AAMUP DEIS Hearing Public Transcript

AAMUP Calendar items begin at line #417.

WEBVTT

1

00:00:29.770 --> 00:00:39.090

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Good morning, everyone. I'm Dan Grodnik, chair of the City Planning Commission and director of the Department of City Planning welcome to today's public meeting of

2

00:00:39.300 --> 00:00:50.890

120 Broadway Hearing Room: February 5.th We are going to kick off today's agenda with several votes, starting with 1093, 1095, Jerome Avenue and High Bridge in the Bronx.

3

00:00:51.000 --> 00:01:12.829

120 Broadway Hearing Room: This proposal by the Department of Housing, Preservation and Development for a 100% income restricted affordable building with 60 homes would include set asides for low income seniors, and formerly homeless individuals and families. The building site is near Reverend T. Wendell, Foster Park, and the 4 train at 167th Street

4

00:01:12.920 --> 00:01:25.759

120 Broadway Hearing Room: staying in the Bronx. We'll next vote on a waterfront public access area that will be part of a new mixed use development at 1460 to 1480 Sheridan Boulevard, in Cortona Park, East.

5

00:01:26.010 --> 00:01:36.500

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The project would sit alongside the recently transformed Sheridan Boulevard and the Bronx River, and create additional public open space connected to the neighboring Starlight Park.

6

00:01:36.970 --> 00:01:50.589

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The Commission will also vote on a requested demapping by New York Community Hospital of Brooklyn in East Midwood. This change would allow the construction of an infectious disease isolation unit.

7

00:01:50.720 --> 00:02:01.620

120 Broadway Hearing Room: adding around 1,500 square feet of community facility space to the existing hospital building, heading over to East Harlem, in Manhattan. We'll vote on an application by the Department of Small business services

8

00:02:02.040 --> 00:02:23.300

120 Broadway Hearing Room: to establish the East Harlem, 125th Street Business Improvement district, the district boundaries would roughly extend between Second and 5th Avenues, primarily along the East 125th Street corridor. We'll vote as well on a parking authorization for 720 West End Avenue on the Upper West Side. The developer is looking to add 15 spaces to an apartment building with over 130 homes.

9

00:02:23.400 --> 00:02:51.430

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Our final votes for today regard office acquisitions by the New York Police Department, the 1st site at 9,777 Queens Boulevard in Forest Hills would provide new space for between 45, and 60 members of the Nypd's Internal Affairs Bureau, just down the road at 9,525 Queens Boulevard in Rego Park. The Nypd. Is seeking to lease space in this building for its queens. North traffic Enforcement Division.

10

00:02:51.560 --> 00:02:56.870

120 Broadway Hearing Room: if approved around 230 personnel would operate there in several shifts.

11

00:02:57.200 --> 00:03:22.519

120 Broadway Hearing Room: switching gears to today's public hearings, and welcome to those of you who are here for that the public is invited to testify on an office space lease at one Battery Park Plaza for New York City's Independent Budget Office, the proposed location less than a mile from their current office. At 1 10 William Street is large enough to accommodate the Ibo's 50 plus employees and its city charter mandated meetings

12

00:03:22.780 --> 00:03:37.329

120 Broadway Hearing Room: from one office space application to another. We will next hold a public hearing on a request by the New York City Human Resources administration to acquire space at 209 Bay Street in Tompkinsville, Staten Island.

13

00:03:37.470 --> 00:03:54.530

120 Broadway Hearing Room: This move will allow Hra homelessness, prevention services to continue co-locating with existing Hra services in the area, such as Snap, Medicaid, home Energy assistance, and much more into one hub for all of Staten Island.

14

00:03:54.940 --> 00:04:21.790

120 Broadway Hearing Room: We welcome the public to testify on a mixed use proposal at 102, 51 Queens Boulevard in Forest Hills. This project would create over 200 new homes, including more than 50 income restricted homes. The building would feature ground floor retail helping keep this commercial corridor along the Boulevard intact. The site is a couple blocks from the 67th Avenue, M. And R. Train station, as well as Yellowstone Park.

15

00:04:22.050 --> 00:04:43.500

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Next up is another mixed use building at 2510 Coney Island Avenue in Sheep's Head Bay, Brooklyn, within walking distance to the Neck Road, Q. Train station, and to Mellet playground. This project contains 60 homes, over 15 of which would be income restricted, affordable as well as ground floor retail.

16

00:04:43.570 --> 00:05:00.589

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Our final hearing for today is on the Atlantic Avenue mixed use plan, a transformational community-led proposal to bring new jobs, homes, and infrastructure to a roughly 21 block stretch of Atlantic Avenue and neighboring blocks in Crown Heights, bed-stuy and prospect heights

17

00:05:00.740 --> 00:05:04.279

120 Broadway Hearing Room: since the 19 sixties. This area of Central Brooklyn

18

00:05:04.520 --> 00:05:15.250

120 Broadway Hearing Room: has been zoned for one to 2. Story auto uses storage industrial buildings, despite its excellent access to public transit and Major Job Hubs.

19

00:05:15.390 --> 00:05:38.559

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It's overdue for a change, and that's exactly what this plan, also known as Aimup, will deliver. It will revamp the neighborhood into a more active dynamic mix of residential commercial manufacturing, including around 4,600 new homes, approximately 1,440 of them. Income restricted affordable homes as well as space for 2,800 new jobs

20

00:05:39.210 --> 00:06:06.049

120 Broadway Hearing Room: to help achieve this housing goal. The plan will maximize the number of income restricted affordable homes that can be built on public sites in the neighborhood. Some of these projects are already moving forward, others are being explored. With this plan we can

address. The chronic housing shortage across the area where demand to live has skyrocketed and zoning has stymied growth, putting pressure on the existing housing stock and the existing tenants in the neighborhood.

21

00:06:06.740 --> 00:06:33.259

120 Broadway Hearing Room: But a neighborhood plan is more than homes and jobs, and indeed, Aimup would include infrastructure and streetscape improvements to help the community grow and thrive into the future. To this end the New York City Department of Transportation will install street safety improvement projects, including planters, bike corrals, and daylighting at intersections along Atlantic Avenue and nearby blocks to improve pedestrian visibility, safety, and accessibility.

22

00:06:33.510 --> 00:06:47.710

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The city will also invest heavily in the public realm, enhancing Lowry triangle and delivering over 24 million dollars to improve St. Andrews playground, including a new synthetic turf, multi-use field with a running track.

23

00:06:47.710 --> 00:07:06.650

120 Broadway Hearing Room: basketball and handball court upgrades, renovated playground spaces and new seating shade trees, plantings, and more other infrastructure work in the wider neighborhood includes stormwater and sewer upgrades along Atlantic Avenue and Dean street, as well as subsurface stormwater detention systems and

24

00:07:06.650 --> 00:07:26.349

120 Broadway Hearing Room: more than 100 rain gardens. All these investments will bolster, sewer capacity and help these neighborhoods withstand flooding and storm events since public review began. Both community Boards 3 and 8, and borough president, Antonio Reynoso, have issued favorable, thoughtful recommendations for Aimup.

25

00:07:26.410 --> 00:07:37.539

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I'd like to thank them for their support as well as council members. Crystal Hudson and she ose for their leadership on this comprehensive initiative that would benefit Brooklynites for many years to come

26

00:07:37.630 --> 00:07:41.249

120 Broadway Hearing Room: with that. Let's get to it, madam. Secretary

27

00:07:41.410 --> 00:08:05.460

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Floor is yours. Good morning. This is the City Planning Commission public meeting held remotely through the Nyc. Engage portal and in person in the Cpc. Hearing Room 120 Broadway lower concourse. Today is Wednesday, February 5, th 2025. I will now call the roll chair garodnik. Here, vice chair knuckles. Here, Commissioner Benjamin, present Commissioner Cerullo, Commissioner Krall, Commissioner, gold here.

28

00:08:06.580 --> 00:08:30.050

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodrich, Commissioner Carmani, here, Commissioner Mann, here, Commissioner Marine, here Commissioner Osorio, here Commissioner Ramboshaw. Here a quorum is present. The 1st item is the approval of minutes of the public meeting of Wednesday, January 20, second, 2025 great on the minutes I make a motion to approve those minutes of January 20, seconded by the vice chairman. Thank you. All those in favor, please say, aye, aye.

29

00:08:30.170 --> 00:08:32.059

120 Broadway Hearing Room: oppose. Nate.

30

00:08:32.169 --> 00:08:52.299

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay. Minutes are approved. Scheduling calendar numbers one through 7, scheduling, Wednesday, February 19, th 2025 for a public hearing to be held in person in

the Cpc. Hearing Room 120 Broadway, and remotely through the Nyc. Engage portal. Great, I make a motion to approve the resolution seconded by Commissioner Benjamin. All those in favor, please say aye, aye.

31

00:08:52.300 --> 00:08:52.920

*Comm. Gold: Hi.

32

00:08:53.070 --> 00:08:54.350

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Opposed. Nay.

33

00:08:54.660 --> 00:09:11.490

120 Broadway Hearing Room: okay, thank you. The resolution is adopted. The next part of the calendar is the report. Section on page 6, borough of the Bronx calendar, number 910-93-1095, Jerome Avenue, Udap, CD. 4, c. 2, 5, 0 0 9, 1 ha. X.

34

00:09:11.490 --> 00:09:26.980

120 Broadway Hearing Room: In the matter of an application for Udap designation, project, approval and disposition of city-owned property concerning 1 0 9 3, 1 0 9 5, Jerome Avenue Udap. For a favorable report on calendar number 9. Chair Grodnick. Aye, vice chair knuckles. Yes, Commissioner Benjamin

35

00:09:27.270 --> 00:09:31.819

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I. Commissioner Cerullo, Commissioner Krall, Commissioner Gold.

36

00:09:31.820 --> 00:09:32.590

*Comm. Gold: Yes.

37

00:09:33.540 --> 00:09:47.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodrich. Yes, Commissioner Carmani. Yes, Commissioner Mann. Yes, Commissioner Marine. Yes, Commissioner Osorio. Yes, Commissioner Rambosher. Yes, a favorable report has been adopted on calendar number 9, calendar number 11, 4, 0,

38

00:09:47.670 --> 00:10:03.989

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 1, 4, 6, 0, 1, 4, 8, 0, Sheridan Boulevard, waterfront, CD. 9, n. 2, 3, 0 2 9 8 z. Ax. In the matter of an application for zoning authorization concerning 1, 4, 6, 0 1, 4, 8, 0. Sheridan Boulevard. Waterfront

39

00:10:03.990 --> 00:10:08.370

120 Broadway Hearing Room: for the adoption of a calendar of calendar. Number 10 chair Grodnik.

40

00:10:08.560 --> 00:10:16.250

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Aye, vice chair knuckles. Yes, Commissioner Benjamin. Aye, Commissioner Cirullo. Yes, Commissioner Crawl. Yes, Commissioner, Gold.

41

00:10:16.250 --> 00:10:16.940

*Comm. Gold: Yes.

42

00:10:17.590 --> 00:10:32.660

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodridge, I'm abstaining. I didn't have enough time to review this one. Commissioner Hermani. Yes, Commissioner Mann. Yes, Commissioner Marine. Yes, Commissioner Osorio, I vote? No. I have expressed concerns throughout the review of this project.

43

00:10:32.680 --> 00:10:57.169

120 Broadway Hearing Room: as noted in the original Racial equity report. This area requires deeper affordability to reflect the socioeconomic conditions of this community. Although I recognize the importance of advancing affordable housing, I cannot support a proposal at this stage, because it doesn't fully address the impact of a development of this scale, particularly if the people who fought to recover this waterfront could potentially be displaced by gentrification. Thanks.

44

00:10:58.200 --> 00:11:26.940

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Ramboshawn. Yes, calendar number 10 has been adopted. Borough of Brooklyn Calendar, number 11, new York Community Hospital of Brooklyn, CD. 14, c. 1, 8, 0 0 7 0 mmk. In the matter of an application for a City Map amendment concerning New York Community Hospital of Brooklyn for a favorable report on Calendar number 11, chair garotnik, aye, vice chair knuckles. Yes, Commissioner Benjamin. Aye, Commissioner Cirullo. Yes, Commissioner Crawl, Commissioner, Gold.

45

00:11:26.940 --> 00:11:27.660

*Comm. Gold: Yes.

46

00:11:28.470 --> 00:11:49.790

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodridge, Commissioner Carmani. Yes, Commissioner Mann. Yes, Commissioner Marine. Yes, Commissioner Osorio. Yes, and I want to thank the Department for considering the recommendations in the report greatly appreciated. Commissioner Rampishaw. Yes, a favorable report has been adopted on Calendar Number 11, Borough of Manhattan Calendar, Number 12, East Harlem, 125th Street, bid.

47

00:11:49.790 --> 00:12:10.380

120 Broadway Hearing Room: CD. 11, N. 2, 5, 0 1, 1 4 Bdm. In the matter of an application for a business improvement district concerning East Harlem, 125th Street bid for a favorable report on Calendar number 12. Chair Grodnick. Aye, vice chair knuckles critically needed. Yes, Commissioner Benjamin Aye, Commissioner Cerullo. Yes, Commissioner Krom.

48

00:12:10.430 --> 00:12:11.850

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodridge.

49

00:12:12.752 --> 00:12:14.560

120 Broadway Hearing Room: My apologies, Commissioner. Gold.

50

00:12:14.560 --> 00:12:15.250

*Comm. Gold: Yes.

51

00:12:16.130 --> 00:12:27.090

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Carmani. Yes, Commissioner Mann. Yes, Commissioner Marine. Yes, Commissioner Osorio. Yes, Commissioner Rampershaw. Yes, a favorable report has been adopted on Calendar number 12,

52

00:12:27.420 --> 00:12:55.309

120 Broadway Hearing Room: calendar number 13, 7, 2 0, West End Avenue parking authorization, CD, 7, n. 2, 4, 0 4, 0 8 zam. In the matter of an application for zoning authorization concerning 720 West End Avenue parking authorization for the adoption of calendar number 13. Chair Garrodnik. Aye, vice chair knuckles. Yes, Commissioner Benjamin aye, Commissioner Cerullo. Yes, Commissioner Kroll. Yes, Commissioner Gould.

53

00:12:55.460 --> 00:12:56.130

*Comm. Gold: Yes.

54

00:12:56.660 --> 00:13:07.819

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodridge. Yes, Commissioner Carmani. Yes, Commissioner Mann. Yes, Commissioner Marine. Yes, Commissioner Osorio. Yes, Commissioner, rampash Calendar number 13 has been adopted.

55

00:13:08.390 --> 00:13:32.410

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Borough of Queens Calendar, number 14, 9, 7, 7 Queens Boulevard, Nypd. Office space acquisition, CD. 6, n. 2, 5, 0 1 0 5 Pxq. In the matter of an application for a notice of intent to acquire office space concerning 9,777 Queens Boulevard Nypd. Office space acquisition for a favorable report on calendar number 13. Chair karodnik.

56

00:13:32.490 --> 00:13:40.350

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Aye, vice chair knuckles. Yes, Commissioner Benjamin. Aye, Commissioner Cerullo. Yes, Commissioner Crowell. Yes, Commissioner Gould.

57

00:13:40.350 --> 00:13:41.050

*Comm. Gold: Yes.

58

00:13:41.580 --> 00:13:53.899

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodrich. Yes, Commissioner Carmani. Yes, Commissioner Mann. Yes, Commissioner Marie. Yes, Commissioner Osorio. Yes, Commissioner Rampage. A favorable report has been adopted on calendar, number 14,

59

00:13:54.270 --> 00:13:59.579

120 Broadway Hearing Room: calendar number 15, 9, 5, 2, 5 Queens. Boulevard, Nypd. Office. Acquisition.

60

00:13:59.620 --> 00:14:24.899

120 Broadway Hearing Room: CD. 6, n. 2, 5, 0 0 9 2 Pxq. In the matter of an application for a notice of intent to acquire office space concerning 9,525 queens. Boulevard Nypd. Office. Acquisition for a favorable report on calendar number 15. Chair Grodnick. Aye, vice chair knuckles. Yes, Commissioner Benjamin. Aye, Commissioner Cerullo. Yes, Commissioner Crawl, Commissioner, Gold.

61

00:14:25.200 --> 00:14:25.860

*Comm. Gold: Yes.

62

00:14:26.400 --> 00:14:27.720

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Goodridge.

63

00:14:28.460 --> 00:14:52.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Carmani. Yes, Commissioner Mann. Yes, Commissioner. Money. Yes, Commissioner Osorio. Yes, Commissioner Rampish. Yes. A favorable report has been adopted on calendar number 15. The next part of the calendar is the public hearing section on page 9 great, and we ask members of the public who are here to share their views, to limit their remarks to 3 min. We welcome all of you. Thank you for joining us. Let's go to the 1st item of the day

64

00:14:54.180 --> 00:15:18.539

120 Broadway Hearing Room: borough of Manhattan Calendar, number 16, one Battery Park, Plaza, Ibo. Office space Acquisition, CD. One N. 2, 5, 0 1, 4 2 Pxm. Public. Hearing in the matter of an application for a notice of intent to acquire office space concerning one Battery Park Plaza Ibo office space acquisition wonderful, and on behalf of an applicant team. Here we have Marla Simpson. I see also Cornelius

65

00:15:18.610 --> 00:15:32.609

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Armandrout, Louisa Chaffey, Mark Stein, Kyle, Daniels, Logan Clark, from a variety of Dcas and Ibo, I believe, but we're going to turn it over to you. Welcome, good! To have you here with us.

66

00:15:37.650 --> 00:15:41.080

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It's alright, Louisiana.

67

00:15:41.080 --> 00:15:45.780

PH01 - *AT - Louisa Chafee: Yes. Hi, good morning, Chairman Garodnik. Good morning, Marla.

68

00:15:45.870 --> 00:16:03.820

PH01 - *AT - Louisa Chafee: Good morning, members of the Commission. While I'm not able to join you in person today I'd like to very much thank you for your time, as Ibo presents a matter of critical importance to our agency, and that's the agency that I have had the honor of leading since March of 2023

69

00:16:03.820 --> 00:16:18.880

PH01 - *AT - Louisa Chafee: Ibo is an independent, non-mayoral, nonpartisan source of budget policy and economic analysis. We serve all New Yorkers, including elected officials, community boards, civic groups, and members of the general public.

70

00:16:19.000 --> 00:16:39.889

PH01 - *AT - Louisa Chafee: Today we seek your approval of our request to lease office space for Ibo's offices. As you know, our current office 1 10, William Street, is in the process of transitioning to administration for children's services. I've asked my special assistant, Marla Simpson to present the application for your consideration, and thank you.

71

00:16:41.850 --> 00:17:08.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. Earlier this month I provided a similar briefing for the Community Board. One land use committee. Ibo is here today because it is essential for us to move, and as soon as we possibly can. We are a tiny agency for city government purposes, but we're twice the size that we were when we 1st moved into 110 William, which is now overcrowded and subpar in every possible way.

72

00:17:08.920 --> 00:17:30.379

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The good news for the city is that 110 William is being completely renovated. However, as you may recall, that's because the entire building is going to be Acs's headquarters. Our lease ends in 18 months, and our space folds into Acs's lease. Indeed, this body approved the 1, 95 action for Acs in 2022.

73

00:17:30.380 --> 00:17:41.700

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Recognizing these plans as well as our own needs. We began a site search well over 3 years ago. In June 2023, I presented to you a plan to relocate to 80 Pine Street.

74

00:17:41.700 --> 00:18:06.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The term sheet for that site had been agreed to 9 months before I presented, but unfortunately the lease was not finalized in the months that followed your approval, and in late 2023, 80 pine was sold, and Ibo had to start all over again, because this is a real crisis for

us. We undertook an aggressive and comprehensive search, using 3 approaches. First, st of course, we continued to look at sites identified by Dcas and its broker, although none fully

75

00:18:06.520 --> 00:18:31.110

120 Broadway Hearing Room: met our needs. Second, we looked at what seemed to be a promising space already under city lease, but it wasn't vacant, and there were no concrete plans for how or when it might become vacant. Thus Ibo leadership, working independently, undertook our own wide-ranging site, search resulting in a detailed evaluation of about a dozen sites. That process resulted in the selection of one Battery Park Plaza as the most cost, effective and best suited space for us.

76

00:18:31.280 --> 00:18:55.819

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Having done that, we circled back to Dcas for their team to be able to move this forward. As you'll see, the site is accessible and well fits our needs, including the need that we now have to be very much more public facing and to engage with community organizations and hold meetings, at least on a modest scale. You're out of time. So let us ask you how you see this fitting your needs here

77

00:18:55.820 --> 00:19:19.080

120 Broadway Hearing Room: again the major shift that you'll see in this floor plan is that it does accommodate our current. 51 staff plus. We have a large cadre of interns and fellows that we didn't used to have, and there is modest amount of meeting space, because we now do quite a number of community engagement activities, and it is useful for us to be able to bring stakeholders

78

00:19:19.080 --> 00:19:26.210

120 Broadway Hearing Room: from Academia, from the neighborhoods, from professional organizations, to have great direct dialogue with our staff.

79

00:19:27.200 --> 00:19:32.019

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Great. Thank you very much. Let me see if there are questions, Commissioner Kraut.

80

00:19:33.180 --> 00:19:57.880

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Good morning, Ms. Simpson. I'm just confirming that this is an Ibo identified property. It was not identified through Dcas and presented to you. It appeared on some early Dcas list, but we we had already engaged in conversations with ownership, and we did not look at this space through Dcas. We did all of our own discussions and then brought it to Dcas. Okay, thank you.

81

00:19:59.320 --> 00:20:07.619

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner Rampash. Thank you for the presentation. You had mentioned that the number of employees grew the last few years. Do you foresee it growing further

82

00:20:07.650 --> 00:20:18.019

120 Broadway Hearing Room: after you take possession of the space from 51 to I don't know we do. Our our budget is unique among city agencies.

83

00:20:18.050 --> 00:20:29.320

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It is pegged to the budget of the office of management and budget. So we receive 12 and a half percent of the appropriation of

84

00:20:29.320 --> 00:20:51.329

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the appropriation for the office of management and budget. And as that organization grows over time, we grow commensurate with that. Looking at a 20 year trajectory. And this is a 21 year lease. We do expect modest growth, perhaps not doubling again the way we did this time, but we expect some modest growth, and this projects room for that. Thank you.

85

00:20:51.915 --> 00:20:52.380

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Questions.

86

00:20:52.690 --> 00:20:56.343

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Hi, good morning. Vice chair knuckles. Good morning.

87

00:20:57.470 --> 00:21:04.499

120 Broadway Hearing Room: What is the metric, if you know it? Per square foot per employee nowadays you have

88

00:21:04.690 --> 00:21:28.879

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 51 employees I've read, and you're moving into about 18,000 square feet. That's correct. There is a metric that the city applies. I don't know it off the top of my head, but it is an internal metric to Omb, and as an independent agency it does not apply to us. It is also the case, and, more importantly, in terms of looking at this location that the addition

89

00:21:28.880 --> 00:21:36.299

120 Broadway Hearing Room: that really reflects the additional space above and beyond our need for staff

90

00:21:36.410 --> 00:22:02.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room: is to have communal meeting space, which is not something we can do at all today without sort of borrowing it from other agencies. So this provides a modest size conference room for us. I think it would accommodate depending on the way it was organized up to for up to 50 people, and then it also includes meeting spaces which we don't have at all now small meeting spaces.

