Appendix C: Historic Resources – Correspondence

THE CITY OF NEW YORK LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 Centre Street, 9N, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-7700 www.nyc.gov/landmarks

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

MTA/DCP CO-LEADS/SEQRA-M 6/24/2008

Project number **Date received**

Project: WESTERN RAILYARD

ARCHAEOLOGY REVIEW ONLY

Properties with no archaeological significance:

705 10 AVENUE, BBL 1010770029
806 9 AVENUE, BBL 1010440003

GS FOR ALS 6/26/2008

SIGNATURE DATE



24779_FSO_DNP_06262008.doc

David A. Paterson
Governor

Carol Ash
Commissioner

New York State Office of Parks,
Recreation and Historic Preservation

Historic Preservation Field Services Bureau • Peebles Island, PO Box 189, Waterford, New York 12188-0189
518-237-8643
www.nysparks.com

September 10, 2008

Nathan J. Riddle
AKRF, Inc.
440 Park Avenue South, 7th Floor
New York, New York 10016

Re: MTA
Review of archaeological potential - Western Rail Yard
Project - Proposed mixed-use redevelopment of the site
Bounded by Eleventh & Twelfth Aves. And Off site parcels
MANHATTAN, New York County
08PR03724

Dear Mr. Riddle:

Thank you for requesting the comments of the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) concerning your project's potential impact/effect upon historic and/or prehistoric cultural resources. Our staff has reviewed the documentation that you provided on your project. At this time, we concur with the recommendations of the New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) that the "off site" affordable housing locations are not sensitive for archaeological deposits due to past disturbance and therefore we recommend no examination for archaeological resources.

We look forward to consulting with you on architectural resources as the project progresses. Please be sure to refer to the OPRHP Project Review (PR) number noted above on all future communications.

Please contact me at extension 3291, or by e-mail at douglas.mackey@oprhp.state.ny.us, if you have any questions regarding these comments.

Sincerely

Douglas P. Mackey
Historic Preservation Program Analyst
Archaeology

An Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action Agency

printed on recycled paper

OFFICE OF PARKS·RECREATION·HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

Historic Preservation Field Services Bureau • Peebles Island, PO Box 189, Waterford, New York 12188-0189
518-237-8643
www.nysparks.com

David A. Paterson
Governor

Carol Ash
Commissioner

RESOURCE EVALUATION

DATE: March 19, 2009 STAFF: Kathy Howe

PROPERTY: various (see below) MCD: Manhattan

PROJECT REF: 08PR04116 COUNTY: New York Co.

****

ELIGIBLE PROPERTIES

Based on the information currently available, the following properties appear to meet the criteria for listing to the State and National Registers:

West Chelsea Historic District (06101.017162)
The locally designated West Chelsea Historic District appears to meet Criterion A for its association with New York City's industrial history and Criterion C for its outstanding collection of industrial architecture from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The district has approximately 30 buildings total located on all or parts of seven blocks. The period of significance for the district spans from 1885 to ca. 1930. According to the LPC designation report, "The West Chelsea Historic District, located along the Hudson River waterfront in Manhattan, is a rare surviving example of New York City's rapidly disappearing industrial neighborhoods. During much of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, the area was home to some of the city's and the country's most prestigious industrial firms. The Otis Elevator company, the Cornell Iron Works, the John Williams Ornamental Bronze and Iron Works, and the Reynolds Metal Company all had a presence in West Chelsea."[1]

Eleventh District Municipal Court/Seventh District Magistrates' Court, 314 West 54th Street (06101.017155)
This courthouse meets Criterion C as an outstanding example of neo-Renaissance civic design in New York City. It was designed by John H. Duncan and built in 1894-96. The three-story brick and stone building is notable for its elaborate terra-cotta ornament incorporating both Renaissance forms and symbols of justice.

[1] Christopher D. Brazee and Jennifer L. Most, and Mary Beth Betts, ed., "West Chelsea Historic District Designation Report," (New York: NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission, July 15, 2008), 4.

St. Benedict the Moor Church, 342 West 53rd Street (06101.017156)
This gable-fronted brick church on West 53rd Street in the Hell's Kitchen (Clinton) neighborhood of Manhattan is historically significant under Criterion A in the areas of ethnic and religious history as the first black Roman Catholic Church north of the Mason Dixon line. Completed in 1869 and designed by R.C. McLane & Sons, the building was originally the home of the Second Church of the Evangelical Association. The St. Benedict the Moor mission, founded in 1883 in Greenwich Village, moved to this church in 1898 and remained here until 1821 when the congregation moved north to Harlem.

