		X
88	Fairmont Building	239-241 West 30th Street		X
89	Standard Oil Offices	551-555 West 25th Street		X
90	Blockfront of tenements	523-539 Ninth Avenue		
91	Tenements	347-353 West 44th Street		
92	Rowhouses	446-448 West 44th Street		
93	Rowhouse	454 West 44th Street		
94	Tenement	309 West 43rd Street		
95	Former Second German Baptist Church	407 West 43rd Street		X
96	Tenements	417-419 and 421 West 43rd Street		
97	Tenement	435 West 43rd Street		
98	Model tenements	500-506 West 42nd Street	X	X
99	St. Raphael RC Church and Rectory	502 West 41st Street	X	X
100	Tenement	274 West 40th Street		
101	Tenement	408 West 39th Street		
102	Former Barbour Dormitory	330 West 36th Street		X
103	Christ Church Memorial	334-344 West 36th Street		X
104	Tenement	346 West 36th Street		
105	Apartment building	367 West 35th Street		
106	Residential buildings	369-371 West 35th Street		
107	Tenement	463 West 35th Street		
108	West Side Jewish Center	347 West 34th Street		X
109	William F. Sloan Memorial YMCA	360 West 34th Street	X	X
110	St. Michael's RC Church	414-424 West 34th Street	X	X
111	Webster Apartments	419 West 34th Street		X
112	Glad Tidings Tabernacle	325-329 West 33rd Street	X	X
113	St. Francis RC Church Complex	129-143 West 31st Street	X	X
114	St. John the Baptist RC Church and Convent	207-215 West 30th Street	X	X
115	Former French Hospital	326-330 West 30th Street		X
116	Residential building	355 West 29th Street		
117	Former New York Public Library Branch	457 West 40th Street	X	X
118	Former Manhattan Opera House	311 West 34th Street	X	X
needs to be added to list	Garment Center Capitol	498 & 500 Seventh Avenue	X	X