91

00:22:04.640 --> 00:22:10.890

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Saw most of your employees at in offices or or

92

00:22:11.050 --> 00:22:17.889

120 Broadway Hearing Room: at desktops. There is a floor plan included in the materials. Do you want to switch to that slide

93

00:22:18.650 --> 00:22:28.879

120 Broadway Hearing Room: there. There are a number of offices that you'll see on the sort of perimeter of the of the location, although

94

00:22:29.010 --> 00:22:46.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room: parts of the perimeter are open, and there are cube, I mean, not every part of the perimeter has individual offices. It is. There are also cubicles that extend to that area. It is predominantly a cubicle arrangement. Many of the sort of office

95

00:22:46.920 --> 00:23:05.660

120 Broadway Hearing Room: offices are also shared as they are today, and there is room for a pantry. There are small meeting rooms and storage rooms and things that we don't have, but you'll see the the layout is basically there. The the conference facilities are in this sort of interior, and the cubicles and offices are on the exterior.

96

00:23:06.120 --> 00:23:14.710

120 Broadway Hearing Room: How many floors are you on? You're on more than one floor. Oh, no! Oh, no, it's a portion. It's a portion of the 4th floor.

97

00:23:17.210 --> 00:23:33.199

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It is also a subdividable space. And so again, if there were a need down the road based on a change in sort of paradigm. It isn't. It is a space that in that same building there are examples of suites that have been subdivided further.

98

00:23:36.630 --> 00:23:37.600

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you.

99

00:23:38.580 --> 00:23:40.140

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. Mr. Vice. Chairman.

100

00:23:41.870 --> 00:23:50.299

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, great. Thank you very much. We don't have further questions for you. We appreciate it. Okay. And I do not see members of the public wishing to be heard on this item.

101

00:23:50.650 --> 00:24:19.449

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Do you see any members, madam? Secretary, members of the public interested here. No chair. I do not. Okay. Then, with that we're going to close the hearing on Calendar 16 and open the hearing on the next item. Thank you. Chair borough of Staten Island, calendar number 17 2 0 9, Bay Street, Hra. Office space, CD. One, N. 2, 5, 0 0 8 2 Pxr. Public hearing in the matter of an application for a notice of intent to acquire office space concerning 2 0 9 Bay Street Hra. Office space.

102

00:24:19.590 --> 00:24:32.140

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay? And on behalf of the applicant team. Here we have on zoom we have Vrushti, Patel, Colleen, O'connor, Grant, Rizwana, Sheikh

103

00:24:32.310 --> 00:24:40.882

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Chris Grove, Dana, Guiette and Charles Gross

104

00:24:42.390 --> 00:24:46.710

120 Broadway Hearing Room: that's the team. Whenever you all are ready we look forward to hearing from you.

105

00:24:47.972 --> 00:24:50.790

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Good morning, Commissioners. I'm Roswana Shah. Good morning.

106

00:24:51.090 --> 00:24:57.050

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Assistant Deputy Commissioner for Facilities at New York City. Human Resources Administration.

107

00:24:57.220 --> 00:25:05.349

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Thank you so much for the opportunity to present our office space application for 209 Bay Street in Staten Island. Next slide, please.

108

00:25:08.660 --> 00:25:14.950

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Hr. Is seeking approval to continue using 209 Bay Street in Staten Islands Community District one.

109

00:25:15.190 --> 00:25:22.839

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: This one story, 2,000 square foot facility has been a key part of our service network since 2,006.

110

00:25:23.240 --> 00:25:33.649

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Our lease expired in 2024, and we are requesting an extension to maintain services while securing a long-term facility. Next slide, please.

111

00:25:34.760 --> 00:25:39.930

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: 209. Bay Street is centrally located within the Hra service hub

112

00:25:40.140 --> 00:25:42.059

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: that includes 201,

113

00:25:42.570 --> 00:25:46.259

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: 207 and 2 15 Bay streets. I'm sorry. Next slide, please.

114

00:25:47.320 --> 00:25:53.360

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: The the entrance faces Bay Street, ensuring easy access for clients and staff.

115

00:25:53.710 --> 00:26:05.799

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: The site is operated by Church Avenue Merchant Block Association, also known as Camba, and they are under Hra's home-based program, which provides homelessness prevention services.

116

00:26:05.910 --> 00:26:07.380

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Next slide, please.

117

00:26:08.937 --> 00:26:22.080

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Extending our lease keeps us close to other Hra offices, making operations more efficient and ensuring clients are easily have access to essential services.

118

00:26:22.520 --> 00:26:30.130

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Nearby offices offer cash assistance, supplemental nutrition, assistance also known as Snap

119

00:26:30.280 --> 00:26:39.299

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Medicaid, adult protective services and domestic violence support, creating a convenient one-stop resource. Hub.

120

00:26:39.400 --> 00:26:40.750

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Next slide, please.

121

00:26:41.800 --> 00:26:58.300

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: This facility includes a welcoming reception area, open office spaces and meeting rooms designed for client consultations and orientation sessions ensuring efficient and comfortable service delivery. Next slide, please.

122

00:26:59.540 --> 00:27:03.899

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: 209 Bay Street is highly accessible via public transit.

123

00:27:04.030 --> 00:27:08.450

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: It's near the Staten Island Railway's Tompkinsville Station.

124

00:27:08.680 --> 00:27:17.029

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: multiple Mta. Bus lines and the Staten Island Ferry terminal. This connects clients and staff to the broader city

125

00:27:17.600 --> 00:27:18.920

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: last slide, please.

126

00:27:19.170 --> 00:27:28.539

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: In conclusion extending the lease at 2 0. 9 Bay Street is essential for maintaining critical services for Staten Island residents.

127

00:27:28.830 --> 00:27:42.040

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: This facility plays a vital role in Hre's mission to support vulnerable communities with accessible and efficient service delivery. Thank you so much, and we're happy to take any questions you may have.

128

00:27:42.730 --> 00:27:53.989

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Wonderful because we do have one from Commissioner Cerullo. Commissioner. Hi, thank you for the presentation. One question I posed at the review session on Monday

129

00:27:54.620 --> 00:28:02.940

120 Broadway Hearing Room: involved. Whether or not the city was considering doing anything to create a little bit

130

00:28:03.120 --> 00:28:11.130

120 Broadway Hearing Room: better, a public realm and pedestrian experience outside this row of buildings.

131

00:28:11.270 --> 00:28:16.949

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It is quite barren, and, as you say, important in terms of

132

00:28:17.090 --> 00:28:33.920

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the services being provided and the population of people coming to be served here, and I don't know. You know I'm posing that to you to see if there's been any consideration of that when you, the photos that are reflected in this presentation, which we've also seen

133

00:28:34.080 --> 00:28:57.890

120 Broadway Hearing Room: here, that the staff presented to us on Monday are really representative of what it looks like out there. It's clean, but it is completely stark. And whether that's

planters or something else that just creates a better environment for the people who are coming in and out, and also the pedestrians that are

134

00:28:58.750 --> 00:29:04.569

120 Broadway Hearing Room: experiencing walking past this sort of row of of buildings.

135

00:29:06.380 --> 00:29:19.210

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Thank you so much for your question, Commissioner, for this inquiry. I'm going to pass the mic to our colleagues at Dcast, to Miss Colleen O'connor Grant at Dcast Planning Colleen.

136

00:29:19.720 --> 00:29:20.850

xPH02 - *AT - Colleen O'Connor-Grant: Good morning.

137

00:29:21.301 --> 00:29:35.899

xPH02 - *AT - Colleen O'Connor-Grant: Thank you, commissioners. I'm Colleen O'connor, Grant City planner, and I'm a part of the applicant team from Dcas. We're aware that the New York City Department of Transportation has purview over beautification projects, and just a few blocks away from this proposed site

138

00:29:35.970 --> 00:29:57.129

xPH02 - *AT - Colleen O'Connor-Grant: the dot has one such project at Victory Boulevard and Corson Avenue. It's through a dot program. Yes, called Community Commissions. Lovely program around the city. We've reached out to.to obtain an update regarding any other community commissions or other beautification projects that may be happening in this vicinity, and we're waiting to hear back from them.

139

00:29:58.090 --> 00:30:10.470

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I appreciate that. And and obviously we don't know the answer to that now, but would hope that the Commission and the Department would be informed of the results of those follow-up conversations.

140

00:30:10.790 --> 00:30:16.600

xPH02 - *AT - Colleen O'Connor-Grant: Absolutely. We hope to liaise between this agency and dot about beautifications in that corridor.

141

00:30:17.290 --> 00:30:37.859

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. 1 1 additional quick question. I I realize that we there are 4 different buildings that are part of the network. The Hra service network here. I don't know what the total I know they're pretty much, I would guess, around the same square footage to some degree, although one may actually have may go

142

00:30:38.310 --> 00:30:45.859

120 Broadway Hearing Room: below grade, although it's not really below grade, but deeper into the ground because of how the grade of Bay Street is at this point

143

00:30:46.500 --> 00:30:51.280

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I'm just wondering is all of the available square footage

144

00:30:51.480 --> 00:31:00.749

120 Broadway Hearing Room: in these 4 buildings used. I I'm just trying to figure out whether or not there was any thought, if possible.

145

00:31:01.500 --> 00:31:19.369

120 Broadway Hearing Room: of consolidating services into built into the buildings as opposed to having 4 buildings. I know they're all adjacent to each other, so this is not necessarily. This isn't burdensome for someone coming for multiple services, but I just wondered if there was a thought to that.

146

00:31:20.875 --> 00:31:22.250

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: I can take that question.

147

00:31:23.123 --> 00:31:24.470

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Thank you.

148

00:31:25.130 --> 00:31:42.179

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: The buildings are compartmentalized, and Hra absolutely appreciates having one contiguous, contiguous space to provide these sort of services. We've done this in our previous proposals in the last few years.

149

00:31:42.330 --> 00:32:07.219

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Unfortunately, the challenge there is, how do we renovate while we're occupied always poses a challenge. So our ultimate goal is maybe potentially finding another location that we are able to do that and transition our services in that manner in a more seamless fashion, so that we can continue to operate. We continue to have dialogue with this landlord. We don't have

150

00:32:07.230 --> 00:32:20.640

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: the entire space occupied. There are other entities within this complex. But we'll continue to work with Dcas and landlords in the neighborhood to make sure that Hra is providing services in the best manner.

151

00:32:21.660 --> 00:32:25.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you so much. Appreciate it. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank you, Commissioner.

152

00:32:27.850 --> 00:32:45.419

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you very much. Ms Sheikh. We don't have other questions for you, so thank you for being with us, and I do not see members of the public interested in speaking up on this one, so we will close the hearing on Calendar Number 17, and move on to 18.

153

00:32:45.880 --> 00:32:46.319

xPH02 - *AT - Rizwana Shaikh: Thank you, very.

154

00:32:46.320 --> 00:32:47.586

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Borough, Queen.

155

00:32:48.790 --> 00:33:11.929

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Borough of Queens, Calendar, numbers 18 and 19, 1 0, 2, 5, 1 queens, Boulevard, rezoning, CD. 6, calendar number 18, c. 2, 4, 0 2, 5, 0 Zmq. Calendar number 19, n. 2, 4, 0, 2, 5, 1 zrq. Public hearing in a matter of applications for a zoning map and zoning text amendments concerning 1 0 2, 5, 1 Queens Boulevard rezoning.

156

00:33:12.090 --> 00:33:21.870

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Welcome, Eric Palatnik, good morning. Good morning to the commission. It's my 1st time seeing you in the New Year, and congratulations on the passing of city of yes.

157

00:33:22.930 --> 00:33:44.059

120 Broadway Hearing Room: we are here today, or I'm here today to present to you 102 to 51 Queens Boulevard, which is a well supported rezoning that was supported at the Community Board Community Planning Board 6, and was also supported by the Queensborough President's office, and we are scheduling meetings with Council Member Lynn Schulman, and she has indicated that she is supportive of the application as well, and we're going to

158

00:33:44.170 --> 00:34:08.879

120 Broadway Hearing Room: work out some details with her as far as to what else she'd like to see in the interim. We're here with you today, and we're presenting the application for a rezoning from r. 7 1 to an R. 8 x zoning district with A. C. 24 overlay. Just at the outset I'd like to note so you could. This suspense is taken away. The city of Yes did benefit the building slightly. It increased the uap by allowing.

159

00:34:08.880 --> 00:34:24.379

120 Broadway Hearing Room: allowing the far for the existing to go up by 1.0 far under the r. 7 1 that would bring it to around a 5.0 far, and we're proposing to have an R. 8 x. Which would bring us up to a 7.2 far.

160

00:34:24.380 --> 00:34:48.779

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So the rezoning is still helpful with the city of yes, it is going to provide twice as many units in the building as it would under the as of right zoning, and twice as many affordable units, and the other thing I'll note before I go into any more detail is, the parking was amended by the city of Yes as well, and there would be 0 parking required, but due to marketability and the nature of the community in which we live in and the residents

161

00:34:48.780 --> 00:35:13.340

120 Broadway Hearing Room: there will be parking, provided we don't think that you could provide housing in this area of queens and not give people the chance to have cars. They do tend to go out and travel and utilize their car despite their location. As Chair said a few moments ago near mass transit. So that's the essence of city of yes, and the change it made. You can see the renderings on here. I'll stay here for one more minute, because this tells the hotel the architecture here did a beautiful job.

162

00:35:13.340 --> 00:35:37.389

120 Broadway Hearing Room: He designed the building in this portion. I'll show you in the presentation Queens Boulevard ramps around and curves upward. The building design that you see here takes root. It takes note of that. And you see a series of setbacks in the facade, and that's actually responding to the curvature in the roadway. And also the road goes up as you go along. And that's why you see the difference in elevation in the facade treatment.

163

00:35:37.450 --> 00:36:02.179

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So that's basically I just told you everything you really need to know about the application. I'll cruise through the rest of it, and then, if you have questions, I'll be happy to answer it for you, as you can see here, it's proposed to be a 17 story, 1 75 foot tall building. It'll have ground floor commercial of approximately 18,000 square feet. It'll have 166,000 square feet of residential space upstairs. The far will be a 7.1 9 it'll have

164

00:36:02.180 --> 00:36:19.069

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 216 units that's compared to about 120 or so under the eyes of right 54 of them will be permanently affordable, and it will include 87 parking spaces where none are required, and the parking will be at the cellar level, and it will be at the second floor level.

165

00:36:19.070 --> 00:36:36.159

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I'll go through right now. The site is shown on the left. It's the biggest. I'll go 2 more minutes on the left. It's a 1-story building. Let's pause for a second. I'll stop here. I told you the whole story. I think in my introduction I think there will be questions for you. So let's go to Commissioner Rampershad and Commissioner Goodrich.

166

00:36:36.160 --> 00:36:44.069

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you for the presentation. Again the Committee Board had 3 recommendations. Do you mind speaking towards that with regards to

167

00:36:44.070 --> 00:37:08.819

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the number of parking provided for affordable units, also the rear facade. Can you explain what was shown to them, and what changes are going to be made or possibly made. Yeah, sure I'd be happy to. We're not making any changes to the rear facade. There was concerns expressed by the people next to us. I'll start there behind the building, but we're separated quite far from those people. There's a rear yard between us. In addition to that, the same facade treatment you see on the front

168

00:37:08.820 --> 00:37:10.830

120 Broadway Hearing Room: will be on the rear. So it's

169

00:37:11.260 --> 00:37:35.989

120 Broadway Hearing Room: we feel that's accommodated their request to the best we can. The real issue that came up at Community Board 6 was the parking. And we're providing parking. And can we provide some sort of supportive housing in lieu of parking, grasping on to the idea, or playing off of the idea that if you're not providing parking, there's a cost savings that cost savings, and should be reintroduced in the form of some sort of supportive housing. Of course, supportive housing is its own genre of housing, and requires

170

00:37:35.990 --> 00:37:51.300

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Hpd and other funding sources. So we're not doing any of that. And plus, we are providing the parking. We're not eliminating it voluntarily. But so we don't really have the space we feel if we eliminated the parking you'd have a less marketable building, so to speak. So

171

00:37:51.320 --> 00:37:52.630

120 Broadway Hearing Room: you're welcome.

172

00:37:53.850 --> 00:37:55.719

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you, Commissioner Commissioner Goodrich.

173

00:37:56.970 --> 00:37:58.760

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I was actually going to ask the same.

174

00:38:00.290 --> 00:38:11.340

120 Broadway Hearing Room: taking a while to warm up? I was actually going to ask the same question, but focusing on the affordable housing part. Have you been in communication with Hpd. About?

175

00:38:11.700 --> 00:38:16.660

120 Broadway Hearing Room: No, we have not started any conversations yet with Hpd. We will, after the approval.

176

00:38:16.820 --> 00:38:25.429

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So do you foresee that it's possible that so the the community's asking, instead of parking, to replace that with more

177

00:38:25.430 --> 00:38:38.050

120 Broadway Hearing Room: affordable units, 15% supportive housing. Do you think that that's a possibility? Because what I'm hearing is no, I don't think it's not a realistic possibility for development like this. It's not being built with any sort of government funding

178

00:38:38.050 --> 00:38:55.569

120 Broadway Hearing Room: State City or Federal. It's a 45 X program building, and the Hpd involvement will be for the Mih units, of course, and that'll be instituted under a regulatory program but regulatory agreement. But no, there's no proposal to have this building. Have any sort of Hpd involvement with any sort of support of housing.

179

00:38:58.030 --> 00:39:00.440

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you, Commissioner Commissioner Osorio.

180

00:39:00.790 --> 00:39:26.159

120 Broadway Hearing Room: thank you. Chair. Thank you very much for the presentation, and and thank you for addressing my colleagues questions. I wanted to go back to Commissioner Rampershad's questions. You know this is a topic that is important has come up in different projects. You know. There's been instances where you know the community has requested that which is important, given the fact that even within the transit zone access to parking is necessary in certain places. Now

181

00:39:26.160 --> 00:39:39.910

120 Broadway Hearing Room: this is a case where the community is asking you, for you know the switch. And so I also understand that there's financial constraints, and I'm wondering if you can help us understand. You know the rationale behind your decision

182

00:39:40.040 --> 00:39:56.769

120 Broadway Hearing Room: to to decide that even when the community is asking for less parking, more affordable housing, you're you've you've concluded that it will make the building more marketable to have more parking. And so it's yeah. It's a confluence of a couple of different things. The parking issue first.st

183

00:39:56.920 --> 00:40:13.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Obviously, you've been out there more than we have speaking to people. The city of Yes is law, but there's quite a few people in the city of New York, especially in the outer boroughs that strenuously disagree with that. And although some of the conditions are here, there was also positions expressed in support

184

00:40:13.670 --> 00:40:36.809

120 Broadway Hearing Room: of having the parking here, and people were happy to have the parking. The developer has been working closely with the development that's gone up under previous city, planning approval. At 9,881 Queens Boulevard, the Tower Diner site that your commission acted on about 2 years ago, and every single parking space has been grabbed up in that building that was just recently built on Queens Boulevard, and there's a waiting list for parking now in that building.

185

00:40:36.860 --> 00:40:48.480

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So the residents in this portion of queens in the Forest Hills, Kew Gardens area. They do like their transportation. They like their cars as far as the supportive housing goes

186

00:40:48.480 --> 00:41:15.809

120 Broadway Hearing Room: like I said before, that's a genre of housing unto itself. It requires a building that has an efficiency to it, and makes an application to Hpd. And the financing gets tied up in that Hpd's timeline. Last time I checked was 4 to 5 years. As I mentioned, people were developing this 9,881 was approved by your commission a year and a half ago 2 years ago. It's up in the air right now. We're eager to build the housing. We're eager to do it right now.

187

00:41:15.810 --> 00:41:44.570

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Turning, changing the program within the building would not help that process at all. Thank you. I appreciate your response, if possible, and really to address fully address the request that is being made by the Community Board. It would be great if you can respond explicitly with your rationale, and I would encourage you to share, like your performance and explain, you know, from a cost, benefit analysis, what is leading you to that for us. It's important to understand. Why are we

188

00:41:44.690 --> 00:42:03.290

120 Broadway Hearing Room: not able to provide more affordable housing? If all of a sudden, you know, we can reduce the cost of something. I don't know if we could provide a pro forma for you, but we have met with members of your of city department of city planning recently going through the impacts of construction costs.

189

00:42:03.290 --> 00:42:20.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The labor costs that come with the 4 85 X program. The labor demands that are being placed upon development from the local council people and other people that require certain labor unions participate in the development. All those factors combined

190

00:42:20.560 --> 00:42:42.660

120 Broadway Hearing Room: don't lend to an easy spreadsheet, and that's where I'm coming to you from. We don't have a pro forma put together yet. No fair enough, fair enough anything that you can share with us the community, to help understand the complexity of the situation would be, I will, and we'd be happy to continue on with discussions. We had a very enlightening conversation

with with members of the planning department a couple weeks ago, and we'd like to continue this. Thank you.

191

00:42:43.070 --> 00:42:54.470

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner Ramparchad. Sorry. 2 more quick questions. I understand the parking situation over there very well know the area very well. 2 questions I have was looking at the the

192

00:42:54.640 --> 00:42:58.540

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the screen that we have right in front of us. You have 85 studio

193

00:42:58.620 --> 00:43:22.679

120 Broadway Hearing Room: departments proposed. Was there any thought of changing that? To make it more. One bedroom. The rationale behind the studios is again based off the other development that's gone up down the block. It's just simply that there's a demand from young families that are just married couples that are just getting started. And there's a demand from seniors, and both of them are in a price point that the studios fulfill.

194

00:43:22.680 --> 00:43:39.070

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So we are finding people are finding that there's demand for the studios. We can. We have not locked anything in stone, and the unit configuration can surely change. And the last question is, What's the timeframe of this project, timeline? We're ready to start pretty much as soon as if we should secure approvals.

195

00:43:39.550 --> 00:43:45.270

120 Broadway Hearing Room: All the attendees have been advised, everybody's aware. Thank you. Thank you, Commissioner.

196

00:43:48.430 --> 00:44:00.519

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, Mr. Platnik, thank you very much. Thank you for your time, and I do not see members of the public wishing to be heard on this item, calendar 18 and 19. So we will therefore close the hearing on those items and move on to the next

197

00:44:01.750 --> 00:44:17.779

120 Broadway Hearing Room: borough of Brooklyn Calendar, numbers 20 and 21, 2, 5, 1 0, Conley Island Avenue, rezoning, CD. 15, calendar number 20, c. 2, 3, 0, 1, 2, 8, Zmk calendar, number 21, n. 2, 3, 0, 1, 2, 9, zrk.

198

00:44:17.780 --> 00:44:36.170

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Public. Hearing in the matter of applications for zoning map and zoning text amendments concerning 2510, Lee Island Avenue, rezoning great. Thank you very much. And I see Richard Labelle here with us at the podium, but I will also note that the applicant team includes Fayanne, Baton, Kevin Williams.

199

00:44:36.220 --> 00:44:45.980

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Yuri, Menzak, Daniel Grinchtain, and Amara Hernandez.

200

00:44:47.000 --> 00:44:56.580

120 Broadway Hearing Room: welcome thank you chair Commissioners Richard Lobel of Shell Nobel, PC. For the applicant. We're here for the 2510, Coney Island Avenue rezoning.