Tenements at 781-795 Ninth Avenue (06101.017157)
This row of eight five-story tenements was constructed in the late nineteenth century by various architects. The row appears to meet Criterion C as a representative collection of tenement architecture employing a picturesque mix of Renaissance-inspired stone, brick, terra cotta, and metal ornamentation. The block may also meet Criterion A for its association with the residential development of Hell's Kitchen.

INELIGIBLE PROPERTIES
Based on the information currently available, the following properties do not appear to meet the criteria for listing to the State and National Registers:

Tenement buildings at 520-528 West 47th Street (06101.017154)

Former Second Church of the Evangelical Association of North America (current Julia Miles Theater), 424 West 55th Street (06101.015538)

Garage at 411-413 West 55th Street (06101.017158)

Tenement buildings at 824-826 Ninth Avenue and 357 West 54th Street
(06101.017159 and 06101.017160)

Former National Bible Institute School and Dormitory, 340 West 55th Street (06101.017161)

Please contact Kathy Howe at 518-237-8643 ext. 3266 with any questions. Be sure to use the project reference number (PR) in all future correspondence.

THE CITY OF NEW YORK LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 Centre Street, 9N, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-7700 www.nyc.gov/landmarks

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

MTA/DCP CO-LEADS/SEQRA-M 3/18/2009

Project number **Date received**

Project: WESTERN RAILYARD

Comments: The LPC is in receipt of the historic resource chapter of the PDEIS dated 3/16/09. Comments are as follows.

Development site radius, figure 8-1 and table 8-1: NY Terminal Warehouse Company is LPC designated; West Chelsea HD is S/NR eligible. 10th Ave. Site radius and 9th Ave. site radius, figure 8-12 and table 8-2: St. Benedict the Moor Church, LPC eligible; Former National Bible Institute School and Dormitory, LPC eligible.

The shadow chapter should also be submitted to LPC for review and comment.

cc: SHPO

3/30/2009

SIGNATURE DATE



24779_FSO_GS_03302009.doc

David A. Paterson
Governor

Carol Ash
Commissioner

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

Historic Preservation Field Services • Peebles Island, PO Box 189, Waterford, New York 12188-0189

518-237-8643

www.nysparks.com

April 29, 2009

Natham Riddle
AKRF
440 Park Avenue South
7th Floor
New York, NY 10016

Re: MTA
Western Rail Yard
New York County
08PR04116

Dear Mr. Riddle:

Thank you for requesting the comments of the New York Field Services Bureau of the Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPRHP). We have reviewed the submitted information in accordance with the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980 (section 14.09 of the New York Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law). These comments are those of the Field Services Bureau and relate only to Historic/Cultural resources. They do not include other environmental impacts to New York State Parkland that may be involved in or near your project. Such impacts must be considered as part of the environmental review of the project pursuant to the State Environmental Quality Review Act (New York Environmental Conservation Law Article 8) and its implementing regulations (6 NYCRR Part 617).

Based upon our review we offer the following comments:

1. Kathy Howe of our National Register Unit notes that the following properties are eligible or listed on the National Register of Historic Places:
    a. West Chelsea Historic District
    b. Eleventh District Municipal Court/Seventh District Magistrates' Court, 314 West 54th Street
    c. St. Benedict the Moor Church, 342 West 53rd Street
    d. Tenements at 781-795 Ninth Avenue
    e. High Line railroad viaduct (High Line)
2. Douglas Mackey of our Archeology Unit has no further archeological concerns with the project.
3. We concur that a Construction Protection Plan (CPP) is appropriate for all historic resources within 90 feet of construction. These plans should be specific to the building or structure it is intended to protect. Each plan should be developed in accordance with the requirements stipulated in the New York City Department of Buildings "Technical Policy Procedure Notice #10/88", the New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission guidelines described in "Protection Programs for Landmarked Buildings", and the National Park Services' "Preservation Tech Notes, Temporary Protection #3: Protecting a Historic Structure during Adjacent Construction."
4. Our largest area of concern is with regard to impacts to the High Line, which has the potential to be directly impacted by the proposed new construction. At this time, we are unable to offer many comments since the details

of the proposed development are not yet detailed enough. We agree that construction near and possibly even around the High Line are appropriate since historically buildings have been located in this manner. We are concerned about the possible connection of buildings to the High Line, the creation of a podium under the High Line, the possibility that WR-4 may bridge over the High Line, that some of the residential buildings may cantilever over the High Line, that portions of the Twelfth Avenue area may be physically altered, and the possible removal of the tracks with the addition of a new entrance and other park amenities.