201

00:44:56.940 --> 00:45:14.519

120 Broadway Hearing Room: This is a rezoning by 2510 CIA. Llc. Which proposes a zoning map amendment to Rezone Block 71, 59, 4, whole lots and portions of 2 other lots within Sheets. Head Bay from existing R. 4 and c. 8, 1 districts to an R. 70 c. 24. District.

202

00:45:14.520 --> 00:45:37.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The applicant would also, of course, seek a text amendment in order to require mandatory inclusionary housing, mapping both options one and 2. The action here would facilitate the development of the site with a new 8 story, roughly, 61,000 square foot, mixed, residential and commercial building with roughly 35 dwelling units. This would include 10 income, restricted units, and would provide roughly 35 parking spaces.

203

00:45:37.060 --> 00:46:01.859

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I'll go through the land, use rationale as well as the proposal, and then I'm happy to answer any questions. Next slide shows the revised proposal. We went to the Community Board initially with an 11 story building prior to the implementation of City of yes, since city of yes, we're able to reconfigure the height of the building such that the bulk of the building can be fit within 8 stories, which was a concern of the community and stakeholders.

204

00:46:01.860 --> 00:46:29.609

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The far remains largely the same. From 5.5 9 to 5.5 6 dwelling units here were reduced to 35 units. Parking spaces were increased by 11 to 35. I know this question had come up from the commission. This was done at the request of many stakeholders who were anxious to have a 1-to-one ratio of units to residences, units to parking spaces in the building. This is the zoning map

205

00:46:29.640 --> 00:46:54.330

120 Broadway Hearing Room: which demonstrates, I think, why, on a large sense, this is an appropriate rezoning. You've got existing. c. 8, 1 and R. 4 districts along Coney Island Avenue, an extra wide thoroughfare and major commercial thoroughfare in the area. It is an inappropriate district, given that the C. 81 largely results in low density or vacant use open uses, such as the used car lot which appears on the site.

206

00:46:54.420 --> 00:47:19.110

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So when discussing lots which are underutilized or unutilized, proximate to transportation and parks, this is, you know, a very, you know, really an excellent example of potential for rezoning, which can do a lot of good. This is the proposed zoning change map again, the R. 7 DC. 24. We note the site in red. One of the benefits, of course, of the R. 7 d.

207

00:47:19.110 --> 00:47:43.900

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Is requiring ground floor, non-residential uses as would be here. And so, you know, this is the area map which really demonstrates again, why, this is entirely appropriate. We sit on Coney Island Avenue, 100 foot wide, extra wide street per zoning. We also are bordered by Avenue V, an 80 foot wide street, also a wide street per zoning with 2 subway lines within walking distance, bus transportation along Coney Island Avenue

208

00:47:43.900 --> 00:47:53.570

120 Broadway Hearing Room: and open space within the area. This is an excellent example of a well utilized site in terms of rezoning, and with that we'd be happy to answer any questions.

209

00:47:53.670 --> 00:48:02.309

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Great. Thank you very much. So you started at 60 units. You're now down to 35. You started at 35. I'm sorry you start at 20

210

00:48:02.450 --> 00:48:31.039

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 4 parking spaces. Now up to 35, correct. Go back to the mechanism. I don't know if that was on the slide. The mechanism that you are now using same zoning designation. Correct? Same. R. 7 DC, 24. Okay, so this is a just a commitment that the developer is making as opposed to a proposed that we, a proposal that we change the dynamic here at the Commission. Is that correct? That's correct. So this still it would be an R.

211

00:48:31.040 --> 00:48:36.529

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 7 DC. 24 with

212

00:48:36.690 --> 00:48:50.430

120 Broadway Hearing Room: and I is the maximum far for that 5.6 5.6. Okay, so that would remain. The maximum number of dwelling units would remain. Is that was that 60? Correct. Okay? So you're

213

00:48:50.650 --> 00:49:11.159

120 Broadway Hearing Room: deciding on your own to build something smaller. Is that correct chair? Not necessarily that much smaller in the square footage difference is a couple 100 square feet. What we're doing here is basically offering a development which has extremely generous, generous unit sizes. So the majority, indeed, 75% of the unit sizes are a full

214

00:49:11.160 --> 00:49:38.760

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 3 bedroom, and we find this important for a couple of reasons. The 1st is that, as the Commission is aware, pursuant to mandatory inclusionary housing. The affordable units will be in the same ratio as the market rate units, or the units generally, so of the affordable units. Here a full 3 quarters of those will be 3 bedroom. This offers something to people needing affordable units which is really valuable. The idea that they can move into these generous unit sizes with

215

00:49:38.760 --> 00:50:00.439

120 Broadway Hearing Room: base of, I believe, roughly, 1,600 square feet on average. The second thing that's important to note within this community district is between 2010 and 2020. Pursuant to the prevalent Furman study, Furman Center study of 1,600 units of housing created in this community district in Sheep's Head Bay there were between

216

00:50:00.440 --> 00:50:21.950

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Amis of 51 to 80% 0 units of affordable housing created. And so it is really a dramatic opportunity even to create a small number of units. So the fact is that, despite the number, the overall number being small, these are healthy unit sizes for families which will be able to utilize this building and to live, you know, in the in the entirety of this new development.

217

00:50:22.210 --> 00:50:24.880

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you, Commissioner Kramani.

218

00:50:25.670 --> 00:50:44.599

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Hi, thank you. Thank you for the presentation. Just can you say a little bit more about community Board fifteen's like overwhelming disapproval of the project? And did any of the changes that you've talked about address or respond to their disapproval? Yeah,

219

00:50:46.060 --> 00:51:09.850

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So by way of Background Community Board 14 was one of the 4 community boards which had available to it the special permit under 73, 6, 2, 2, which has since been eliminated under city of Yes, which allowed for the increase in in single family homes for existing buildings. So what I mean to say by that is, they're very familiar with land use actions. And and I've been going there for over 20 years.

220

00:51:10.310 --> 00:51:21.420

120 Broadway Hearing Room: We made changes to the building design in a in a good faith effort to try to bring community members on board. There was, I would say, some, some inter

221

00:51:21.420 --> 00:51:47.110

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Community Board conflicts which arose which kind of gave rise to the vote that the Community Board gave. They have approved similar rezonings at similar densities within the last 3 months on similarly situated streets, but for some reason felt that this building which again creates at the end of the day 35 units would somehow disrupt local traffic on Coney Island Avenue. I would use the Community Board's words from its own recommendation.

222

00:51:47.190 --> 00:52:10.459

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The board representing area residents are opposed to the rezoning of a commercially zoned area to residential use. 1st of all, most of it is already r. 4, 1, so it would be R. 7 d. It would be residential use. So they're opposing rezoning commercially, zone area to residential use. But then they note that Coney Island Avenue is a congested thoroughfare with heavy truck traffic, and a building of this magnitude would only exasperate these conditions

223

00:52:10.460 --> 00:52:17.680

120 Broadway Hearing Room: as of right at this site you'd be able to put a 16,000 square foot medical office building. What we're offering here is a building with

224

00:52:17.680 --> 00:52:28.989

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 35 dwelling units the idea that this is somehow going to have any sort of impact on Coney Island Avenue, and the traffic is somewhat ridiculous, and, in my opinion disingenuous.

225

00:52:28.990 --> 00:52:53.639

120 Broadway Hearing Room: And you know, really, we were. You know, they were discussing a school across the street which literally has thousands of kids. You know the fact. Something doesn't smell right. The fact that they're saying that this building, which would have ground floor commercial use and residential above, is somehow going to become a creative or some sort of nuisance, and is going to draw people across the street to a

226

00:52:53.640 --> 00:53:06.280

120 Broadway Hearing Room: a mixed use building. It just doesn't really hold a lot of water. So I think that there were some things that were being discussed, and certain community members who were just opposed. And I really didn't understand the vote in that regard.

227

00:53:09.410 --> 00:53:11.960

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. Commissioner. Commissioner Goodridge.

228

00:53:16.945 --> 00:53:25.589

120 Broadway Hearing Room: okay, there's a a there's a petition online. And I just want to read for you what they're saying.

229

00:53:25.650 --> 00:53:54.609

120 Broadway Hearing Room: This is a quote. This development has serious potential to undermine the quality of life of our community adversely affecting the character and aesthetic appeal of our environment. Such large scale developments typically increase traffic congestion noise levels and can put a strain on existing community resources. Studies show that out of scale developments can detrimentally impact the safety, health and overall quality of life of residents according to the American Planning Association.

230

00:53:54.930 --> 00:54:20.370

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Yeah, happy to respond. So this commission in 2,007 within 2 blocks of this site approved a non-contextual R. 6. District, the Sahara rezoning in 2,007, which would permit, you know, taller building heights than is proposed here. The Commission here has repeatedly approved R. 7 d. 24 districts on streets that are far

231

00:54:20.370 --> 00:54:44.380

120 Broadway Hearing Room: more narrow than this street, so at least 3 rezonings, the 723 to 733. Myrtle Avenue, 702 and 7 15 Myrtle Avenue rezonings within Brooklyn Community Board, 3 on a 70 foot wide street. This is 100 foot Wide Street, also bordered by an 80 foot wide street. What we basically are seeing in some of this opposition is what amounts to be somewhat of a property dispute.

232

00:54:44.380 --> 00:55:09.049

120 Broadway Hearing Room: There's information in the record that the school across the street attempted to purchase the property was unsuccessful in doing so, and is now basically mounting opposition in light of that. And so when you look at the actual land, use here, and the opportunity to create affordable units in a district where again, as I cited, but in those 10 years since 2010 created 0 affordable

233

00:55:09.050 --> 00:55:32.679

120 Broadway Hearing Room: units between Amis of 51 and 80. It really just, you know, the facts of the matter don't make sense. You're rallying against changing a commercial district to a residential district, but a commercial district would allow for far more traffic. The use itself right now is C of owed as a used car lot, so I really think that I don't really connect to the opposition

234

00:55:32.680 --> 00:55:47.370

120 Broadway Hearing Room: that was entered into the Community Board. And again, this is a community board that I've been appearing before for 20 years. We've had many successful applications together. So, but I would ask the Commission to just look at the plain facts of the matter, and see that the opposition here makes no sense.

235

00:55:47.410 --> 00:55:52.450

120 Broadway Hearing Room: That's what I was. I was wondering because there have been some successful projects. So I

236

00:55:52.630 --> 00:56:01.259

120 Broadway Hearing Room: you know I'm from Brooklyn, but I don't really go to this area as much. So I was wondering, what is. What is it specifically about this project that is generated

237

00:56:01.380 --> 00:56:16.849

120 Broadway Hearing Room: only 3 people in favor and 33 opposed of the Community Board vote. Yes, right on the Community Board, and that's an overwhelming amount. So you're saying that there is a background of where the school wanted to purchase property. It's a property dispute.

238

00:56:19.680 --> 00:56:20.814

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay?

239

00:56:23.070 --> 00:56:52.679

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Oh, and just as a matter of good faith. The applicant here went to the school and basically made an offer for the opportunity for the school to utilize the ground floor, which needs to be non-residential, anyway, for community facility space. And there were negotiations. There's documentation of those negotiations where they'd be able to come in, utilize that ground floor. And then the day of the hearing, those discussions were abruptly cut off, and a petition was entered into against the rezoning.

240

00:56:56.080 --> 00:56:58.170

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you, Commissioner Commissioner Sorio.

241

00:56:58.330 --> 00:57:19.569

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. Chair. Thank you so much for the presentation, and thank you for addressing my colleagues questions. I wanted to give you an opportunity to to respond to the recommendation made by the Board President in terms of the amount of parking by first.st But 1st I wanted to just highlight my concern that even though the property right now is not within

242

00:57:19.570 --> 00:57:39.920

120 Broadway Hearing Room: an inundation area. The projections by the New York City Panel on climate change suggest that this is going to be extremely vulnerable to flooding to coastal flooding. And so, you know, that is the context in which I want us to discuss excavating for parking. And so on Monday we had the opportunity to validate some of the numbers that the borough President highlighted.

243

00:57:39.950 --> 00:57:49.290

120 Broadway Hearing Room: estimating that you know this, the cost of underground parking here is up to $60,000, and that the total additional costs

244

00:57:49.390 --> 00:58:02.750

120 Broadway Hearing Room: can be as much as 750,000. So those numbers the Department clarified come from their research on the city of oh, yes, for housing opportunity. And so first, st I just wanted to understand. You know, what is your response to those numbers

245

00:58:02.980 --> 00:58:04.800

120 Broadway Hearing Room: at a moment like this.

246

00:58:05.320 --> 00:58:34.499

120 Broadway Hearing Room: we should be using these resources toward more affordable housing in a place. Also that, as you just pointed out, you know, makes no sense to be escalating. In the 1st place, so help us understand a little bit. You know the the applicant's response to the recommendation by the borough President. I think that you already hinted that the community here, you know, has been explicit about you know their position on this. I just want to understand from from your point of view, how does this make sense?

247

00:58:35.240 --> 00:58:54.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Sure? So just by background, I know that we're located within the 0 point 2 annual chance floodplain instead of 1%. So we wouldn't be subject to certain building code compliance. Now, now, correct. But the projections show a very different understood. Yeah, I'll be clear.

248

00:58:54.060 --> 00:59:17.800

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I agree with you, and I agree with the Brooklyn Borough President, and oftentimes when you're trying to create a project which is going to gain support in the community. There are representations that are made, and indeed we're still open, and are still even attempting to have those community discussions.

249

00:59:17.800 --> 00:59:45.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room: as Euler, you know, continues through the Council. I imagine those discussions will be ongoing. So right now, as the consideration goes, we'd be providing the parking and and be providing those spaces on a 1-to-one basis. Is it sound financially to do so? Given the excavation cost? Probably not. Would the applicant have preferred to proceed without such parking? Yes.

250

00:59:45.670 --> 01:00:03.570

120 Broadway Hearing Room: but basically in an effort to come to the table and to try to have those community conversations and again creating affordability where affordable units are not the norm. We had those conversations, and we made those choices we now, you know, as has been noted, face A, you know, a community board vote against.

251

01:00:03.570 --> 01:00:28.210

120 Broadway Hearing Room: And so in essence, to the extent that there were changes and modifications that reduced parking. You know, I think that's something that we would consider. But you know. Obviously, there's so many different considerations and stakeholders here that

community Board 15 on this and prior rezonings has made it clear that they want to maintain this high ratio of parking spaces, and that in order to gain their approval, that is something that applicants need to

252

01:00:28.210 --> 01:00:43.359

120 Broadway Hearing Room: to come to the table with. So again, all of those things considered on a going forward basis. If there were, if the discussions evolved, I think we would reduce the parking. But we're just presenting to the Commission what was presented to the Community Board and to the Brooklyn Borough President.

253

01:00:43.600 --> 01:00:57.440

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Fair enough this is. This is extremely useful, and and thank you. I appreciate, you know, your transparency on this just one final question just to clarify has that potential alternative scenario been presented and explained to the community in terms of

254

01:00:57.790 --> 01:01:27.620

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the actual. What the what you can do by actually reorienting the resources that would right now would go toward unrequired parking what we presented to them, and what they understood was that it would be far more preferable to provide a scenario with less than 50% of the of the spaces being provided, and they viewed that as a nonstarter in terms of their support. So it would be a more feasible development plan and a better layout for us.

255

01:01:27.730 --> 01:01:51.879

120 Broadway Hearing Room: But you know, have we? I don't think that we've said to them. Here's what it would look like with a drastic reduction, because they didn't even want to talk to us about that. I would encourage you, if you can again share with us, or anything additionally to what you've already done in that regard just to understand what that scenario could look like. It could have, you know, important implications here and going forward. Thank you. Understood, of course, and just to

256

01:01:51.880 --> 01:01:59.020

120 Broadway Hearing Room: to underlie this whole conversation we are in support of, and are often supported by

257

01:01:59.020 --> 01:02:16.300

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Council member discussions where they want to eliminate parking, and in those districts. When we go in, we know we can have a development that reduces or eliminates team parking in its entirety. But, like, you know, again, there's certain areas that are cut out for that kind of conversation, and ones that are not fair enough. Thank you very much. Thank you.

258

01:02:16.570 --> 01:02:17.959

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. Commissioner.

259

01:02:19.130 --> 01:02:22.620

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner. Gold has his hand up in zoom. Commissioner Gold.

260

01:02:23.650 --> 01:02:26.099

*Comm. Gold: Hi, good morning. Thank you.

261

01:02:26.740 --> 01:02:46.529

*Comm. Gold: I just wanted to follow up a little bit on some of the discussions had with the other commissioners there is, you know, it feels like there's something missing on the disconnect between the Community Board and you know community petition and what we're seeing here, and so, you know, certainly understand. There may, as you mentioned, be a property dispute. But at the same time.

262

01:02:46.570 --> 01:03:07.370

*Comm. Gold: you know, it's interesting to see literally, it looks like 30 of the Community Board members came out against versus 3. So you, I guess I just wanted to understand a little bit more, I mean is height of was height, a factor there as well, which you've adjusted? And you know, to that end can you speak about height in in the neighborhood?

263

01:03:07.670 --> 01:03:10.130

*Comm. Gold: Are there other buildings as tall nearby.

264

01:03:10.500 --> 01:03:27.639

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Sure. So there's an R. 6, a district to the north of the property that, as of right would permit, building heights reaching minimum of 80 feet, maybe even 85 feet. I think that in this area, if you took a hard look at the map, you'd probably find

265

01:03:27.640 --> 01:03:50.760

120 Broadway Hearing Room: maybe 6 story buildings something slightly greater. So an 11 story building with a tall building, an 8 story building. Not so. And so, the idea here to trade off and the opportunity to take an existing used car lot produce housing and affordable housing and provide massing which

266

01:03:51.000 --> 01:04:12.440

120 Broadway Hearing Room: really, as far as Coney Island Avenue is appropriate. So when we are before the Commission, and we talk about transit, oriented development, and what streets avenues are are, you know, are well suited for additional bulk and density. This would be one of them. We are within walking distance of 2 subways. It's you know, there's 2 wide streets. It just makes sense.

267

01:04:12.460 --> 01:04:36.889

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So again while there's that discussion around height. I think that if you go into the record and dig into the nature just reading again the Community Board recommendation, the fact that it is somewhat, you know, sets forth contrary statements within. And you know, just looking at. Really, you know, as someone who's who went before the Land Use Committee Community Board 15

268

01:04:36.890 --> 01:04:52.430

120 Broadway Hearing Room: 3 times with this application, and each time was trying to come closer to somewhere where we could reach a state of, you know, if we weren't completely happy, at least a greater, you know, greater consensus.

269

01:04:52.470 --> 01:05:13.510

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Something doesn't make sense. And and you know, when something doesn't make sense, as far as you know, looking at a record and looking at these applications, you have to kind of dig a little bit deeper. And so my statements, you know, are are what they are, and we can provide documentation of that. But the truth of the matter is, you know, I mean, you can look at the Community Board actions which approved

270

01:05:13.820 --> 01:05:27.999

120 Broadway Hearing Room: similar building heights along similar avenues, and chose to support one wholeheartedly, I believe, on Avenue V, and not here on Coney Island Avenue. You know. I think it's just. I think it's just. The record speaks for itself.

271

01:05:28.400 --> 01:05:38.099

*Comm. Gold: And so and so just to that point. Just so we can take a look at that the one supported on Avenue V which would be around the corner was is how close to this one, and how high would it be.

272

01:05:39.651 --> 01:05:52.720

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I believe it was also an R. 7 d. Which would have allowed for in that case, I believe 9 stories. So not, you know, within the same community district, not, you know, not entirely close as far as this intersection, but.

273

01:05:52.720 --> 01:05:55.230

*Comm. Gold: What? What block, if you can say is.

274

01:05:55.230 --> 01:06:00.679

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I can. I can. I can reach back out to the, to the Commission and provide that information. I don't have it in.

275

01:06:00.680 --> 01:06:11.989

*Comm. Gold: Yeah, that that would be helpful, because, as you can imagine, I mean Avenue V in some spots is commercial and some spots is residential right? So depending on where you are. On Avenue V, it's, you know, a completely different.

276

01:06:11.990 --> 01:06:15.109

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I think it may be 30, 33 Avenue V.

277

01:06:15.110 --> 01:06:21.320

*Comm. Gold: Okay? So that that's a i mean you. You know this as you say it, that's a different world. Right? That's

278

01:06:22.160 --> 01:06:23.389

*Comm. Gold: okay. Got it.

279

01:06:23.390 --> 01:06:24.290

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Understood.

280

01:06:24.290 --> 01:06:26.030

*Comm. Gold: And that it's more so. Anything more. Yeah.

281

01:06:26.030 --> 01:06:29.580

*Comm. Gold: any any anything close, closer, that you know that we can look at

282

01:06:32.460 --> 01:06:33.246

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you.

283

01:06:34.820 --> 01:06:35.490

*Comm. Gold: No

284

01:06:36.390 --> 01:06:47.870

*Comm. Gold: Sorry. No, I was just as a you know, when we talk about precedent. Is there anything that was closer or to this right to this neighborhood, and that's what 3 or 4 miles away, right.

285

01:06:48.040 --> 01:07:16.300

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Yeah, I would note that in 2,007, when the Commission approved the Sara restaurant, rezoning that their discussion was around the appropriate of massing of multifamily buildings along Coney Island Avenue. This is a mere 2 blocks north of the site, and and you know we did that rezoning 1617, 18 years ago. That was opposed at the time, and was eventually approved by the Commission. So you know I get it. There's a push and pull.

286

01:07:16.300 --> 01:07:28.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It's just whether or not you know whether or not An. R. 4 and c. 8 1 district is appropriate on Coney Island Avenue, and in this instance we feel that there's a good argument, that it's not.

287

01:07:29.500 --> 01:07:46.129

*Comm. Gold: Got it. Okay? And then and then one other on the parking spots. I know there's been a lot of grand covered, but you know the increase was that in response to to the community board, or just the redevelopment of the unit, what what sort of? Added the extra 11.

288

01:07:46.810 --> 01:07:48.640

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It was in response to the Community Board.

289

01:07:48.640 --> 01:07:51.130

*Comm. Gold: Okay, got it? Got it? Okay. Thank you.

290

01:07:51.620 --> 01:07:53.910

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Of course. Thank you, Commissioner.

291

01:07:57.520 --> 01:08:06.229

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you, Mr. Labelle. Thank you. Chair. Okay, let's move on to a couple of members of the public who've signed up here 1st on Zoom we have Teresa Scavo

292

01:08:06.680 --> 01:08:09.190

120 Broadway Hearing Room: be followed by Troy Olson here in the room.

293

01:08:17.590 --> 01:08:20.490

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Teresa, you and are you able to unmute your mic.

294

01:08:28.939 --> 01:08:30.229

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Yes, good morning.

295

01:08:31.609 --> 01:08:32.419

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Good morning!

296

01:08:32.630 --> 01:08:44.150

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: I am Teresa Scavo. I'm the chair of Community Board 15. And I am appalled at what I've just heard from the applicant.

297

01:08:44.770 --> 01:08:49.029

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Basically, I had no idea

298

01:08:49.160 --> 01:09:04.299

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: about any type of proposal from the yeshiva for this property. So to insinuate, we voted the way we did because of whatever land use was mentioned is ludicrous

299

01:09:04.770 --> 01:09:07.149

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: in the words of the applicant.

300

01:09:07.359 --> 01:09:10.240

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: the majority of the block in question

301

01:09:10.420 --> 01:09:26.290

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: is improved with one to 3 story residential and commercial buildings, and as I am a hundred percent sure, many of you commissioners have never even witnessed this block.

302

01:09:26.960 --> 01:09:34.100

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: A few feet south of this location is the 61st precinct.

303

01:09:34.430 --> 01:09:40.920

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: and, as all of us know, parking around the precinct is a disaster.

304

01:09:41.090 --> 01:09:43.989

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: You could go there any time of the day.

305

01:09:44.250 --> 01:09:50.200

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Cars are double and triple parked around the entire perimeter.

306

01:09:50.500 --> 01:10:00.099

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: If we go several 100 feet to the north of this location, it is an automotive repair and collision shop.

307

01:10:00.430 --> 01:10:07.330

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: He has unilaterally taken over every parking spot.

308

01:10:07.510 --> 01:10:15.230

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: and utilizes the median for autos. There for repairs as well as collision work.

309

01:10:15.510 --> 01:10:25.269

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: He has the Belt Parkway City contract has tow trucks constantly there, blocking the entire street

310

01:10:25.950 --> 01:10:40.069

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: going forward. The only a proposed addition to this block is a 4 story extension of the existing Yde Yeshiva directly across the street.

311

01:10:40.570 --> 01:10:44.080

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: I am not opposed to this particular project.

312

01:10:44.450 --> 01:10:48.380

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: The Community Board is opposed to the rezoning.

313

01:10:48.570 --> 01:11:05.470

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: We believe, if we allow this rezoning every property owner on that block will continue to do the same thing, causing more backups, more traffic, because, as told to us.

314

01:11:05.590 --> 01:11:09.620

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: probably will rent on the ground floor to a supermarket.

315

01:11:10.270 --> 01:11:18.660

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: 35 parking spots is not going to handle a building plus a commercial space on the ground floor.

316

01:11:18.880 --> 01:11:20.090

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Also

317

01:11:20.430 --> 01:11:32.839

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: the borough president's recommendation. He has never visited this community, attended any of the public hearings on this item, so how he put.

318

01:11:33.745 --> 01:11:34.650

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Time.

319

01:11:35.580 --> 01:11:36.629

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Thank you.

320

01:11:37.480 --> 01:11:40.319

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. Ms. Cabo. We appreciate your being with us.

321

01:11:42.259 --> 01:11:45.530

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you. Let me move on to

322

01:11:46.170 --> 01:11:48.020

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Troy. I'm sorry.

323

01:11:48.140 --> 01:11:50.559

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Sorry, Miss Cabo, are you still there?

324

01:11:51.060 --> 01:11:51.485

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Yes.

325

01:11:52.470 --> 01:11:55.840

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Great hold on. We have a Commissioner from. I'm sorry. A question from Commissioner Goodrich.

326

01:11:58.530 --> 01:12:11.429

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I just wanted to clarify. There was a part where you were talking about. He and I wasn't sure if you were talking about the developer or someone else on the project. But you were talking about someone who owns all of the property.

327

01:12:11.888 --> 01:12:25.140

120 Broadway Hearing Room: On the block. You talked about the police? With the cars. I understand that. But who were you referring to when you were saying he owns all of the property on the block, or maybe I.

328

01:12:25.140 --> 01:12:25.480

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: No.

329

01:12:25.480 --> 01:12:26.150

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Wrong.

330

01:12:26.150 --> 01:12:30.760

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Okay, Commissioner, I'm talking about Ben and Nino's.

331

01:12:31.080 --> 01:12:33.580

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: If you come to this block.

332

01:12:34.020 --> 01:12:39.869

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: which is several feet north of this proposed rezoning.

333

01:12:40.450 --> 01:12:44.420

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: it's a collision and automotive repair.

334

01:12:44.940 --> 01:12:48.499

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: I personally live 2 blocks away.

335

01:12:48.670 --> 01:12:56.640

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Every single day you drive down Coney Island Avenue from Avenue V towards Avenue.

336

01:12:57.330 --> 01:13:07.500

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: You're narrowed down to one lane of moving traffic. He has every parking spot taken. The median is his reserve parking.

337

01:13:07.690 --> 01:13:10.000

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: The whole block is a disaster.

338

01:13:11.360 --> 01:13:13.539

120 Broadway Hearing Room: That's what I was addressing.

339

01:13:15.520 --> 01:13:16.630

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you.

340

01:13:17.600 --> 01:13:21.439

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Commissioner. Gold has his hand up. Commissioner. Gold.

341

01:13:22.790 --> 01:13:44.589

*Comm. Gold: Hi, Hi! Thank you. Just wanted to follow up. So I think, net, it sounds like, and I don't want to put words in your mouth. What you're saying is that at this point the infrastructure that's there in the area isn't sufficient in your view to to support the additional development is, is it? Is it really that simple? Okay, got it? Got it? And is that? Go ahead.

342

01:13:44.590 --> 01:13:47.369

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: Going to be a domino effect.

343

01:13:48.160 --> 01:14:01.069

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: We've seen now, Mr. Lowbell said, all the places we've considered, and we have Mcdonald Avenue that could sustain this additional building

344

01:14:01.400 --> 01:14:15.709

xPH04 - 06 - Theresa Scavo: avenue v that he was quoting that is nowhere near this Avenue V. We did approve, but those locations warranted housing this location does not warrant housing.

345

01:14:16.860 --> 01:14:21.729

*Comm. Gold: Got it. Got it? Okay, thank you. Thank you so much for for clarifying.

346

01:14:23.940 --> 01:14:29.939

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you again, Ms. Cabo. We appreciate you joining us today. Okay, let's move on to Troy. Olson.

347

01:14:30.360 --> 01:14:31.890

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Mr. Olson. Welcome.

348

01:14:33.620 --> 01:14:59.800

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Good morning, chair. Grodnik Commissioners. My name is Troy Olson. I'm the legislative director for Councilwoman Ina Vernikoff, who represents the 48th Council District in South Brooklyn, which includes a location at 2510 Coney Island Avenue, that is, on the agenda today for public hearing on behalf of the councilwoman. We are also appalled by the insinuation that this is a mere property dispute, and bringing a school into it, I think, was inappropriate.

349

01:14:59.940 --> 01:15:25.289

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Councilman Vernikoff is strongly against this proposal. This proposed project. This is a commercial corridor, and the tallest building in this corridor is 4 stories. There are considerable concerns in the community about this project related to its height especially, but also parking and transit issues, and those concerns concerns around the potential construction. And then the spiraling effect, as mentioned by Chair scavo.

350

01:15:25.290 --> 01:15:31.640

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the most important consideration here, though, is simply that the community does not want it, and that should still matter. In this city

351

01:15:31.720 --> 01:15:39.770

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Community Board 15 voted against this proposed project by an astounding 33 against, and only 3 in the affirmative.

352

01:15:39.860 --> 01:15:47.150

120 Broadway Hearing Room: There are no corrections that could be made that would satisfy the condition needed here, which is community and neighborhood support.

353

01:15:47.280 --> 01:15:57.780

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Let's not put things in a community that doesn't want it. If a community is really against it, we should not be pushing projects onto it. Councilwoman Vernikoff and her time in office

354

01:15:57.950 --> 01:16:08.090

120 Broadway Hearing Room: has consistently held a policy of backing the neighbors and backing the communities most affected when it comes to anything land, use, or or a proposed housing project.

355

01:16:08.460 --> 01:16:13.209

120 Broadway Hearing Room: This community support metric simply cannot be met here, and it's not even close.

356

01:16:13.440 --> 01:16:17.750

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The lack of any community support on this extends beyond the Community Board as well.

357

01:16:18.370 --> 01:16:27.800

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The 33 community members on the Board of Community Board 15 that voted against have no stake in this property, they saw it as not fit

358

01:16:27.920 --> 01:16:29.389

120 Broadway Hearing Room: for this community.

359

01:16:29.630 --> 01:16:48.490

120 Broadway Hearing Room: One of the last vestiges of neighborhood and community protection in this city is neighbors banding together and saying no to a project having the support of their representative. In this case, Councilwoman Vernikoff and other members around the city council, deferring to that member, that representative and those communities and those neighbors.

360

01:16:48.700 --> 01:17:07.989

120 Broadway Hearing Room: There are plenty other locations suitable for more housing in the city and across Brooklyn, but not here, but thank you for your time. And councilwoman. Bernakoff sends her warmest regards. Thank you very much. Before you go. Let me just pose a couple questions to you, and please send our warm regards back.

361

01:17:08.160 --> 01:17:12.000

120 Broadway Hearing Room: You noted other areas in Brooklyn.

362

01:17:12.390 --> 01:17:18.720

120 Broadway Hearing Room: maybe even other areas in the council district that might be appropriate or might make sense.

363

01:17:18.850 --> 01:17:48.399

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Can you give us a sense focus on the Council district? I wouldn't ask you to speculate on the rest of the city, since you're the legislative director of this council district. But tell us what corridors you believe, Councilmember Vernikoff would support additional density in this neighborhood, just so that we can make note. Well, there are other, I would say. Generally I would cite. The borough president was interested in more housing, and Coney Island, which is out of the district, and this is Coney Island Avenue.

364

01:17:48.400 --> 01:17:55.489

120 Broadway Hearing Room: There are a lot of other areas of the district that would be suitable for more housing, but a commercial corridor that has no buildings

365

01:17:55.550 --> 01:18:15.119

120 Broadway Hearing Room: with height greater than 4 stories. That's not. That's not an appropriate area, I think, even though she was opposed to city of yes, I think city of yes will gradually, over time add add more housing. That opposition is, of course, still there. But there are. There are more suitable areas, and she has been

366

01:18:15.120 --> 01:18:27.370

120 Broadway Hearing Room: support of of other housing projects that throughout the district. But at the end of the day it is primarily a low density district. So the fact of the matter is

367

01:18:27.440 --> 01:18:30.170

120 Broadway Hearing Room: is the nature of much of the district.

368

01:18:30.290 --> 01:18:41.049

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The housing additions are not going to be big projects and be very gradual, and you also have the fact that it's a coastal district. So you have the flood concerns. You have the environmental concerns.

369

01:18:41.050 --> 01:19:03.780

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The top issue on a day in, day out. Basis really is parking. It's transit. So we have to fight to protect every parking spot and get more parking spot, because until the day comes where everyone gives up on cars. The reality we face is, we need to prioritize, not just housing, but also parking and transit, and the safety and quality of life

370

01:19:03.780 --> 01:19:08.839

120 Broadway Hearing Room: and character of the neighborhoods and communities that Councilwoman Vernikop represents in the 48.th

371

01:19:08.980 --> 01:19:16.160

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Thank you. I understand I really was just wanted to give you an opportunity to say what she would be, for I understand

372

01:19:16.430 --> 01:19:33.309

120 Broadway Hearing Room: what she may be against, but I really want to give you an opportunity. I don't, you know. I think that may be worth further exploration here, but perhaps not today, because you you gave us some food for thought about Community Board having a veto in this

373

01:19:33.690 --> 01:19:46.220

120 Broadway Hearing Room: council district from her perspective, and I'm interested in knowing whether there is a size of building here, even on this site that she would support.

374

01:19:46.950 --> 01:20:06.340

120 Broadway Hearing Room: What it currently is zoned for as of right, it can be built up to 4 stories. And so what chair scavo recommended. Both the Community Board and councilwoman would be fine with that, and that already exists. So there is, there is no additional density that she would support here

375

01:20:06.340 --> 01:20:16.710

120 Broadway Hearing Room: above the as of rights scenario. Is that a fair statement? That's correct? Okay? All right, let me go to Commissioner Benjamin. Yeah, I'm also curious.

376

01:20:17.200 --> 01:20:32.719

120 Broadway Hearing Room: The applicant has added parking as a result of discussions, or the vote of the Community Board. Does that make the project more palatable to the councilwoman, or what, or would she

377

01:20:33.270 --> 01:20:37.090

120 Broadway Hearing Room: rather support a 4 story building with no parking.

378

01:20:37.500 --> 01:21:04.129

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the additional, the parking being one for one in the project was great to see, you know that that was not ever the top issue, though the top issue really was the height and the possible cascading effects that the zoning change would have with, with nearby developers changing that that corridor in that neighborhood. So the parking very exciting to see.

379

01:21:04.200 --> 01:21:23.670

120 Broadway Hearing Room: but ultimately not not the driving issue in this particular project, but in terms of the quote, cascading effect, you do know that each one of those rezonings would have to come back here and ultimately back to the councilwoman, so you could look at each one of them on their own merits.

380

01:21:25.090 --> 01:21:30.179

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Forget the cascading effect. Looking at this project simply on its own merits.

381

01:21:33.087 --> 01:21:37.900

120 Broadway Hearing Room: So you're saying, if a the as it is right now.

382

01:21:38.020 --> 01:21:40.970

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the potential for the parking not to be as good.

383

01:21:41.340 --> 01:22:00.979

120 Broadway Hearing Room: that is a potential risk. But the it's outweighed by the driving factors of what is leading the opposition to this, which is the height of the building, and also the the fact that the Community Board and the and the residents. The neighbors there are against it.

384

01:22:01.310 --> 01:22:14.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room: and they'd rather have if they had to have a choice. The current parking situation, with cars parked on the median and cars parked on the sidewalk, and then a new building. This new building

385

01:22:14.410 --> 01:22:15.280

120 Broadway Hearing Room: correct.

386

01:22:16.170 --> 01:22:27.549

120 Broadway Hearing Room: That doesn't mean some other that some other proposal couldn't be satisfactory. But on this, on the merits of this particular proposal, yes, and they'd rather have a 4 story building with no parking.

387

01:22:28.280 --> 01:22:46.410

120 Broadway Hearing Room: a 4 story residential building that had no parking than this. I just want to make sure I understand my choices. Yes, because parking is while it was good to see that it is not the top driving issue that led the opposition on this to this particular proposal. Ideally.

388

01:22:46.775 --> 01:23:00.680

120 Broadway Hearing Room: You know as much parking as is possible throughout the district where Councilwoman Verkoff's always trying to find we've been talking to city agencies. But that that is overwritten by these other factors in this particular instance.

389

01:23:02.480 --> 01:23:06.700

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you. Thank you. Commissioner. Commissioner Goodridge.

390

01:23:11.960 --> 01:23:18.949

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Some of what I want, some of what I was gonna ask is already been asked, but some

391

01:23:19.360 --> 01:23:37.070

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I think I just want to give you an opportunity to respond when this type of issue comes up where a community board votes overwhelmingly. No against a project, and the issue is not about affordability. It's more about neighborhood character.

392

01:23:37.170 --> 01:24:06.169

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It tends to be framed as the community is, Nimby, not in my backyard, and these issues tend to be waved off in in the midst of us, having a housing crisis which for me, you know, just on a side. Note. I think traffic and congestion. I think these are all very valid issues as planning commissioners, we should all consider, but I wanted to give you an opportunity to sort of like, just beat the punch and respond to that, because that is what it will be framed, as, especially since this

393

01:24:06.440 --> 01:24:18.780

120 Broadway Hearing Room: council member also voted against city of yes, which I did as well. But whatever so under, even before city of yes, under current zoning, there's enough

394

01:24:18.890 --> 01:24:26.649

120 Broadway Hearing Room: theoretical possibility to build 2 New York cities. The simple fact is, the city has not grown in overall population

395

01:24:26.820 --> 01:24:33.280

120 Broadway Hearing Room: for a long time, and there's been a housing crisis for 6 decades. This is a very complex

396

01:24:33.440 --> 01:24:47.660

120 Broadway Hearing Room: issue. It's not going to be solved overnight, and I think there's a lot of other things at play that drive the housing crisis rather than so-called Nimbyism. In this particular instance, I think.

397

01:24:47.930 --> 01:25:05.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room: to continually build up, and and South Brooklyn has seen quite a few tall buildings built in the last 50 years, especially just outside of the district. In the in the 47th there's been some but

398

01:25:05.780 --> 01:25:09.200

120 Broadway Hearing Room: that and all of those buildings. The higher up you build.

399

01:25:09.340 --> 01:25:17.719

120 Broadway Hearing Room: the more you're you're adding to that congestion, this transit and those quality of life issues. The reality is is historically this.

400

01:25:18.498 --> 01:25:21.251

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Excuse me historically, this neighborhood is

401

01:25:21.890 --> 01:25:28.769

120 Broadway Hearing Room: low density, and and has many of the characteristics that you would associate with a suburb and

402

01:25:29.020 --> 01:25:50.150

120 Broadway Hearing Room: way out in the in the district there. There are streets that are still basically private to this very day. So this is a very to sort of from from downtown Manhattan to say that everyone in the city has to has to do a little bit more. I get it, and there are, I think, spaces for a little bit more.

403

01:25:50.530 --> 01:26:02.439

120 Broadway Hearing Room: But not in this particular instance in this particular project. That's a i know. That's a very philosophical answer, but I felt it called for that. And I I think I think this is

404

01:26:03.130 --> 01:26:07.500

120 Broadway Hearing Room: a much bigger bigger issue than we can solve on any one particular project.

405

01:26:07.840 --> 01:26:10.589

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Coney Island is changing right? There's

406

01:26:11.380 --> 01:26:13.630

120 Broadway Hearing Room: which is in the which is outside of the district.

407

01:26:13.910 --> 01:26:15.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay? Yep,

408

01:26:18.000 --> 01:26:24.850

120 Broadway Hearing Room: And then I just want one last question just to build off of the chair's question. I know we're talking about just this, you know.

409

01:26:25.040 --> 01:26:31.249

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Project, but I do wonder in, in the, in a perfect world, what would this community want

410

01:26:31.800 --> 01:26:34.139

120 Broadway Hearing Room: this particular site to be?

411

01:26:34.670 --> 01:26:39.680

120 Broadway Hearing Room: It's not housing, it's not parking what in a you know. What would it be? Would it just

412

01:26:39.890 --> 01:26:42.909

120 Broadway Hearing Room: not change, or would it be something else?

413

01:26:44.035 --> 01:26:56.480

120 Broadway Hearing Room: I I mean, I think it, it could be a medical office. It could be any any number of commercial possibilities. There's that there is a lack of a community center

414

01:26:57.109 --> 01:27:11.620

120 Broadway Hearing Room: in the in the district in general. That would be nice to see, especially one. You know we have. We have. We have a fair amount of senior centers. But the but a community center that sort of had multi-purpose, and

415

01:27:11.620 --> 01:27:32.999

120 Broadway Hearing Room: could could bring together young and old. There's a number of different proposals that I could think of, that that might be a fit, and whether it's a fit for developers. And the powers that be, you know I don't know. I'm not prepared to answer that question, but in general I think there have under its current zoning. I think there are at least 10 better better options.

416

01:27:36.580 --> 01:27:58.509

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you, Mr. Olson, and when you, when you go back to councilmember Vernikoff, with our warm regards, please do remind her about the rent burden of her constituents, which is at 54.6% today. So we just encourage you to bring that back to her as well will do. Thank you. Okay. Let me see if there are any other members of the public

417

01:27:58.770 --> 01:28:15.610

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): wishing to be heard on this item. Okay, there are not. So, we will close the hearing on Calendar 20 and 21, and we will move on to the next item of the day.

418

01:28:15.970 --> 01:28:38.700

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): Calendar numbers 22 through 31, Atlantic Avenue Mixed-Use Plan, Community Districts 3 and 8. Calendar number 22 C 250014 ZMK, calendar number 23, C250015 ZRK, calendar number 24, C 250020 PG, I'm sorry, PQK. Calendar number 25, C 250021 PPK, calendar, number 26, C 250022 PPK

419

01:28:38.850 --> 01:28:59.709

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): Calendar, number 27, C250023 PPK, calendar, number 28 C 250016 HAK, calendar number 29, C 250019 PQK. Calendar number 30, C 250017 HAK

420

01:28:59.710 --> 01:29:11.560

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): calendar, number 31 C 250018 PQK. Public hearing in a matter of applications for zoning map, zoning, text amendments, acquisitions and dispositions of city-owned properties.

421

01:29:12.010 --> 01:29:37.150

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): UDAAP designation and project approval concerning Atlantic Avenue mixed use plan. I have a notice regarding the draft environmental impact statement. A public hearing is being held at the City Planning Commission in conjunction with the above action, to receive comments related to a draft environmental impact statement. This hearing is being held pursuant to the State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review.

422

01:29:38.080 --> 01:29:50.470

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Great. Thank you, madam Secretary, I have a lot of people on my list here who are signed up as part of the applicant team, but I do not know if they were all, if they are all actually part of the applicant team here. So I am going to invite

423

01:29:51.310 --> 01:30:01.009

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): the team from the department of city, planning to kick us off while we straighten out who's coming next? Welcome, Jonah, Jesse, thank you for being with us today.

424

01:30:02.240 --> 01:30:08.090

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): Great good to be back chair and commissioners.

425

01:30:08.300 --> 01:30:12.129

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): So we're we're pleased to return for today's public hearing

426

01:30:12.310 --> 01:30:26.110

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): today. We'd like to quickly recap the the broader goals of the plan. Give a brief refresher on the proposal, certified and summarize the votes and ULURP process to date.

427

01:30:27.050 --> 01:30:44.190

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): as we said a couple days ago. In short, AAMUP represents an opportunity to re-envision an industrially zoned area in Central Brooklyn for a mix of uses anchored along a 120-foot-wide corridor in close proximity to public transit and job hubs.

428

01:30:44.280 --> 01:30:59.790

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): Our aim is to create a holistic plan that supports housing and job growth with substantial amounts of income, restricted housing, coupled with enhancements to the streetscape and public realm, while addressing other infrastructure needs and priorities

429

01:31:01.850 --> 01:31:05.030

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): as proposed, AAMUP is projected to create

430

01:31:05.370 --> 01:31:19.400

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): approximately 4,600 new homes, of which 1,440 would be income restricted and rent regulated, and over 800,000 square feet of space for businesses, with approximately 22,800 jobs.

431

01:31:20.070 --> 01:31:31.250

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): To facilitate this vision. The Department's proposing a set of zoning map amendments, zoning text amendments to map mandatory, inclusionary housing, and establish a special district to improve the public realm

432

01:31:31.420 --> 01:31:42.480

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): and foster a mix of uses, and then, in addition, HPD. And DCAS are co-applicants for several site-specific actions, including UDAAP designations.

433

01:31:42.640 --> 01:31:48.079

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Acquisition dispositions to facilitate housing on 5 additional sites

434

01:31:49.420 --> 01:31:57.140

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): AAMUP covers approximately 21 blocks along Atlantic Avenue, split between Crown Heights and Prospect Heights and Community Board

435

01:31:57.250 --> 01:32:02.329

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): 8 to the South and Bedford-Stuyvesant Community Board 3 to the North

436

01:32:02.930 --> 01:32:13.109

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): Atlantic Terminal Barclays Center in downtown Brooklyn are about 3 to 4 blocks to the west. Prospect Park and Eastern Parkway are about 7 to 8 blocks to the south.

437

01:32:13.470 --> 01:32:18.850

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): and the Nostrand Avenue LIRR Station is less than one block to the east.

438

01:32:20.600 --> 01:32:39.990

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): AAMUP builds on over 10 years of outreach and engagement, including the M-Crown planning work from Community Board 8, and the more recent community vision priorities report from 2023, as well as additional outreach from 2024.