Since the details of the proposed work are not yet available, it may be appropriate to consider an Agreement document that could set out the process by which Section 14.09 of the New York Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law would be competed.

Thank you for your request. If you have any questions, I can be reached at (518) 237-8643, ext. 3282. Please refer to the Project Review (PR) number in any future correspondences regarding this project.

Sincerely,

Beth A. Cumming
Historic Site Restoration Coordinator
Beth.cumming@oprhp.state.ny.us

Enc: Resource Evaluation

THE CITY OF NEW YORK LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 Centre Street, 9N, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-7700 www.nyc.gov/landmarks

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

MTA/DCP CO-LEADS/SEQRA-M 4/27/2009

Project number **Date received**

Project: WESTERN RAILYARDS

Comments: LPC is in receipt of the shadows chapter of the EIS dated 4/21/09. The only sun-sensitive property identified, St. Michael's Church, 424 W. 34 St., does not appear to have a LPC or S/NR identification or evaluation in the documents received by LPC thus far. Additionally, there is no additional information establishing significance in the text: date, architect, window designer, or original client. The five minute shadow increment is of insufficient duration to warrant an impact under CEQR. If the applicant wishes an evaluation of the property by LPC, the above information should be provided to LPC for review and comment, as well as photographs of the main façade.

Regarding LPC comments of 4/1/09, NY Terminal Warehouse is not an individually designated landmark, but is designated as part of the LPC designated and S/NR eligible West Chelsea HD.

CC: SHPO

5/7/2009

SIGNATURE DATE



24779_FSO_GS_05072009.doc

THE CITY OF NEW YORK LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
1 Centre Street, 9N, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-7700 www.nyc.gov/landmarks

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

MTA/DCP CO-LEADS/SEQRA-M 8/27/2009

Project number **Date received**

Project: WESTERN RAIL YARD

Comments: The LPC is in receipt of a request for evaluation of the proposed W. 29 St. Historic District. The district does not appear LPC or S/NR eligible.

Gina Santucci

9/18/2009

SIGNATURE DATE

24779_FSO_GS_09182009.doc

David A. Paterson
Governor

Carol Ash
Commissioner

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

Historic Preservation Field Services Bureau • Peebles Island, PO Box 189, Waterford, New York 12188-0189
518-237-8643
www.nysparks.com

September 17, 2009

Nathan Riddle
AKRF
440 Park Avenue South
7th Floor
New York, NY 10016

Re: MTA
Western Rail Yard
New York County
08PR04116

Dear Mr. Riddle:

Thank you for requesting the comments of the Field Services Bureau of the NYS Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPRHP). We have reviewed the submitted information in accordance with the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980 (section 14.09 of the New York Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law). These comments are those of the Field Services Bureau and relate only to Historic/Cultural resources. They do not include other environmental impacts to New York State Parkland that may be involved in or near your project. Such impacts must be considered as part of the environmental review of the project pursuant to the State Environmental Quality Review Act (New York Environmental Conservation Law Article 8) and its implementing regulations (6 NYCRR Part 617).

I appreciate the interest expressed by CB4 in the area's industrial heritage, however, after close examination of the photographs of existing conditions, the historical background information, and streetscape views available on the internet, it is the opinion of OPRHP that the buildings at 525, 534, 546, 538, 540 West 29th Street do not meet the National Register criteria for individual listing nor are they eligible as part of a West 29th Street historic district. Though historic, they do not posses the level of integrity required for NR eligibility.

Thank you for requesting our comments on these buildings. If you have any questions, I can be reached at (518) 237-8643, ext. 3266. Please refer to the Project Review (PR) number in any future correspondences regarding this project.

Sincerely,

Kathleen A Howe

Kathleen A. Howe
Historic Preservation Program Analyst

An Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action Agency

printed on recycled paper