439

01:32:41.600 --> 01:32:45.730

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): For context, we want to remind the Commission that AAMUP is surrounded by areas

440

01:32:46.050 --> 01:33:12.449

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): either contextually rezoned or mapped as historic districts. While these actions have been important for preserving the built character in particular, the brownstone character that many of us love. They've also limited opportunities to grow and meet rising housing demand, despite some growth along corridors or large projects, such as the state-led Pacific Park or Atlantic Yards.

441

01:33:13.600 --> 01:33:23.000

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): The M1-1 zoning in AAMUP continues to be a barrier for growth, resulting in much of the area since 1961 occupied by

442

01:33:23.270 --> 01:33:37.040

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): parking, storage, auto-related uses and self storage with, although there have been some mostly non-complying, multi-story loft buildings adaptively reused for office and other uses.

443

01:33:38.710 --> 01:33:55.930

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): We estimate about 800 private sector jobs are located in AAMUP with the majority being in office healthcare, retail, and commercial-based sectors, and about a 3rd in construction, wholesale manufacturing, and other industrial-based sectors.

444

01:33:56.280 --> 01:34:09.850

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): From 2012 to 2022 we saw a general trend of a loss of industrial jobs as shown on the chart on the right, while jobs in local services and office-based sectors grew.

445

01:34:11.530 --> 01:34:33.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): Since 2019, we also want to note that 7 private applications have been approved in the area as well as 3 within a block. While these private applications have added much needed housing, they've not been able to unlock the area's potential in a holistic way, which has been a key driving force behind our Collective Neighborhood Plan work.

446

01:34:35.240 --> 01:35:03.929

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): And just a quick recap of what we've heard during public outreach. Here's just a view of the AAMUP community vision priorities report which included priorities to create and preserve affordable housing, which has been a top priority as well

as promoting a mix of uses with density, anchored on Atlantic Avenue, developing a street, wide street plan, with new open space

447

01:35:04.040 --> 01:35:06.410

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): or improvements to existing parks.

448

01:35:06.600 --> 01:35:21.120

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff - DCP): and then supporting businesses and job training programs, such as through various programs, or by activating the Bedford Atlantic Armory at this point. I'll just turn it over to my colleague Jesse, to cover the proposal.

449

01:35:27.990 --> 01:35:40.239

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): Thanks, Jonah, and building on the M Crown Vision Report, and from Community Board 8 and AAMUP Community Vision Report. The Neighborhood Plan introduces a new framework and opportunities for capital and programmatic investments

450

01:35:40.240 --> 01:36:03.880

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): and expanded project area to create affordable housing opportunities beyond MIH on publicly owned land. And so to support this, we have partnered with HPD, DOT, and SBS. All whom are here today. The plan also features innovative zoning tools to incentivize job growth, urban design guidelines for Atlantic Avenue and the first public space bonus expansion outside of the central business district.

451

01:36:05.420 --> 01:36:16.819

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): as mentioned before, to facilitate the proposal highlighted in purple. The Department proposes the Zoning Map amendments and establish the Special Atlantic Avenue mixed use district shown in the hatched area

452

01:36:16.960 --> 01:36:21.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): as well as zoning text amendments to apply mandatory, inclusionary housing or MIH.

453

01:36:22.220 --> 01:36:30.580

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): In addition, there are a few site-specific proposals in yellow, the UDAAPs and the acquisition and disposition of city owned land.

454

01:36:30.910 --> 01:36:38.280

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): I'll be using the next few slides to share the proposed zoning and map amendment and text amendments for the Special Atlantic Avenue mixed use district

455

01:36:39.480 --> 01:36:57.719

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): to achieve our goals and strategies. We're proposing first, a zoning map change transitioning the underlying M1-1, zoning into 5 distinct density areas along Atlantic Avenue we have the greatest opportunity for much needed housing with the proposed C6-3a or an R9A equivalent

456

01:36:57.740 --> 01:37:11.540

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): moving to the north-south avenues like Grand Klassen and Bedford. We propose a step down to R7D/M1-3A density to serve as a transition from Atlantic Avenue, and also as a north-south connector.

457

01:37:12.380 --> 01:37:21.789

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): Mid block areas shown in the lighter orange would step down to a further to R6A/M1-2 density to align with the existing context.

458

01:37:22.290 --> 01:37:32.490

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): The residential only areas in yellow are designed to maximize affordable housing opportunities, particularly on publicly or nonprofitly owned sites.

459

01:37:32.710 --> 01:37:42.830

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): and finally, the armory site is in purple as proposed in M1-3A zoning allowing the existing use to thrive while accommodating potential future needs.

460

01:37:44.440 --> 01:37:58.310

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): The special Atlantic Avenue mixed Use district would include special rules to ensure a lively streetscape along Atlantic Avenue and other corridors. While supporting a mix of residential commercial community facility and light industrial uses.

461

01:37:59.540 --> 01:38:23.149

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): More specifically along Atlantic Avenue the special district aims to improve the pedestrian experience by requiring active ground floor uses with transparency requirements and lobby with restrictions, while also setting the street wall back to achieve a wider sidewalk requirements for facade articulation. Also, while providing an incentive for an open space to break up the street walls and offer new views and quality open spaces.

462

01:38:24.790 --> 01:38:33.480

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): In addition to MIH units. We are including proposals that will, in an effect to maximize opportunities for income-restricted housing.

463

01:38:34.780 --> 01:38:51.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): On top of the previously mentioned $24.2 million at St. Andrews playground. The city is advancing immediate safety improvements on Atlantic Avenue, and some surrounding intersections through a partnership with DOT, which we announced back at certification as a set of street improvement projects or sips

464

01:38:51.760 --> 01:38:56.029

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): to the neighborhood, which will involve neck downs, crosswalks, and marking refreshings.

465

01:38:59.230 --> 01:39:06.559

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): as mentioned at certification, AAMUP includes various city-led programs and investments to support the increase in density and land use changes

466

01:39:06.940 --> 01:39:19.570

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): while long-term investments in the public realm, and infrastructure are being considered highlighted. Here are a few existing and ongoing investments, some of which are a response to the recent outreach and reflected down payments on our commitment for a holistic neighborhood plan.

467

01:39:20.290 --> 01:39:27.949

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): These projects include area-wide HPD tenant and homeowner protection programs as well as investments to aim of streets, parks, and infrastructure.

468

01:39:29.700 --> 01:39:33.459

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): AAMUP is subject to a full EIS and racial equity reports.

469

01:39:34.510 --> 01:39:48.019

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): And as part of the environmental review process, the DEIS did identify impacts in the categories mentioned in yellow on the screen. Mitigation efforts were mentioned as part of the DEIS and are being further explored in advanced as part of the final EIS.

470

01:39:49.600 --> 01:39:57.049

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): During the ULURP process, Community Boards 3 and 8, along with the Borough President, submitted favorable recommendations with conditions.

471

01:39:58.480 --> 01:40:10.959

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): And in summary, we're proposing a series of actions to re-envision an industrially zoned area in Central Brooklyn to support housing and job growth, coupled with public realm and infrastructure improvements

472

01:40:11.070 --> 01:40:35.030

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): in total, all of AAMUP will create 4,600 new homes, approximately 1,440 of which will be income restricted and space for 2,800 jobs while being a catalyst for capital and program based investments. Thank you. And that concludes the presentation.

473

01:40:35.530 --> 01:40:46.750

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Great. Thank you very much. And I'm going to welcome up next our sister agency, HPD, as well as an applicant team that will include Amhara Hernandez, Aleena Farishta, Tanya Martinez.

474

01:40:47.470 --> 01:41:07.230

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Gregory Anderson, Jack Lei, Kuza Woodard, David Almonte, Emmanuel D'Amore, Cornelia Narovici, Miguelina Garcia, Olga Jobe, Dash Henley, Tiffany Price, Rebecca Crimmins, Paula Diaz.

475

01:41:07.700 --> 01:41:19.169

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): how did I do? Great, all right. Great. You have 10 min welcome. Okay, awesome.

476

01:41:19.170 --> 01:41:47.230

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): I was the last one. So good morning, Commissioners. My name is Paula Diaz, I'm a neighborhood planner. Give me a second. There you go. I'm a neighborhood planner in the office of neighborhood strategies at HPD, and I'm joined by my colleagues, Aleena Farishta, Director of Brooklyn Planning and Amhara Hernandez, Senior Planner on the Brooklyn planning team as well as by the development teams of the Dean and Bergen projects that we're going to talk about. And they're here to answer any questions that you have about those projects specifically. And so my team has been working closely with DCP on AAMUP, and I will be presenting on the overview of housing strategies that the DCP team referenced.

477

01:41:47.990 --> 01:41:48.980

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): So

478

01:41:49.150 --> 01:42:07.410

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): let's see how it goes. There you go. So what we heard throughout the community engagement process is that tenants and homeowners are feeling the pressure of rising housing costs as well as the shortage of available homes in the area. So to respond to these concerns, we have multiple strategies to keep housing stable

479

01:42:07.410 --> 01:42:19.730

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): and affordable in the AAMUP area, and they are divided into these two buckets that we're going to go through. The first one is creating new affordable homes, and the second one is preserving, existing affordable homes and preventing displacement.

480

01:42:20.150 --> 01:42:49.830

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Before we start. We just want to make sure that everyone knows what we mean when we say that a home is affordable, and what we mean is that a household is now paying more than 30% of their income on housing costs, and also additionally, all the housing that HPD creates and that we will be discussing today is also rent-stabilized, which protects tenants from sudden rent increases and also income restricted, which means that a household can qualify based on their income and the household size.

481

01:42:51.770 --> 01:43:06.460

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): So, as Jonah and Jesse mentioned most of the new affordable housing in AAMUP, which is over 1,400 homes, will be part of the mixed income buildings on private sites, through mandatory inclusionary housing or MIH.

482

01:43:06.460 --> 01:43:23.469

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): So in rezoned areas like AAMUP in exchange for higher density, the city mandates that between 20 and 30% of the units are set aside and permanently stabilized. These units are built by private developers, but are administered by HPD and marketed through the housing, lottery, or housing connect

483

01:43:23.710 --> 01:43:44.080

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): so who is served, and the rents and incomes vary, depending on which MIH option is selected, which is what you see here on the screen, for example, in option one, which is the most standard one, we would have 25% of the units affordable at an average of 60% AMI, which in 2024 is about $81,000 for a family of 3,

484

01:43:44.800 --> 01:44:06.920

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): but beyond MIH the city is also building more deeply affordable housing on public sites. This map shows six public sites that are at various stages of redevelopment, planning first, at the Dean and Bergen sites that I mentioned that the developer teams are here today, and they were part of a 2021 MWBE RPF that HPD did.

485

01:44:06.920 --> 01:44:29.280

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): And we also have the 1024 Fulton Street. That is a state-owned site. That will be also 100% affordable. 1134 Pacific. That is, a previously city-owned site that is, being redeveloped by a nonprofit, and HPD is funding it. And finally, 1110 Atlantic and 457 Nostrand that are two sites that are owned by other government agencies.

486

01:44:29.280 --> 01:44:38.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): that we're currently in conversations with them and exploring a possibility of affordable housing redevelopment. So we're going to go through each of these.

487

01:44:38.520 --> 01:44:41.180

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): So first, the Dean

488

01:44:41.200 --> 01:45:05.749

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Park Edge project would include 151 affordable homes for older New Yorkers earning up to 50% AMI. It is designed with passive house guidelines, and we also have on-site social services and amenity space, as well as approximately 6,500 square feet, new, publicly accessible open space that will connect the Dean and Bergen streets.

489

01:45:08.020 --> 01:45:32.109

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Around the block, the Bergen Green Project proposes an 11-story mixed-use building with 111 affordable homes, and this project will use HPD's extremely low and low income affordable term sheet for households, earning a maximum of 80% AMI. But two-thirds of the homes will be affordable for households earning between 30 and 60% AMI.

490

01:45:32.150 --> 01:45:51.320

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): which is important. The project will also have passive house certification and energy efficiency design as well as an approximately 5,000 square feet of multi-use Cultural Arts and Recreation Community Center and 23 replacement parking spaces in the cellar for HPD inspection vehicles.

491

01:45:53.490 --> 01:46:05.120

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): The 1134 Pacific Street site will also be an HPD financed project. It is currently a vacant 13,000 square feet.

492

01:46:05.120 --> 01:46:23.990

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): a previously city-owned site. It was disposed by the city to the nonprofit Acacia in the 1980s to facilitate a rehab project, and in the past years HPD has been working with Acacia network that is, a social service provider and an affordable housing developer to reactivate the site.

493

01:46:23.990 --> 01:46:37.940

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): In AAMUP we included a site-specific acquisition and disposition actions to allow HPD to reacquire the site, remove a deep restriction that exists, and then transfer back to Acacia to build affordable housing.

494

01:46:37.970 --> 01:46:49.179

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): the same as the Bergen Green Project. It is also using the extremely low- and low-income affordability term sheet. So, it will serve households earning up to 80% AMI

495

01:46:51.260 --> 01:47:18.249

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): moving on to the 1110 Atlantic Avenue site. It is a 26,000 square feet lot that is owned by the city, but is leased by the New York City Transit Authority, and it is currently a cable repair shop and a storage adjacent to the Franklin Shuttle. The City is proposing an acquisition and disposition to allow for future redevelopment, and we're currently in discussions with the MTA about affordable housing potential on-site.

496

01:47:20.220 --> 01:47:37.980

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): and the last one is the 457 Nostrand Avenue site that is a 30,000 square feet parking lot owned by the Department of Education, and it's adjacent to the Brooklyn Adult Learning Center. The learning center will remain and we're exploring the redevelopment only of the parking lot

497

01:47:37.980 --> 01:47:51.379

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): we're proposing. The city is proposing a rezoning to R7-2 and we included also a disposition action to facilitate between 200-240 homes as well as a community facility space. That will

498

01:47:51.530 --> 01:48:08.870

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): serve the New York City public schools. We have also been working closely with the Landmark Preservation Commission. Given that the site is within the Bedford Historic district and the Brooklyn Adult Learning Center is a landmark. So any future project will have to go through LPC Design Review.

499

01:48:09.810 --> 01:48:34.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): That's the first bucket of creating new affordable housing and then moving on to the second bucket of strategies, preserving affordability and preventing displacement and harassment are major goals for AAMUP. Here I want to highlight some key tenant protection initiatives, first partners in preservation, which is an HPD new anti-displacement program that committed 3 million dollars

500

01:48:34.510 --> 01:48:47.170

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): to fund local center booking, community-based organizations to combat landlord harassment and support tenant organizing and coalition buildings in rent regulated and at-risk buildings.

501

01:48:47.190 --> 01:49:07.670

120 Broadway Hearing Room: There's also been a big call for legal services that we heard throughout the community engagement to hold landlords accountable. So the anti-harassment Tenant Protection program got a 7 million of funding restored for legal services to address housing violations, harassment eviction proceedings and affirmative cases. This happened through city of Yes.

502

01:49:07.670 --> 01:49:31.290

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): But even though this funding has been restored, we're also exploring additional possibilities for more funding. And finally, we have also partnered with CBOs and elected officials throughout the AAMUP engagement to have organized. Know your rights trainings and housing resource fairs, and there is an upcoming series that we're going to have in Spring 2025, with classes on topics like housing connect and tenant rights.

503

01:49:32.910 --> 01:49:44.929

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): And now, finally, AAMUP's goal is also to prevent displacement of low-income homeowners that are at risk of deed, theft, and scams, which is something that we also heard a lot

504

01:49:44.930 --> 01:50:06.400

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): from people coming to our workshops and other challenges, also navigating homeownership and the key strategies here to achieve this are the City's renewed commitment to invest 10 million dollars for the homeowner help desk Citywide, which includes AAMUP. And this is a one-stop shop for homeowners facing foreclosure, tax liens, debt, theft, and any maintenance issues.

505

01:50:06.400 --> 01:50:09.019

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): and we partner with local CBOs

506

01:50:09.090 --> 01:50:32.649

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): to provide the support, and we also recently relaunched the Home Fix Program that offers low or no interest home repair loans serving three times as many households as before, for up to 450 per year, and finally, we also hold events and classes for homeowners in that upcoming Spring 2025 series. We will have a class specifically to talk about deed theft.

507

01:50:33.790 --> 01:50:41.159

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): And I think that's me, that's everything. Thank you so much for your time, and we're here to answer any questions. Great. Thank you very much. Let me start with Commissioner Benjamin.

508

01:50:41.650 --> 01:50:47.370

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Great. Thank you very much. Let me start with Commissioner Benjamin.

509

01:50:47.770 --> 01:51:01.140

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): I'm pleased to see HPD's efforts, and moving forward in conjunction with the rezoning, and plan to plan for the sites that would have city supported housing. But I'm curious about three things. The first is in the Atlantic Avenue

510

01:51:01.280 --> 01:51:03.370

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): MTA project,

511

01:51:03.720 --> 01:51:15.440

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): How far along is the MTA in their planning for where they would relocate. It's difficult to relocate

512

01:51:15.870 --> 01:51:19.250

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): heavy duty industrial uses.

513

01:51:19.380 --> 01:51:24.110

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): So I'm wondering where and how that's going to happen.

514

01:51:27.810 --> 01:51:28.500

120 Broadway Hearing Room: [Inaudible]

515

01:51:28.800 --> 01:51:56.080

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): I think, yeah, we're definitely talking to MTA about that. I know they recently, I think MTA recently announced that they picked a new location somewhere in East New York, I believe, for those relocations in one of their public hearings, but I think in terms of - that's as far as they've gotten, I think, in terms of what the next steps are. But we can definitely follow up with what they're...

516

01:51:56.720 --> 01:52:05.870

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Okay, because that also involves what the timeline would be for any relocation there and when we're looking at even being able to start construction on housing. So I'd be interested in that information how far along they are, and as a result, what the build year might be for the affordable housing.

517

01:52:06.260 --> 01:52:18.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): and in the first site which was disposed of in 1987. The 4 story vacant building. Why has nothing been done on that site

518

01:52:19.140 --> 01:52:23.920

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): since 1987, almost 40 years ago?

519

01:52:25.600 --> 01:52:54.469

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): Commissioner, and we have our representative from Acacia to help answer.

520

01:52:54.998 --> 01:52:57.640

120 Broadway Hearing Room (David Almonte – Acacia): I'm David Almonte, Director of Development for Acacia, and that site has gone through a number of iterations of development, and we haven't been able to kind of, you know. get through the process. HPD, there was one time where we had another proposal, and HPD's timeline and funding was not available.

521

01:52:58.190 --> 01:53:02.810

120 Broadway Hearing Room (David Almonte – Acacia): And so, you know, we landed here.

522

01:53:03.210 --> 01:53:26.149

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): So what was the original proposal? From 1987, if you know?

523

01:53:26.150 --> 01:53:37.910

120 Broadway Hearing Room (David Almonte – Acacia): There was initially, we operate shelters as well as a nonprofit, and we were proposing to, because the site was initially or was operated as a shelter from the previous developer, the previous owner. We were going to put in another shelter in there and we were....

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): A long-term shelter or an overnight short term shelter?

524

01:53:37.910 --> 01:53:46.840

120 Broadway Hearing Room (David Almonte – Acacia): Along-term shelter, and we were asked not to, because the Armory is across the street. And so, you know, the proposed development grew. and this is what we're proposing now.

525

01:53:47.110 --> 01:53:55.760

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): And the financing is available again? What kind of start date would we be looking for and build year

526

01:53:55.990 --> 01:53:59.050

120 Broadway Hearing Room Commissioner Benjamin): on this site which has clearly had some issues.

527

01:53:59.170 --> 01:54:28.810

120 Broadway Hearing Room (David Almonte – Acacia): We are. We will be ready for development at the end of the year or early next year, from a design standpoint from a funding. Yeah, the funding HPD can talk about that.

528

01:54:28.810 --> 01:54:44.769

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): Good morning, Commissioners. So thank you for that question. You know UlURP is the first part of this. So we're glad that we're laying the the ground for us to kind of get to the next part, which is financial closing. So we'll be working with, you know, Acacia to get them ready. There are multiple things that you know, kind of need to come into order here, various

529

01:54:44.770 --> 01:55:08.799

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): funding sources. The city also has a limited capital budget, and we prioritize projects on an annual basis. So you know, this site, being part of a neighborhood study, brings it to the higher up on our list. And so we're committed to working with them to bring these units online as soon as we can.

530

01:55:12.990 --> 01:55:21.350

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): What kind of horizon are we looking at for the are we talking about them being able to

531

01:55:22.070 --> 01:55:40.870

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): close in? FY 27? Are we, what is the horizon we're talking about for the financial closing? Can they, can acacia hold together the private part of their financing that long? Or are we looking at

532

01:55:41.330 --> 01:55:53.260

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): sustained period of working and reworking the financing in order to make ELLA work on this site with the resources available and the other projects that may be considered.

533

01:55:53.770 --> 01:56:03.999

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): No, I think I think you know you're asking a great question. Unfortunately, you know, we can't commit to a specific closing timeline. You know we work with.

534

01:56:04.000 --> 01:56:28.359

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): aside from city owned sites. We have a number of other private sites that HPD is subsidizing as well. So you know this is a very long pipeline. I can't give like a fiscal year commitment to when that would be. But just noting that this would be a priority site for us, and we hope to, you know we would hope to close this as soon as we can.

535

01:56:28.360 --> 01:56:44.599

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): You know the ELLA pipeline is, you know, pretty large, and that's something that, you know, we can continue to come back and provide updates on as these projects get closer to that stage, and you know, provide those updates.

536

01:56:47.380 --> 01:56:51.290

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): And if they don't close with ELLA in a certain period of time.

537

01:56:51.730 --> 01:56:58.529

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): are they just put into the next years, or do they go back to the beginning and all the financing is reworked?

538

01:57:00.797 --> 01:57:15.210

120 Broadway Hearing Room (David Almonte – Acacia): Typically it gets pushed to the next year. You know the project, because we would have completed a number of you know, work.

539

01:57:15.210 --> 01:57:38.490

120 Broadway Hearing Room: you know, to get us ready for closing, like the design, getting DOB approvals, et cetera, and then we would just push it to the to the next year when HPD is ready to close.

540

01:57:38.530 --> 01:57:45.599

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): And you okay, my last question, thank you for your forbearance. Is you mentioned a number in the preservation of units and housing. You mentioned a number of preservation efforts for one to four family homeowners, but for

541

01:57:46.560 --> 01:58:07.650

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): building owners that own bigger buildings, which may have more violations and more problems, and particularly in neighborhoods that have suffered in the past from redlining and other things. The owners may not be able to obtain the kind of financing, to deal with the violations and problems that may exist that

542

01:58:08.950 --> 01:58:25.700

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): would allow them to keep this, what is affordable housing online. Are there any programs? And has HPD been looking at how to help those kind of owners of properties that may be in distress, but which you want to, we want to preserve.

543

01:58:26.970 --> 01:58:45.869

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Thank you for that question. This is something that has come up before to look at the preservation strategies. As you said, not only for small homeowners, but other buildings. And we're definitely looking into this. And we're working with our preservation teams at HPD to see what else we can include in terms of like preservation

544

01:58:46.030 --> 01:58:49.639

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): for a broader set of buildings. So thank you for that. And we can definitely get back to you on what...

545

01:58:49.920 --> 01:59:18.120

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): I would appreciate that, because, particularly in this neighborhood, there are a number of structures that are 5 to 12 units that would not be included in your preservation efforts. But it would be good to know that we could help those people and preserve those units. Thank you.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you, Commissioner Rampershad?

546

01:59:18.120 --> 01:59:30.129

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Rampershad): Thank you for the presentation. Questions for HPD - I believe it's slide 10 and 12 where you're talking about the homeowner help desk the $9.85 million. Can you? Two things. Can you tell me how community outreach is done, and also how many staffers would be dedicated to helping those?

547

01:59:30.400 --> 01:59:53.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Specifically, I don't know the number of staff members. I know that this is a partnership with the Center for New York City neighborhoods, and that they collaborate with local CBOs. So this is like a staggered approach. We have staff at HPD. Then we work with the Center for New York City Neighborhoods, and then the outreach is done by local CBOs. I can get back to you on the number of staff specifically if that's the question.

548

01:59:53.670 --> 02:00:02.340

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Rampershad): So getting back to the outreach, do you guys reach out. Besides, on your website, do you reach out to local community boards, local civics? What's the what's the? I guess the process typically?

549

02:00:02.410 --> 02:00:28.739

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Yeah. The. I know that there is the one-on-one counseling is one of the biggest features for the homeowner help desk, because the idea is that people can come and have one person directly talking to you, and like troubleshooting, whatever that you're like, you need help with. The canvassing, I know that, besides working with the local CBOs. I can get more information on how the specific how that looks.

550

02:00:36.760 --> 02:00:38.609

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Commissioner Mann?

551

02:00:40.090 --> 02:01:02.150

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Thanks for the presentation and the updates on the affordable housing strategy. And again, just want to echo Commissioner Benjamin. It's great to see the department coordinating closely with HPD. I just had a couple of questions on some of the sites, I think, when the application was certified, there was a few sites that were analyzed in the EIS as potential development sites that weren't included in disposition actions at public sites, and I asked about then I don't think

552

02:01:02.460 --> 02:01:25.049

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): there was a follow up there, so I just wanted to probe a little bit. One of them, in particular, was a surface parking lot owned by the City of New York on Atlantic Avenue, which seems to me at least worth, including as a disposition action. And then, maybe later on, as DOE figures out what its long-term plans are hopefully affordable housing. So, I wanted to understand? Kind of where a couple of those sites stood.

553

02:01:26.480 --> 02:01:37.110

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): Sure. Thank you for that question, Commissioner. So, I believe that those are referencing. Two Department of Education sites, one on

554

02:01:37.696 --> 02:01:45.540

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): Carlton Avenue and Atlantic. Yeah, and another further to the east by Brower Park. Yeah, on New York Avenue and Prospect Place.

555

02:01:46.025 --> 02:01:56.529

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): Unfortunately, I don't believe we have much of an update to share. We know that that's kind of wrapped up in larger conversations with City Hall and efforts

556

02:01:56.780 --> 02:02:00.660

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): by the Council Members to kind of unlock those types of opportunities.

557

02:02:00.670 --> 02:02:21.310

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): But at the moment we're just, we're still exploring those. We're not including them in our land use application.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Right. I guess I think what I'd hoped for was that those would be included. So we have to avoid a future land use action which adds to the delay for housing development on these projects. And so it's a little, I'd say, disappointing to not see that in this application.

558

02:02:21.310 --> 02:02:37.260

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): to me. I think the logic of it is, it doesn't preclude the city from continuing to use it as a parking lot, if that is the highest and best use, but it allows for the opportunity for affordable housing. So I was hoping to see that come together in some form. On the MTA site, can we just talk about that a little bit? So it's

559

02:02:37.600 --> 02:02:56.200

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): split MTA and City of New York with the MTA leasing the City of New York piece of it. Did I get that right in terms of ownership?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): I'll let HPD respond, but I just want to really quickly clarify for the record, so the two DOE sites - one of the reasons why those aren't included is because they're actively used

560

02:02:56.794 --> 02:02:59.280

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): today. So one is a

561

02:02:59.580 --> 02:03:03.500

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): a special needs school. The other is a

562

02:03:03.560 --> 02:03:30.519

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): I believe, like an annex, and has it so. So I just wanted to...

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): No, understood. I think the point I was making is that it's a 1 story building along Atlantic Avenue that's city owned with surface parking lot on Atlantic Avenue, and that, including a disposition action, would in the future allow the city to rethink that site when it could find an alternative location for DOE and avoid the additional year and a half of processes to do that.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff- DCP): Understood. But we'll definitely get back to you.

563

02:03:31.470 --> 02:03:41.180

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): And yes, the specifics of the MTA site is that it is City-owned, but it is part of the City Master Lease, that the MTA leases from the city.

564

02:03:41.220 --> 02:04:05.259

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Got it. So, the entire site is City-owned?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Yes, that exactly. And then to the to the left of Pacific Street in that slide. That is an MTA owned site.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Sorry, that's what I was trying to get at. So just so I'm clear. So the city owned portion is the MTA cable and repair shop and storage?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Exactly.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): And the piece along Atlantic Avenue?

565

02:04:06.030 --> 02:04:34.510

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz -HPD): That's also that's ours.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): That's also city owned.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Yes, everything that is like in the in the diagram with the higher...

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): And then the MTA control piece of the site?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): It's to the right of like towards in between Pacific and Atlantic, between Franklin, the Franklin Shuttle and Franklin Avenue, that other piece...

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Which is immediately adjacent. Just immediately to the East. You're saying, yes, and what use is on that site today?

566

02:04:34.510 --> 02:04:41.580

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): Oh, yeah, the other MTA owns. Oh, oh.

567

02:04:41.820 --> 02:04:59.380

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): the MTA own lot. Yeah, I think they're using it for parking just surface parking right now. Storage?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Yeah. So familiar line of questioning. Probably. Have you all had a conversation with the MTA about releasing some of its parking along Atlantic Avenue here in Franklin and folding that into a development site that would make it.

568

02:04:59.750 --> 02:05:18.230

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): You know, these are all ongoing conversations. MTA, we've definitely MTA definitely shared some interest in figuring out what to do on that lot.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Okay. But is there an action in this package that would allow for the city to develop that as affordable housing if the MTA were to comply?

569

02:05:18.360 --> 02:05:38.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jesse Hirakawa – DCP): I'm being told it would go through the GPP process so technically not part of ULURP. So no, there is no action currently as part of it. Besides rezoning...

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): No, and sorry for interrupting. I guess the question is, is there an acquisition action that would be needed? If the MTA were to say “Hey, City of New York, we'd love to give you a surface parking lot to make an affordable housing site more squared off”

570

02:05:40.359 --> 02:05:52.590

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): So the MTA intends to have a separate RFP for that site like they have their own. They let pro, because it's state it's owned in fee by them. So that that's what they've

571

02:05:52.870 --> 02:06:05.440

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): they've indicated to us. As part of a POA. There we may include something about type. But MTA’s expressed interest in having that be kind of a separate

572

02:06:05.590 --> 02:06:06.910

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): separately developed.

573

02:06:07.520 --> 02:06:31.450

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Okay, yeah, I mean, I'm sure the MTA has its own logic. I guess I, from my perspective, have a hard time seeing the logic of two separate City or public RFPs adjacent to one another, and not a huge area. But it just seemed like from an efficiency standpoint. We want to figure out, what does the MTA need? What does the City of New York need? How do we do one RFP and have a contiguous development site? That makes some sense because it's going to take forever. Otherwise.

574

02:06:32.203 --> 02:06:41.586

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): So we just encourage that conversation with the Mta. Just again traveling along this sort of City/State collaboration

575

02:06:42.400 --> 02:06:44.140

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): sidewalk for a second.

576

02:06:44.290 --> 02:06:46.380

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): So it's great to see the ESD

577

02:06:46.740 --> 02:06:56.600

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): participating. It's nice to again see the City and State collaborating on some of these affordable housing. It's a question. I asked that certification again as well. Again, the biggest public

578

02:06:56.780 --> 02:06:59.809

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): portable housing site opportunity here is Atlantic Yards,

579

02:07:00.349 --> 02:07:09.939

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): which continues to be a vacant site at the corner of Atlantic and Vanderbilt. So I'm just. I'm curious if there is any part of this process that is helping to nudge

580

02:07:10.230 --> 02:07:15.380

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): some resolution around a vacant train yard sites. And and what's what the status of that is.

581

02:07:15.720 --> 02:07:23.580

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Yeah, I don't have an update on that. The conversations with ESD have been

582

02:07:23.870 --> 02:07:39.400

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): focused on the 1024 Fulton collaboration, and like figuring out the financing between HPD and the State. So I know that Atlantic Yards has come. A couple comes up a couple of times. But this is not something that we're like actively collaborating with the State.

583

02:07:39.670 --> 02:07:40.080

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Yeah.

584

02:07:40.710 --> 02:08:06.239

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Okay? Again, you know, there's some opportunities here. It seems like to make this a little bit more again to strengthen a lot of the work you've already done. And again, I'm appreciative that there's as much energy has been spent on focusing on all of these sites and getting really granular with them. It seems like on the MTA collaboration on the ESD collaboration and then also on the DOE collaboration to think about long term. These sites. So it doesn't take, you know, 20 years to get some of these sites unlocked, but more near term.

585

02:08:06.300 --> 02:08:18.539

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): So I think those are my questions for HPD, I'm going to come back on DOT, but I want to.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick):Now would be the time before we go into the public testimony. So if you have a question for DOT, I think they are here to answer a question. Is that correct?

586

02:08:18.920 --> 02:08:20.050

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): DOT?

587

02:08:20.600 --> 02:08:43.149

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Jonah Rogoff – DCP): Let me confirm. Yes, I was just saying they were planning to testify separately.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Oh, okay, so we'll wait. We'll wait till that. Okay, thank you. And we're going to get to public comments in a moment. Commissioner Osorio, go ahead.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you. Chair. Thank you so much to all of you. I want to express again something I had said before, which is

588

02:08:43.280 --> 02:09:00.160

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): building on what my colleagues have said, but also having been part of the tour, the briefing that you did, and seeing how you present your different strategies as a comprehensive plan is encouraging and it's important. I also want to commend the Department.

589

02:09:00.160 --> 02:09:16.079

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): We're taking on something that you know. It's we know it's complex and in many different ways necessary. So thank you for that. I just wanted to quickly - at the review session we had a chance to discuss with the Department of City Planning some of the industrial retention components of this.

590

02:09:16.080 --> 02:09:45.110

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): So, I want to focus really quickly on some of the very specific housing questions. So for HPD, I'm wondering if you know what are your thoughts on the proposed MIH 3.5 option that has been put forth by the Community Board, and by, echoed by the Borough President, I mean would love to hear your response, you know, at this point, but also explicitly, I want to understand if this is going to be fully analyzed in the FEIS.

591

02:09:45.180 --> 02:09:57.410

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): I would expect to see sort of like that really been taken seriously, just to understand, you know, the feasibility of it, but also so like the financial potential implications for this.

592

02:09:57.930 --> 02:10:15.159

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): Yes, thank thank you, Commissioner. So modifying the MIH options is not part of the scope of this rezoning and study, however, you know, with the City of Yes, option, MIH option 3. The you know,

593

02:10:15.330 --> 02:10:31.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): is available to be mapped on its own. You know. The city can consider that and support that if that is the preference. And you know, I would just say that the various MIH options that you know are part of the text

594

02:10:31.210 --> 02:10:54.790

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): were put together after a lot of you know, study on market conditions, financial feasibility. The general idea is, you know, the higher AMIs come along with higher number of overall units to cross subsidize the deeper affordability. So you know, that's you know what we have

595

02:10:54.940 --> 02:10:59.721

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): right now. The tools? We also have other tools to help.

596

02:11:00.690 --> 02:11:23.930

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Aleena Farishta – HPD): you know, fund affordable housing like 485x and other tools overall. So you know, we're we hear, like the concerns just noting where we're at right now with the process.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you. I just want to go back to your response. Thank you. And I appreciate that you're you sharing your thoughts at this point, because, you know, you're just, I guess, analyzing some of what is

597

02:11:23.930 --> 02:11:35.230

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): actually being shared with you. But on the on, this being outside of the Scope of Work, are you referring outside of the impact study? Is that what you're saying like outside of the CEQR the scope of CEQR.

598

02:11:35.230 --> 02:11:48.050

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Because I would argue the opposite. Well, just just to clarify. What I mean is, I think, that there could be an opportunity because also of the specific conditions of this community

599

02:11:48.050 --> 02:11:59.630

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): to consider that level of analysis within your final EIS, I wouldn't necessarily think. And maybe you could explain to me, if I'm wrong, why, this would be outside of scope.

600

02:12:01.350 --> 02:12:28.300

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): So I'll just say that as MIH is a citywide policy...

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Fair enough.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): ...and I don't think we yet have the tools or capability to modulate based on very micro local neighborhood financial considerations. I do want to echo the City of Yes change to the standalone, deep affordability, which is a great new tool that we have and is an option here, and we've heard loud and clear from the

601

02:12:28.300 --> 02:12:31.899

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): Community Board about deep affordability as a goal.

602

02:12:31.900 --> 02:12:59.659

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): And I would just note that in addition to the public sites, we are going to go well above and beyond MIH in total and can reach significantly deeper affordability on public sites.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): I agree with you on all of that, and I appreciate the clarification in terms of you know, thinking about or redesigning MIH as a whole. Given exactly how you framed it, it's just that I think that in terms of the actual

603

02:12:59.730 --> 02:13:29.029

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): proposal and the scope of the of what has been what is under review right now. There's nothing that prevents, I think, us to fully analyze. You know, what would that level of or that configuration could actually sort of like look like? I think it would be important to just in any case fully address that recommendation. It sounds to me that it shouldn't be taken sort of like lightly. It's I think it's needed. And the way in which I interpret the recommendations that have been forth is that

604

02:13:29.620 --> 02:13:50.050

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): the current MIH framework is not responding to the needs of this community. And that's what I'm hoping that can be fully analyzed in terms of, you know, FEIS.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): Well, I'll definitely check with our counsel and Environmental Review divisions. I will note that the underlying concern that was also raised by HPD. Is that

605

02:13:50.210 --> 02:13:59.261

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DPC): there is a financial feasibility, and it's also tied to the property tax, the state level 485x previously. 421a. That if

606

02:13:59.820 --> 02:14:18.979

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): you know, the MIH requirements go too far, you're limiting new development completely. And I think that's just an overall concern as well. So there's the technical scope question. But there's also just the feasibility and just want to put that out there for the public discourse as well.

607

02:14:18.980 --> 02:14:47.049

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you. I thank you for that. I have another question that has to do with recommendations primarily again from put forth by the CB 8 on providing additional tenant legal representation, but also the creation of the tenant displacement, registry and housing preference program. I want to understand. What are your initial thoughts on this? Is this something that you're considering, something that we can again see fully analyzed in the FEIS, or as part of.

608

02:14:47.380 --> 02:15:16.540

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): And before you respond, Commissioner, let's put out all your questions. Now let's give them a chance to respond. We've got to get to the public. If you have others, let's put them out now, so they can do them all together, if you don't mind.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Absolutely. Thank you. So, in terms of this is, I think, more of a question for the Department on open space. I commend you on being creative in terms of creating this new incentive. I think that this can go a very long way. But in addition to incentivizing the private sector to create additional open space, and given the fact that you know, despite

609

02:15:16.540 --> 02:15:24.719

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): the proposal, doesn't, is not expected to result in a reduction in open space. This area of the City is way below the standard of open space.

610

02:15:24.720 --> 02:15:46.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): you know, per inhabitant. So I'm wondering if you can clarify what are the actual commitments, City commitments, to increase the open space system over here. Then, in terms of the sustainability measures, I'm wondering if you know again, commend HPD, for maximizing energy efficiency in your developments. But I'm wondering

611

02:15:46.920 --> 02:16:03.720

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): in terms of the larger the new buildings. Whether or not we're going to be requiring the same energy standards. And then, finally, in terms of economic development, I just wanted to make sure that, or ask if there's going to be a response specific response to the.

612

02:16:03.720 --> 02:16:23.219

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): you know, 12 plus recommendations that are being put forth associated with guaranteeing public resources to support potential displacement of businesses. I know that this is something that we talked about on Monday, but I'm wondering if there could be a response in terms of, you know, from the City's point of view, not just the Department.

613

02:16:23.220 --> 02:16:40.070

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): What is actually being considered great?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chari Garodnick): Thank you, Commissioner. So we had the 1st question, plus open space sustainability measures and displacement of businesses. So you guys can be the quarterback and decide which agency is best for each. And then we're going to move to two Council Members that are waiting right now to testify. Thank you.

614

02:16:40.299 --> 02:17:05.000

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Thank you for your questions. The first one about the increased legal representation for tenants. As we said, thanks to City of Yes, we got part of the funding back 7 million dollars, which is a lot. And this is something that CB 8 has called for directly, specifically for the anti-displacement program to come back. So beyond that, we're exploring a little bit more, like if there is any opportunity,

615

02:17:05.000 --> 02:17:25.119

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): is to have resources for AAMUP, which is part of the question just like this is fine citywide. But what are the resources here, and we're actively exploring what else we can do. Also understanding that that 7 million commitment is a huge step forward that's on one side and on the other side for the

616

02:17:25.180 --> 02:17:35.510

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): I think you're referring to the risk of displacement registry that they also proposed. This is something that I know that it came up in certification, too, and that we explained the

617

02:17:35.530 --> 02:17:52.679

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): limitations that we have as a City in terms of community preferences, community preference being a challenge on the basis of fair housing laws.

And this is something that would like align with that like answer. This is something that would be at the micro level they want that their right of

618

02:17:52.680 --> 02:18:14.959

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): return kind of for that community. So we have the same limitations there. But it's something that we're taking seriously all the CB 8 conditions and also the BP conditions. We're thinking about this as we move towards the points of agreement stage. So this is something that we're analyzing and being able to give like a response on why, yes or not.

619

02:18:15.120 --> 02:18:29.259

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you. No, no, I'm just yeah. Thank you. I appreciate that. And then, just to not take more time here. But if you can provide additional your in writing, kind of what's your rationale in that regard, or the limitations that I would appreciate that.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Paula Diaz – HPD): Yes, for sure.

620

02:18:30.580 --> 02:18:43.329

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): And I think so. I'll just quickly respond on the open space and and definitely recognize the need for new and improved open spaces. Just want to call attention to the early investment in St. Andrews.

621

02:18:43.420 --> 02:19:06.040

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): existing open space, which is getting completely renovated. Over 24 million dollars have been allocated to that, and that work is underway. In addition, noting that the Community Board and both Council Members have identified open space improvements to existing open spaces that they'd like to see committed to as part of this. And we're working very closely with Parks Department

622

02:19:06.040 --> 02:19:31.490

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): and DOT on identifying potential capital allocations for those as well.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you just quickly. Those are improvements to existing open space...

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): That's correct.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): What about increasing the open space?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): So that I think that's actually, you know, part of the trade-off on public sites is between affordable housing and open space. I think we are working to try and balance that to maximize affordable housing

623

02:19:31.490 --> 02:19:48.800

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): on public sites and then reinvesting in existing open spaces. I like the private open space, the Plaza bonus is a new innovative tool. I think we're trying to see if that can be something that to implement as well for new open space.

624

02:19:48.800 --> 02:20:13.129

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): But again, there's kind of these trade-offs between public sites. And right now we're trying to maximize affordable housing on those.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): No, fair enough, fair enough, and I just warn you to be mindful about it and encourage you to do as much as possible, because increasing the density needs to go along with increasing all these other infrastructure requirements. Otherwise you're depriving a community that is already lacking open space.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): I'll also note at the Dean and Bergen site. Oh, is that okay?

625

02:20:13.130 --> 02:20:28.649

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): Great? The Dean and Bergen site that Hpd is working on has also identified some on-site open space improvements. We touched on that slightly, but that would act as an expansion of the existing Dean Park.

626

02:20:31.800 --> 02:20:35.839

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, thank you very much, Commissioner Marin?

627

02:20:36.560 --> 02:20:58.900

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Marin): Yes, thank you. I have more of a request than a question that's directed to HPD. And while not the focus of this proposal is directly related to the proposal Aleena mentioned cross-subsidization, and for a very long time that concept has been a theory or a concept that you can't grasp because there is no definitive amount or percentage that is

628

02:20:59.170 --> 02:21:16.490

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Marin): allocated to this concept of cross optimization. So if HPD can put something in writing that defines what their definition of cross optimization is that would be greatly appreciated. Because I know I have questions about it. Several Council Members have questioned this, and there's really not been a response provided. So if you can do so, I would appreciate it.

629

02:21:19.320 --> 02:21:21.580

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Great. Thank you very much, Commissioner Goodridge?

630

02:21:25.110 --> 02:21:34.170

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): I just wanted to follow up on Commissioner Osorio's question about the affordability. It's my concern as well. I know the area very well.

631

02:21:35.480 --> 02:21:41.679

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): I wrote this down. If MIH goes too far it limits new development. I just wanted a little bit more

632

02:21:42.110 --> 02:21:45.039

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): background about what that means.

633

02:21:46.390 --> 02:21:47.729

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): I think that was Joanna.

634

02:21:48.020 --> 02:22:13.849

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): I'm sorry. Okay, anybody can answer the question about MIH and the I think, Alex, I think Alex made the point before. Yeah, go ahead, Alex.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): So yeah. Fair question, the intent of and this goes to your question as well, which was about the necessity of market rate housing to cross, subsidize on-site affordable housing.

635

02:22:13.860 --> 02:22:40.339

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): You know part of the original financial analysis which was undertaken for MIH looked at Citywide basically market rents, as it relates to cross subsidy of affordable housing rents and in combination with property tax subsidies, then at that time was 421 a now 485x. There is this balance across the City

636

02:22:40.340 --> 02:23:10.209

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): that basically this financial study identified, which that there, because it's self subsidizing, there's a limited amount of housing either on the deepness of the affordability or the total unit count that can be cross subsidized on its own, which

is why, for, like public sites or HPD term sheets, they can go beyond that, because there is additional public subsidy. The concern is that without that additional public subsidy, we're

637

02:23:10.220 --> 02:23:28.820

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): asking the private market rate units to provide that if you go to certain higher levels of affordability. It just may not make sense to pencil out for new development. And then we just don't get any market rate housing. We don't get the affordable housing on the private sites, and that's the high-level concern.

638

02:23:30.507 --> 02:23:38.200

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): I have another question with this new Administration.

639

02:23:38.330 --> 02:23:50.180

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): Presidential administration. We are now looking at cuts, you know, from HUD, and that would affect that we're potentially right. We, for example, in the in the last week

640

02:23:50.450 --> 02:24:04.640

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): there were a lot of concerns about Section 8 not being paid, questions about privatizing certain governmental units, and I wonder if there's been any reconsideration about what it would look like.

641

02:24:04.770 --> 02:24:05.600

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): If

642

02:24:05.890 --> 02:24:17.680

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): on the Federal level, there are cuts, and that trickles down to very vital subsidies like Section 8 and other types of housing. You know, we're talking about eviction prevention. But

643

02:24:17.950 --> 02:24:21.290

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): there's also another sort of like elephant in the room that

644

02:24:21.490 --> 02:24:23.890

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): I don't think we've addressed, which is.

645

02:24:24.490 --> 02:24:37.990

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): you know, what happens where we have less people now, less people who are well, not less people, the same amount of people, even more, who were relying on certain funding sources that aren't there anymore. And this is the area where that would happen in.

646

02:24:38.100 --> 02:24:44.539

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): So I guess what I'm wondering is if there's any reconsideration to the deeper affordability just because of

647

02:24:45.340 --> 02:24:47.906

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): in the last month. Really?

648

02:24:48.620 --> 02:24:51.169

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): you know that people are extremely

649

02:24:51.570 --> 02:24:55.269

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): people. Were we already had a housing crisis. But

650

02:24:56.240 --> 02:25:05.860

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): you know, people are really worried, and they're looking at New York, which is already unaffordable. But you know they're looking at some kind of what

651

02:25:06.200 --> 02:25:08.549

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): resources we have here.

652

02:25:08.700 --> 02:25:23.430

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): And I mentioned this because we were talking about the Borough President's recommendation about eviction prevention. But I'm also thinking about other, you know, other types of safeguards that we can look at, and if that could be part of this project.

653

02:25:23.570 --> 02:25:32.960

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Alex Sommer – DCP): I share your concerns, and I think we'll get back to you on the relationship with the Federal, the Federal funding issues. I hear you.

654

02:25:33.240 --> 02:25:34.640

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Goodridge): alright. Thank you. Yeah.

655

02:25:35.240 --> 02:25:36.940

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you. Commissioner.

656

02:25:37.920 --> 02:26:01.960

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, thank you very much to all of you. We're now going to move to the next stage of our public hearing, and we're going to start with. We have 2 Council members who are signed up to speak, starting with Council Member Crystal Hudson on Zoom, followed by Council Member Chi Ose, also on zoom Council member Hudson. If you can hear me, and you are able to unmute yourself and join us, we look forward to hearing from you.

657

02:26:06.640 --> 02:26:11.650

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Sorry, I just was elevated to a panelist, so I missed

658

02:26:12.030 --> 02:26:14.120

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: you, called my name, and I miss anything else.

659

02:26:14.120 --> 02:26:18.179

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): I did. You are elevated and welcome. Good to have you here.

660

02:26:18.180 --> 02:26:38.189

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Thank you so much. Happy to be here. Thank you. Chair and commissioners. My name is Crystal Hudson, and I'm the Council Member for the 35th Councilmanic District, which includes the neighborhoods of Prospect Heights, Crown Heights, Fort Greene and Clinton Hill. I'm here today to testify on the Atlantic Avenue mixed use plan, also known as AAMUP.

661

02:26:38.230 --> 02:27:01.810

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: New York City, is facing an unprecedented housing crisis. Rental vacancy is at just 1.4%, and housing prices are at an all-time high. This crisis is fundamentally reshaping our communities. Families who have lived here for generations are being pushed out, due to rising costs and inadequate government support. That's why I've stood alongside my colleague, Councilmember Chi Osse, say throughout this process to advocate

662

02:27:01.810 --> 02:27:11.660

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: for this community-led, comprehensive rezoning plan each of our districts is unique. But we share a history challenges and priorities that must be reflected in this plan.

663

02:27:11.720 --> 02:27:31.759

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: AAMUP is the result of years of community advocacy. It has the potential to transform Atlantic Avenue and the surrounding area, turning vacant lots, self storage facilities and gas stations into a vibrant mixed use neighborhood with deeply affordable housing. I want to thank the community advocates who have spent a great deal of time discussing and improving on this plan.

664

02:27:31.870 --> 02:27:53.050

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: I'd also like to thank the City Council's land use staff, and the Department of City Planning for their work on ensuring AAMUP becomes a reality, and while I'm here to voice my support for this proposal. I do want to be clear that we still have more work to do to ensure this proposed plan meets the goals outlined in our community vision and priorities report and delivers crucial benefits for our communities.

665

02:27:53.250 --> 02:28:14.069

Hudson-01

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: First, that the community has been clear that AAMUP must go beyond the Mandatory Inclusionary Housing requirements, increasing the supply of deeply affordable housing through both new construction and stronger preservation investments. And we can do that by leveraging every potential city owned site in the area, including the Department of Education, sites at 457 Nostrand Avenue and 510 Claremont Avenue.

666

02:28:14.560 --> 02:28:31.219

Hudson-02

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: We must also expand resources for existing longtime tenants and homeowners to ensure they can remain in their homes without concerns of predatory practices. As this corridor develops. Most notably we must secure dedicated funding for legal support for tenants facing eviction or experiencing landlord harassment.

667

02:28:31.260 --> 02:28:52.400

Hudson-03

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Second, we must secure a fully funded commitment for a comprehensive redesign of Atlantic Avenue, one of the most dangerous corridors in the entire borough. We have a once in a generation, opportunity to make Atlantic Avenue safer for all road users. This commitment should include a clear timeline for establishing and finalizing the redesign scope, including a public engagement process and a clear commitment

668

02:28:52.930 --> 02:29:14.650

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: that would fund the largest project scope. We cannot add thousands of residential units to Atlantic Avenue without ensuring those new residents have a safe street to live on, and without improving side streets as well. Moreover, there are numerous parks and playgrounds in the community that are also in need of improvements, like Lowry triangle under Hill, plaza, Dean, playground and James Forten playground, and will see increased use

Hudson-04

669

02:29:14.840 --> 02:29:39.600

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: amid a large influx of new residents. Third, we must strengthen mixed use zoning to support local businesses, the arts and community spaces. AAMUP aims to create a diverse and vibrant mix of uses, including jobs, essential services, local retail, such as grocery stores, community facilities creative and cultural spaces and light industrial businesses. However, unlike the nearby special Gowanus mixed use district

670

02:29:39.600 --> 02:30:02.909

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: AAMUP, currently lacks the tools needed to ensure these outcomes. We should consider modifying the special mixed use incentive to more narrowly focus on these key uses for all or part of this corridor, and we must secure funding for programming and investments to provide light manufacturing, training and business development for prospective tenants and local residents who need training to work at these new businesses.

671

02:30:03.110 --> 02:30:10.589

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: I look forward to continuing our work together to bring much needed housing and public realm improvements to Central Brooklyn. Thank you for your time.

672

02:30:11.390 --> 02:30:27.840

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you very much. Council Member. We really appreciate your being with us, and also your incredible partnership. Throughout this process I have two questions for you, and then I'm going to see if my colleagues have any on the subject of Atlantic Avenue redesign.

673

02:30:28.100 --> 02:30:36.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): You noted that in your comments. Can you just give us a sense of what your vision looks like for that, or what some of your goals might be.

674

02:30:37.931 --> 02:30:41.369

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Specific to to the street improvements, or the.

675

02:30:41.370 --> 02:30:41.930

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Yes.

676

02:30:41.930 --> 02:31:08.799

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Okay, yeah, I think what we need is a safer Atlantic Avenue. We hear from constituents all the time about how scary it is to cross Atlantic Avenue. This is the only stretch of Atlantic Avenue that is, 6 lanes, whereas the rest of Atlantic Avenue, both to the east and west of this particular corridor is 4 lanes wide in terms of traffic lanes. And so, you know, we want to see a corridor

677

02:31:08.800 --> 02:31:30.749

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: that encourages and fosters more people to cross safely and comfortably across the neighborhoods of Crown Heights and Prospect Heights into Fort Greene and Clinton Hill. I think right now. Atlantic avenue really serves as a barrier and more of a of a border between those districts, those neighborhoods, than bringing them together.

678

02:31:32.170 --> 02:31:56.869

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, thank you. And on the subject of the non-residential uses and new development. Obviously, we're talking here about a mix of uses throughout the AAMUP area, and you, in your comments, made reference to a desire to ensure that there are some non-residential unit uses that exist here. Could you just help us understand what types

679

02:31:56.920 --> 02:32:02.889

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): of businesses and jobs you envision. When you say that.

680

02:32:03.350 --> 02:32:29.539

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Yeah, I mean, I think we're looking for more than just simply housing and retail. You know, we'd like to see a vibrant mix of uses and jobs that incentivizes arts, light, industrial community facility, space. There's so many great, you know, industrial light industrial businesses in the area already. And we want to make sure that that those uses are preserved and maintained. And that we can welcome more of them.

681

02:32:30.890 --> 02:32:31.970

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay. Thank you.

682

02:32:32.240 --> 02:32:32.800

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Thank you.

683

02:32:32.800 --> 02:32:34.680

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Question from Commissioner Benjamin.

684

02:32:35.340 --> 02:32:50.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Hi, Councilmember Hudson, thank you for all of your work and all of your comments, and, as you know, you're my Councilmember, so I particularly appreciate it. My question is about Grand Avenue and all of the automotive uses that are there.

685

02:32:50.270 --> 02:32:53.519

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Do you believe that those are

686

02:32:54.090 --> 02:33:05.730

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): activities that employ people in our community? And can they be incorporated into the aim up program designs? Or do they need to relocate.

687

02:33:06.380 --> 02:33:30.919

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: They definitely employ local folks. I've been in touch with many of the local businesses on that particular corridor, and I think there's a mix of interest there. Some people, some of those businesses are, you know, second and third generation auto mechanic businesses where the kids are interested in creating something new

688

02:33:30.920 --> 02:33:55.579

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: and not maintaining the business for much longer. Other ones, I think, would love to make sure that they can stay in the area. And so that's why we're pushing to ensure that there is support for the businesses that want to remain there, and we'll be doing some outreach work out of my office to make sure that people know and understand exactly what the rezoning means specifically to them as

689

02:33:55.580 --> 02:34:13.170

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: as property owners, that they're not required to sell, that they're not required to do anything, and that, you know, we want to make sure that we're supporting all the interests of those businesses, whether they're interested in building, housing or not.

690

02:34:15.190 --> 02:34:25.229

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): So you believe the plan that allows in many areas, 1st floor industrial would accommodate these types of uses.

691

02:34:26.750 --> 02:34:27.290

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Huh?

692

02:34:27.640 --> 02:34:30.430

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: So sorry. Can you repeat the question?

693

02:34:30.600 --> 02:34:31.120

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Yeah.

694

02:34:31.120 --> 02:34:44.920

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): in part of the plan in the district. The 1st floor is to be light manufacturing and then residential above, and you believe that zoning would accommodate these kind of automotive related uses

695

02:34:45.390 --> 02:34:48.970

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): so that they would have choices about the future.

696

02:34:49.540 --> 02:34:58.050

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Yeah, I mean, I don't think the automotive uses is included in the light. You know, industrial So

697

02:34:58.180 --> 02:35:02.900

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: I mean, it would really depend on the on the specific location.

698

02:35:04.460 --> 02:35:08.109

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Okay, thank you very much, and thank you for all of your work.

699

02:35:08.370 --> 02:35:08.950

xPH05 - *EO - Crystal Hudson: Thank you.

700

02:35:09.950 --> 02:35:10.920

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you, Commissioner.

701

02:35:11.750 --> 02:35:19.729

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you very much. Councilmember. We very much appreciate your joining us today. Good to see you and thank you again for all of your incredible partnership. Here.

702

02:35:22.340 --> 02:35:25.740

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): see you soon. Okay. Next up is Councilmember Chi Ossé.

703

02:35:25.990 --> 02:35:29.079

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Councilmember. Whenever you are ready. Glad to have you here.

704

02:35:29.080 --> 02:35:54.880

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: Thank you so much. Good afternoon, Commissioners, and good afternoon chair. Today, as you know, I'm testifying on the Atlantic Avenue mixed use plan. I cannot speak about this plan without 1st acknowledging the real housing crisis that severely impacts our city and the district that I represent. From 2010 to 2020 Bed-Stuy lost more than 22,000 black residents, and this number has likely increased.

705

02:35:54.880 --> 02:36:20.789

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: due to the strain of our housing crisis. Because of this it is key that we, as a city work, to apply all available tools to both build and increase our affordable housing stock, and ensure that residents and existing affordable housing can remain. Community rezonings, like AAMUP, are key to ensuring we not only meet our goal to bring more affordable housing, but they are also necessary to make sure our neighborhoods are holistically invested into

706

02:36:20.800 --> 02:36:48.470

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: for the past 3 years. My colleague, Councilmember Hudson, and I have advocated for a comprehensive rezoning plan that works for our communities, and I think the administration and the various agencies, including the Department of City Planning for working on this, rezoning with us while the existing proposal touches upon our need for affordable housing and investments. I want to use my testimony today to remind the Administration that we still need to do more to ensure this plan works for all of our neighbors along Atlantic Avenue.

707

02:36:48.470 --> 02:37:02.789

Ossé-01

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: First, it is imperative that the administration increases the amount of new affordable housing in the overall proposal. The community deserves to have every potential city owned site in the area examined for maximum development of deeply affordable housing.

708

02:37:02.970 --> 02:37:14.940

Ossé-02

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: We must also increase resources for HPD and our nonprofit partners to help long time tenants and homeowners securely remain in their existing affordable homes, safe from harassment and predatory practices.

709

02:37:14.940 --> 02:37:39.819

Ossé-03

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: Secondary. I asked the Administration to invest through AAMUP in our district's green and open spaces, including the Lefferts Place in Westbrook Memorial Community Gardens, Hancock and Potomac playgrounds, and the schoolyards for Ps. 3 and Ps. 93. I asked that the Administration considers bringing in more resources and infrastructure improvements to these spaces. Moreover, I hear and understand the concerns brought to me by the Lefferts Place

710

Ossé-04

02:37:39.820 --> 02:37:49.230

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: Block Association and the impacts of shadows on their community garden. I hope to work with the Administration on this issue, and look to consider solutions to mitigate this impact.

711

02:37:49.230 --> 02:38:14.499

Ossé-05

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: Thirdly, I urge the Administration to bring investments to improve the public realm at the Franklin Avenue station and the surrounding areas. According to the environmental impact study. The highest number of incremental subway trips is expected to occur at the Franklin Avenue, C/S Station, and with expected heavy usage of this station. It is key to ensure the aesthetics, sanitation, and public safety of the surrounding areas are met.

712

02:38:14.730 --> 02:38:27.760

Ossé-06

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: I urge the Administration to invest into supplemental cleaning services through the Department of Sanitation and Ace, to invest in social services through DHS and Phoenix House, along the Franklin Avenue corridors.

713

02:38:28.130 --> 02:38:51.719

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: or the Franklin Station corridors. I also urge the Administration to work with the MTA to bring structural improvements to the station overpass and the small MTA properties surrounding it, some of which are covered with barbed wire fences, graffiti and litter and system improvements for better train service. Finally, I want to reiterate that we cannot add thousands of housing units to the stretch of Atlantic Avenue. Ossé-07

714

02:38:51.720 --> 02:38:59.900

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: that a clear, fully funded commitment for a comprehensive redesign of this dangerous in Hospital Street as Council Member Hudson mentioned Ossé-08

715

02:38:59.900 --> 02:39:18.310

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: in principle, I believe we need community rezonings like a map to ensure we bring the housing and investments that are long overdue for our neighborhoods. But it is key to ensure this plan is one that truly works for everyone. I look forward to continuing my conversations with the Administration on this plan and building out a community rezoning. We can all be proud of. Thank you.

716

02:39:19.190 --> 02:39:37.519

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Great. Thank you very much, Councilmember, and thank you, too, for all of your partnership and collaboration here. I just want to one follow-up question about the Franklin Avenue station, and then I will see if there's any other questions for you. So you noted a variety of issues

717

02:39:37.590 --> 02:39:52.659

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): with the shuttle and sea station over there, cleaning safety structural all things that you cited putting, cleaning and safety aside just for a moment. Can you share with us a little bit about the

718

02:39:53.650 --> 02:40:05.549

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): the aesthetic issues that are present there, and what your vision is for this station, and also whether you've had any conversations with the MTA on that front.

719

02:40:05.720 --> 02:40:19.899

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: Absolutely. So we've had a walkthrough with the Administration as well as MTA in regards to some of the aesthetic problems of this specific site there is severe rusting on the overpass

720

02:40:19.900 --> 02:40:42.320

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: and the station as a whole in terms of the outer looks of the specific site. In addition to that, there's a blank wall that could yield to a promising mural, maybe with some assistance from DCLA. In addition to that, on this is a part of the overpass that creates a very dark

721

02:40:42.340 --> 02:41:00.599

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: corner on Franklin and Fulton, where there's a lot of public urination that takes place there. Not a lot of lighting. There's scaffolding there, in addition to more rusting, as I noted before, I know that MTA has

722

02:41:00.750 --> 02:41:26.849

xPH05 - *EO - Chi Ossé: done some renovations of this overpass in the past. This is a request that was made of the Lefferts Place Block Association, since they live very close to the station, and if there's any TLC that we can put into this specific area that will be impacted by this comprehensive rezoning would make both myself as well as many members of the community happy.

723

02:41:29.690 --> 02:41:35.639

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Okay, thank you, Councilman. We appreciate it. We appreciate your patience today and your being with us. So thank you again.

724

02:41:36.710 --> 02:41:44.919

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, let me move on to Dash Henley from the New York City Department of Transportation.

725

02:41:47.850 --> 02:42:12.350

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): Thank you. Chair Garodnick and Commissioners. Good afternoon. My name is Dash Henley, and I'm the Borough planner for the New York City Department of Transportation's, Brooklyn Borough Commissioner's office, and I've been the lead staffer helping out on this AAMUP effort. DOT is proud to be a part of the city's efforts to deliver thousands of new homes, more space for commercial and manufacturing businesses.

726

02:42:12.350 --> 02:42:19.560

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): and safer streets for all users. The agency encourages your support for the proposed rezoning and related actions.

727

02:42:19.590 --> 02:42:44.230

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): and DOT has been a partner with Department of City Planning, HPD, Parks, and others on these AAMUP efforts. For over 2 years now, whether it's been participating in workshops, contributing safety data and operational information, providing expertise on best practices or information on relevant and applicable past projects, and also giving advice on the range of possibilities to enhance

728

02:42:44.230 --> 02:43:07.449

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): street safety both within existing resources and with possible additional funding for traffic studies and capital projects. You know, we've met and will continue to meet with elected officials, partner agencies, community boards, working groups, steering committees from the public outreach and the general public

729

02:43:07.460 --> 02:43:34.439

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): and based on those conversations we've developed a series of street improvement projects that the Department of City Planning mentioned before which we also refer to as SIPS to be implemented this year as a down payment project which will begin to advance the street safety goals laid out in the AAMUP community vision and priorities report these early action items, target several intersections in the study area and will include proven measures from our toolkit

730

02:43:34.440 --> 02:43:59.079

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): which include painted curb extensions, enhanced crossings, markings, refreshes. Among other items, we think that this work will build off of work we've already done in the area which includes creating a protected bike lane this past year on Bedford Avenue, which was not only a priority project for us, but did fulfill one of the community.

731

02:43:59.080 --> 02:44:23.530

120 Broadway Hearing Room: report. The AAMUP community report requests and has shown enhanced safety for all road users. You know all of this work is a direct response to the urgent need for safety improvements along this corridor and in this study area. And we think that these down payments demonstrate DOT's commitment to the AAMUP planning process as DCP mentioned before, you know the current AAMUP

732

02:44:23.530 --> 02:44:46.670

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): proposal before the Commission does not include a redesign or any changes to traffic lanes on Atlantic Avenue. Right now, however, that does not preclude the city's consideration for long term improvements to be determined with a future funded traffic study that can be committed to as part of the points of agreement for this rezoning while it's under consideration by the City Council.

733

02:44:46.670 --> 02:45:02.179

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): you know. Lastly, DOT would like to reaffirm to the commission that a partnership with DCP now, in the future, and just thank you for your time, and happy to answer any questions. Thank you.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann) Thanks very much. I'm going to start with Commissioner Mann.

734

02:45:02.810 --> 02:45:32.070

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): Thanks for coming today to provide some thoughts on the rezoning, and thanks for your efforts to make this a safer set of intersections and streets, and it sounds like, you know, based on testimony of the council members. There's a very live conversation happening about the future of Atlantic Avenue that extends beyond the sips, so I'll let them. It seems like, continue to do their advocacy. I was just trying to understand the sequence of these things a little bit more in timeline, because, you know, if this rezoning is adopted, developers can go pull building permits

735

02:45:32.070 --> 02:45:44.859

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): that'll have implications for the sidewalk dimensions. If DOT comes back later on and decides well, we want to actually extend the sidewalk into the traffic lane, or, you know, significantly increase bulbouts. How does that coordination happen? So we're not

736

02:45:44.960 --> 02:46:01.719

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): using public resources in a way that would be could be better utilized by having developers build out a building pavement plan that reflects the dimension that as a city we prefer. So I'm just trying to understand how that coordination would happen. Given that we don't really have a

737

02:46:01.720 --> 02:46:27.349

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): permanent sort of strategy. Here we have a sort of interim strategy.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): Right. It definitely depends on the level of intervention. I think. You know, we've worked very closely with the Department of City Planning so far, and we'll continue to work on individual development projects. We have separate, you know, monthly meeting with all projects that we try to coordinate better on. So in the event that this goes through, and there are those projects we anticipate working with

738

02:46:27.350 --> 02:46:51.920

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): them on the individual development projects to see what the developer can do, what we can do in the short term, and how to coordinate with that with any future capital projects. That might be a little more long term.

120 Broadway Haring Room (Commissioner Mann): Yeah. So again, thanks for that feedback. This gets maybe just a larger point about the challenge of these efforts. I know when I had a chance to work on East New York rezoning. That was obviously a planning strategy with Atlantic Avenue

739

02:46:51.920 --> 02:46:59.940

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): proposal was baked into the rezoning framework, and there was a clear strategy around the streetscape and the development.

740

02:46:59.940 --> 02:47:08.269

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): And I would just encourage that continued focus earlier on these projects. So we don't have a kind of interim strategy that

741

02:47:08.280 --> 02:47:13.439

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): I think, as we heard from the council members in some ways fall short of what we're hoping to see here. So

742

02:47:13.500 --> 02:47:20.869

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Mann): just a little editorializing there. Thanks for listening.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): That's understandable. Thank you, Commissioner. Commissioner Osario, Commissioner Benjamin.

743

02:47:21.110 --> 02:47:48.219

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you. Chair. Thank you so much for being here. Dot has come up many times, and so we appreciate your testimony. Quick questions. I just wanted to give you a chance to respond some of the recommendations from the Borough President, I think there's particularly four very specific things you already hinted to a potential traffic study on the Atlantic Avenue corridor. But specifically, what is your preliminary response to the need for, or the recommendation to, the road diet to four lanes.

744

02:47:48.220 --> 02:48:07.820

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Two, pursuing commercial parking spaces and metered parking for non-commercial vehicles, the investments on Laurie Triangle. I'm wondering if you can expand a little bit on that. To what extent is there a solid commitment? And then, finally, the subway improvements. Can you respond now? Or if later, in writing whatever you prefer?

745

02:48:08.480 --> 02:48:32.820

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley - DOT): Sure you know, on the road diet itself, that's something that we can neither commit to right now, nor, you know, dismiss out of hand right now. That's something that we definitely need a traffic study for to look at. You know any possible changes there, and how those changes might affect that. But it is something that we can look into as part of a funded traffic study.

746

02:48:32.820 --> 02:48:57.459

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Is there like a timeline or something on that study? Is it considered right now, or is this something that you're hinting will be required?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): It's something that could be negotiated as part of the POA in terms of the timing of that and the funding amount. In terms of the second question on commercial parking and loading. That's something that we do sort of as a regular course of business we work with.

747

02:48:57.640 --> 02:49:22.449

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): you know whether it's individual locations of folks applying for loading zones. Or we look at corridors for that sort of thing. It's something we do in coordination with our parking unit and our freight mobility unit, and something that we have kept an eye on during this process. And it's something that the details of that could be worked out in the POA, too, of the specifics. But we think we could do that with existing resources

748

02:49:22.450 --> 02:49:46.580

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): and funding of fulfilling in some form that commitment in terms of Lowry Triangle. You know, that's something where we have already created somewhat of a new open space there, by closing that portion of Underhill to traffic and creating a plaza. That's sort of an extension

749

02:49:46.580 --> 02:50:11.170

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): of the triangle itself. And we're looking at further investments. In response to both the borough president's request and as well as the request, which was also in the community recommendations report. So that's definitely something we're focused on. And then in terms of the subway improvements. That's definitely, you know, something that's

750

02:50:11.360 --> 02:50:14.000

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): beyond our

751

02:50:16.250 --> 02:50:39.909

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): you know, direct investment involvement as DOT. But we are definitely interested in improvements to the Franklin Avenue station, and we understand what Councilman Osse brought up before that. We're, you know, when we're looking at the changes in this neighborhood, we do recognize that a lot of people will be induced to be walking north-south, whether it's

752

02:50:39.910 --> 02:50:57.530

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): from to and from Atlantic Avenue or past Atlantic Avenue up to the A and the C along Fulton. So that's something that we want to prioritize is making sure that folks can do that safely, and if there's any improvements that can be made there that we will support them as much as we can.

753

02:50:58.080 --> 02:51:00.710

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you, Commissioner Commissioner Benjamin.

754

02:51:00.890 --> 02:51:03.750

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Hi, thank you very much for your presentation.

755

02:51:03.960 --> 02:51:10.530

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): I also have questions about the Atlantic Avenue corridor, and whether the study you're doing

756

02:51:10.680 --> 02:51:21.520

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): will, since Atlantic Avenue. Let me preface it by saying, since Atlantic Avenue is a thoroughfare, one of the main ways that commercial vehicles can traverse

757

02:51:21.710 --> 02:51:27.910

120 Broadway Hearing Room Commissioner Benjamin): from the edge of Manhattan all the way to Long Island. Since they can't go on parkways.

758

02:51:28.510 --> 02:51:35.180

120 Broadway Hearing Room Commissioner Benjamin): I would hope that if you're looking at changing this, you're going to be looking at the whole corridor and not just this

759

02:51:35.260 --> 02:52:02.669

120 Broadway Hearing Room Commissioner Benjamin): six block long part of Atlantic Avenue. Is that correct?

120 Brodway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): That's correct. Yeah. And I think it's a good call out to mention that it is a through truck route that it does have the importance of. You know the limited network there, and that that is part of that network. And that's something that our freight mobility team has definitely flagged, that they want to be involved with. So it is something where we would look at.

760

02:52:02.670 --> 02:52:21.420

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): You know this sort of subsection, but also in the larger picture of you know how that network changes just beyond this small section as well.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Okay, because I know the borough president has been interested in a diet to 4 lanes. But I must say that in much of Atlantic Avenue the four lanes doesn't work very well.

761

02:52:21.420 --> 02:52:35.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): because there's a parking lane that's not included. But then the next lane always has trucks and other vehicles that are unloading, loading, and so in much of Atlantic Avenue it next down to one lane, one moving lane.

762

02:52:35.260 --> 02:52:44.109

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): During most of the hours that it exists. So, in looking at this, I would ask you to look at how the four lane

763

02:52:44.560 --> 02:52:46.380

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): is actually working.

764

02:52:47.000 --> 02:52:51.929

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): In reality, I mean, I would say the four lanes work much better in queens

765

02:52:52.360 --> 02:52:58.039

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): in the parts of queens where it exists than it it does in Brooklyn, where you have the

766

02:52:58.740 --> 02:53:03.340

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): railroad structure, and then you have the turn lanes

767

02:53:03.530 --> 02:53:26.100

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): underneath it. So in looking at, as I said, you said, and I appreciate that you're going to be looking at the whole corridor, not just this part of Atlantic Avenue, and also looking at it as a main transportation thoroughfare for trucks and other commercial vehicles, and last, but not least, once the study is complete. What would the process be

768

02:53:27.630 --> 02:53:35.050

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): if you decided to make significant or insignificant changes along Atlantic Avenue.

769

02:53:36.102 --> 02:53:37.550

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): In this vein.

770

02:53:37.740 --> 02:53:44.859

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): you mean, in terms of timeline?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): Both timeline public involvement. How would we come to know of it? Right?

771

02:53:45.030 --> 02:53:58.190

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): Yeah. In terms of timeline. If we were funded to do a traffic study, and if it was, you know, decided by the Administration that this was a priority, we could probably complete that, and

772

02:53:58.390 --> 02:54:22.830

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): between one and a half and 2 years, and that would give us proposals that we could then go back to the public. The elected officials, community boards, and all that, to issue a proposal in terms of actual implementation. After that it would be, it

would depend on whether it was an in-house project or a capital project. We could look at doing something where you know, there was an in-house project initially, and then a capital project

773

02:54:22.830 --> 02:54:29.160

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): after that. But the timeline would be very dependent on what the scope would be.

774

02:54:29.160 --> 02:54:33.600

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): and if you were changing the physical dimensions of what is the street, you would have to come back

775

02:54:34.760 --> 02:55:02.770

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Benjamin): through the ULURP process is that if you were demapping portions or mapping portions.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): I don't think that we would be looking at demapping any portions. It would just be changes to the street geometry, so that wouldn't involve a ULURP action. But it would involve the other notification requirements that we have of working with other city agencies and presenting to elected officials and community boards.

776

02:55:03.000 --> 02:55:16.529

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): And last, but not least, have you looked when you're doing this looking. Could you look at the possibility which has existed in other places, of pairing Atlantic Avenue with possibly Pacific or Dean.

777

02:55:16.870 --> 02:55:25.540

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): or and having perhaps other kinds of traffic, the bicycle traffic, etc, on those less thoroughfare streets

778

02:55:25.790 --> 02:55:33.330

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): in some type of a paired, so that the traffic on Atlantic would continue to be prioritized

779

02:55:33.330 --> 02:56:00.800

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Benjamin): for those that can't go elsewhere.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): Right. Yeah, it's definitely something we can look at. I know there's existing bike lanes on Dean and Bergen now, which we can look at how those work any changes that need to make there. That's something that's definitely come up in conversations, especially in relation to Atlantic Avenue. So that's something we can take a look at as part of it.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): Thank you very much. Yep. I look forward to hearing from you.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you. Thank you, Commissioner.

780

02:56:01.010 --> 02:56:09.479

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): and thank you, Mr. Henley. We appreciate your your time and your presence here.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Dash Henley – DOT): Absolutely. Thank you.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, let me move on to Brian Coleman.

781

02:56:09.660 --> 02:56:15.769

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): of the Greenpoint Manufacturing and Design Center, to be followed by Gib Veconi.

782

02:56:25.070 --> 02:56:27.230

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): Brian, are you able to unmute?

783

02:56:29.230 --> 02:56:30.390

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): Hi, there!

784

02:56:32.060 --> 02:56:58.760

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): Hi! I'm Brenda Lau! I'm the assistant project manager at GMDC. I'm just going to be sharing the testimony on behalf of Brian Coleman, who is the CEO of GMDC. So GMDC. Is the City's premier, nonprofit industrial real estate developer of affordable manufacturing space. GMDC has developed over 725,000 square feet of industrial space in Brooklyn and Queens for occupancy by small manufacturing businesses.

785

02:56:58.760 --> 02:57:14.240

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): We currently own and manage 7 buildings which are home to over 760 manufacturing jobs. Among 130 businesses. Our tenants include woodworkers, cabinet makers, display makers, metalworkers, and a variety of artisanal trades and artists.

786

02:57:14.300 --> 02:57:24.380

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): GMDC owns the multi-tenanted manufacturing center located at 1102 Atlantic Avenue, which runs block through to 1093 Pacific Street.

787

02:57:24.450 --> 02:57:48.779

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): In 2012 we bought the former auto parts building from an owner operator who initially had a total of 4 jobs in the building, including the 2 owners following renovation. It is now home to 8 small manufacturing businesses, with 60 workers between them, making an average annual salary of 54,587, which is well above typical retail and service salaries.

788

02:57:48.780 --> 02:57:55.599

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): and many of the small business owners and workers are also community residents in Crown Heights and Bed-Stuy

789

02:57:55.690 --> 02:58:22.599

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): GMDC appreciates the planning work that has gone into continuing to encourage modern manufacturing to flourish in the AAMUP area from the work of Community Board 8 and their M. Crown efforts to the support of the Department of City Planning. Recognizing that many of today's manufacturers are good neighbors to both residential and commercial uses. An example of what can be achieved in the AAMUP area is our latest project in Brownsville, Brooklyn, at 805 Rockaway Avenue.

790

02:58:22.600 --> 02:58:38.570

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): It is the 1st mixed use building in New York City to combine affordable housing and manufacturing space in one structure by safely separating the 2 uses through efficient and environmentally sustainable design. This project ensured the preservation of affordable housing.

791

02:58:38.650 --> 02:59:02.520

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): Excuse me, ensure the preservation of existing manufacturing uses on site, creating new jobs while also providing much needed affordable housing, and the success of this project was also due to the collaborative partnership between city agencies, such as DCP, DEP, HPD, and EDC. Which supported the mission. Driven commitments of nonprofit developers, such as GMDC. And our partner, the bridge

792

02:59:02.900 --> 02:59:27.840

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): public-private partnerships, can continue to create innovative projects such as 805 rockaway and traditional multi-tenanted industrial buildings, such as 1102 Atlantic Avenue. These buildings can continue to operate in the area, such as a good neighbor,

while also adopting new technologies and creative processes of the evolving and very important light manufacturing sector, and we hope the conversation can continue as rezoning moves through ULURP.

793

02:59:27.840 --> 02:59:33.980

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): so that these mixed use projects can incorporate industrial uses that may have a chance to develop in the future AAMUP area and bring

794

02:59:35.040 --> 02:59:37.539

xPH05 - 11 - Brian Coleman (GMDC): the good quality jobs. Thank you.

795

02:59:38.190 --> 02:59:39.480

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you very much.

796

02:59:39.620 --> 02:59:43.879

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): We appreciate it. Okay, Mr. Veconi, on zoom.

797

02:59:58.190 --> 03:00:09.879

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: I'm sorry. Good afternoon, everyone. Thank you for the opportunity to testify. My name is Gib Veconi. I am the chair of the Prospect Heights Neighborhood Development Council, and our mission is to

798

03:00:10.010 --> 03:00:14.439

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: promote a safer, more just and sustainable neighborhood.

799

03:00:15.570 --> 03:00:36.489

Veconi-01

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: since it's now possible to map mandatory inclusion, housing, option, 3 alone in a residential upzoning. We strongly believe options one and 2 should be dropped from the application in order to provide the greatest number of deeply affordable units in the rezoned area. Brooklyn Community District 3 experiences, one of the highest displacement rates in New York City.

800

03:00:36.490 --> 03:00:51.860

Veconi-02

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: We support Brooklyn Community Board, Eight's call for the Department of Housing, Preservation, and Development to create a new class of lottery preference to allow persons displaced from Community District 8. Preference for 50% of the affordable apartments created in buildings

801

03:00:51.860 --> 03:00:57.230

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: developed under AAMUP. Sorry I hadn't started my video, apologize.

802

03:00:59.440 --> 03:01:00.390

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: The proposed.

803

03:01:00.730 --> 03:01:01.070

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): That’s okay.

804

03:01:01.070 --> 03:01:16.969

Veconi-03

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: The proposed R7D zoning along Dean and Bergen Streets in Prospect Heights is not a strong fit with the surrounding context, permitting height even greater than the

Newswalk Building. At 535 Dean Street and the Peter F. Riley Storage Warehouse at 491 Bergen Street.

805

03:01:16.970 --> 03:01:31.459

Veconi-04

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: However, we support the creation of affordable housing for families and seniors on the HPD sites, located at 542 Dean Street and 516 Bergen Street, and are supportive of increasing density on those lots to R7D.

806

03:01:31.700 --> 03:01:43.700

Veconi-05

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: We also support R7D zoning for other lots in the rezoning area. If they were developed as 100% affordable housing, but all other lots should be zoned R6A. For context.

807

03:01:44.230 --> 03:02:04.200

Veconi-06

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: We support an incentive for creating open space in the special Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use district. But any such spaces created must be at least maintained and preferably owned by the department of parks and Recreation. Property owners that receive such an incentive must also provide funding for maintenance through an annual property tax assessment payable to DPR.

808

03:02:04.980 --> 03:02:20.500

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: The completion of the Atlantic Yards Project and the anticipated development resulting from the AAMUP rezoning will add more than 15,000 residents to the northern portion of Prospect Heights by 2035. This area already has a significant shortage of open space.

809

03:02:20.540 --> 03:02:49.349

Veconi-07

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: Atlantic Avenue between Flatbush Avenue and Bedford Avenue constitutes 19 acres of publicly owned land. Currently 80% of the 115 foot right of way is dedicated to through

travel of private vehicles and trucks. We suggest that at least 50% of the right of way should prioritize people and nature. While this might not generate a typical park, it can provide safe and healthy walking and biking environments for current and future residents and much needed curb. Infrastructure

810

03:02:49.910 --> 03:03:04.590

Veconi-08

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: DOT in coordination with the Department of City Planning should develop a district. Wide curb zone management, plan, prioritizing pedestrians and cyclists, street trees and rain gardens, as well as space for waste containers and loading zones. It should limit.

811

03:03:04.590 --> 03:03:05.170

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Time.

812

03:03:06.530 --> 03:03:11.769

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: It should limit private parking in front of buildings and minimize disruptive loading docks and driveways.

813

03:03:12.040 --> 03:03:12.970

xPH05 - 12 - Gib Veconi: Thank you.

814

03:03:14.050 --> 03:03:17.079

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thanks, Mr. Veconi. We appreciate your being here with us.

815

03:03:17.300 --> 03:03:25.710

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, next up is Toby Hyde, followed by Alex Maza and Antonio Alvarez.

816

03:03:26.710 --> 03:03:28.000

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Mr. Hyde.

817

03:03:28.150 --> 03:03:29.749

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Whenever you are ready.

818

03:03:40.920 --> 03:03:42.850

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): Toby, are you able to unmute.

819

03:03:43.650 --> 03:03:45.189

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: Good afternoon. Can you hear me?

820

03:03:46.170 --> 03:03:47.150

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): We can.

821

03:03:47.150 --> 03:04:11.630

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: Excellent. Thank you for your time this afternoon, and I speak to you as a strong supporter of the AAMUP rezoning project, and want to commend the staff of DCP and Councillors Hudson and Osse for getting us this far. I want to make a couple points about this one. I live nearby. I live just two blocks from the southern edge of

822

03:04:11.830 --> 03:04:16.459

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: the rezoning area which ends at,

823

03:04:16.610 --> 03:04:27.200

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: I believe, Bergen and I'm on Prospect. So I walk around this neighborhood, and I see changes, and I think a lot of there's been a lot of well-intentioned and thoughtful

824

03:04:28.080 --> 03:04:43.420

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: work to protect existing tenants. But I walk around the neighborhood, and I see new buildings, and I think that's great. I can't wait to share this neighborhood with people who want to live here, and I wish the new buildings were bigger, and I want to make a really important point about the plan itself and

825

03:04:43.610 --> 03:05:03.800

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: the decreasing steps of density, and you'll excuse my hair. I'm on paternity leave. So I was taking care of a baby today, so you know, I didn't have a chance to do my hair for the commission day. But I just noticed on video. This is really important. The step downs from Atlantic to the avenues to Grand and Classon and Nostrand, and Franklin and others, and then to the mid blocks.

826

03:05:04.590 --> 03:05:17.520

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: It's silly. DCP and the Commission should make a point to note that and make it a priority for DCP. And others for future land use actions to get rid of this practice. There's no reason to put

827

03:05:18.380 --> 03:05:27.610

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: new multifamily buildings and prioritize that only on major thoroughfares and large quarters. That's a silly way to live.

828

03:05:27.770 --> 03:05:29.499

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: We as humans.

829

03:05:29.630 --> 03:05:40.850

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: Sometimes we enjoy activities. Sometimes we enjoy peace and quiet, and there's no reason that residents of new buildings, new multifamily buildings, should be pushed onto thoroughfares, and we've spent a lot of time talking about traffic on Atlantic.

830

03:05:41.130 --> 03:05:50.979

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: Atlantic is a barrier. Atlantic's a problem. Who wants to live on Atlantic when you can live on Bergen and Dean and Prospect, etc, and inside the inside, the the zoning area Pacific.

831

03:05:51.810 --> 03:05:53.350

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: There's no reason

832

03:05:53.620 --> 03:06:11.100

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: to mandate higher densities on those thoroughfares when there are wonderful, excellent streets there. So the whole area really off of Atlantic should be R7D. I also want to point out something that I thought there was a good conversation about the future of Atlantic Avenue, and I know that.is committed to a traffic study.

833

03:06:11.300 --> 03:06:29.370

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: and I want to emphasize to the extremely slow bus times coming across Atlantic today and make sure that we are prioritizing bus riders in that redesign, as Atlantic is currently an enormous barrier between the neighborhoods.

834

03:06:29.370 --> 03:06:47.389

xPH05 - 13 - Toby Hyde: But north and south across the territory. So again, please approve this plan. Please move this along. It's been in process for years and years, decades, and Gibb can recite chapter and verse. How long this plan has been in progress. So Commission, please move this forward in timely fashion. Thank you so much.

835

03:06:48.090 --> 03:06:56.599

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you, Mr. Hyde, and we wish you all the best with that baby over there. Okay, let's move on to Alex Maza and Antonio Alvarez.

836

03:06:59.010 --> 03:07:00.329

xPH05 - 15 - Alex Maza: Hello! Can folks hear me?

837

03:07:01.640 --> 03:07:02.610

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): We can.

838

03:07:03.080 --> 03:07:26.429

xPH05 - 15 - Alex Maza: Great good afternoon, everyone. My name is Alex Maza, and I live just around the corner from this project in Crown Heights. I live on a corner of Franklin and Prospect. And I'm here today in strong support of this proposal and the much needed upzoning along Atlantic Avenue and in the area. I'm deeply concerned about the ongoing rise in rental prices in Brooklyn, and in this area in particular, is an urgent need of more housing

Maza-01

839

03:07:26.540 --> 03:07:32.760

xPH05 - 15 - Alex Maza: demand keeps growing. People want to live here, but the supply isn't keeping up, and that's driving prices higher and pushing people out.

840

03:07:32.860 --> 03:07:40.040

xPH05 - 15 - Alex Maza: This project is an important step forward towards creating more housing that we desperately need, and addressing this affordability crisis.

841

03:07:40.060 --> 03:08:05.819

xPH05 - 15 - Alex Maza: That said, I think we should even go further. I think we need to have more. As much density as we can in the proposed area on the scale of housing crisis demands bold action, and we cannot afford to miss opportunities to build as much housing as possible in well-connected transit. Rich areas like this one. And that's like the previous person mentioned. I also am in support of making more possibilities for improving the transit for busing in this area

Maza-02

Maza-03

842

03:08:05.820 --> 03:08:34.970

xPH05 - 15 - Alex Maza: that's also highly needed. And so I think you know, as someone who wants to remain in the city long term, and eventually start and raise a family here. I worry about whether that will be possible if housing remains so scarce and expensive. So we need to make sure that New York is a place where working families, working people, and families can build a future, and that means embracing more density and more housing. So I urge the Commission to approve this up zoning. And you know I thank you all for your time and hearing us out today.

Maza-04

843

03:08:35.740 --> 03:08:37.580

120 Broadway Hearing Room: Great. Thank you for being with us.

844

03:08:38.516 --> 03:08:45.639

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Next up is Antonio Alvarez, followed by Sharon Wedderburn. Here in the room and then Kari Williams on Zoom.

845

03:08:50.080 --> 03:08:51.459

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: Hi! All! Can you hear me?

846

03:08:52.010 --> 03:08:52.400

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): We can.

847

03:08:53.420 --> 03:09:14.629

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: Great. Thank you, Commissioners. I just wanted to express my strong support for this project for 2 main reasons. 1st off is housing affordability. I'm a young adult living in bed-stuy bordering this corridor, and I'm experiencing the housing crisis firsthand. This is the exact type of project that the city needs to stabilize the housing market and put some downward pressure on the rental market.

848

03:09:14.850 --> 03:09:32.210

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: I'm not a high income earner, and I know that when this project goes forward, I will not necessarily not necessarily win one of the lotteries, or be able to afford the market rate housing. However, I know that if these types of projects are not built, the housing scarcity crisis will continue to escalate, and I will no longer be able to even afford my current apartment.

849

03:09:32.490 --> 03:09:39.830

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: and not even consider having children or starting a family in the neighborhood right now, because there are no housing options within my price range.

850

03:09:40.030 --> 03:09:57.690

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: It's really simple. We need more housing options, and these projects bring this desperately needed housing. I think this is especially prescient when you consider the current state of affairs on the corridor, which is predominantly occupied by dilapidated car garages, abandoned warehouses, empty lots, and old buildings and old storefronts.

851

03:09:57.900 --> 03:10:07.130

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: This redevelopment will be an immense step forward for brooklyn and the area, and the suggestion that neighborhood character trumps. The human need for housing, I think, is frankly inappropriate.

852

03:10:07.790 --> 03:10:11.160

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: The second reason I strongly support this project is the work

853

03:10:11.260 --> 03:10:18.610

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: done to improve pedestrian and cycling safety on, around, on, and around the corridor. I'm not sure if any of the commissioners

854

03:10:18.900 --> 03:10:48.489

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: live or visit this corridor often, but I actually go to the gym on Atlantic Avenue and walk it almost every other day. The road, as it is right now, is incredibly dangerous, for pedestrians and cyclists. Cars fly down this road at extreme speeds. The crossing is incredibly long, and the turns are really blind which makes walking or cycling around it, not only dangerous, but frankly, really scary. This has the result of cutting Bed-Stuy off from the neighborhoods to south, which include the Central Brooklyn Library and Prospect Park.

855

03:10:48.490 --> 03:11:02.080

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: I know there was some concern from Commissioner Osorio about increasing open space in the region, which is an important consideration, but Atlantic Avenue is one of the main barriers stopping Bed-Stuy residents from getting to the largest park in this area in Brooklyn.

856

03:11:02.230 --> 03:11:11.230

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez: The park is easily a 10 min bike ride away from my apartment, but I often choose not to ride to it, because I know I'm risking my life every time I try and cross Atlantic Avenue.

857

03:11:12.130 --> 03:11:29.850

Alvarez-03

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez : This area is just ripe for redevelopment, for high density housing, and it really needs to be considered strongly. In conclusion, it's the exact type of project that should be a no brainer for the planning commission, and I asked the commission as a citizen of Brooklyn. If not this, then what?

858

03:11:29.940 --> 03:11:54.899

PH05 - 21 - Antonio Alvarez : It's incredible to see the extreme lengths the applicants have gone to, not just address community concerns, but also to meet the needs of the local residents. If we cannot say yes to this type of project, then we may as well give up on addressing the Housing crisis, give up on vision 0 for pedestrian safety and give up on development across the city. So much work and so much care has been given into this proposal that it really needs to be given the go ahead. Thank you so much for your time. I appreciate it.

859

03:11:55.553 --> 03:11:56.860

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you.

860

03:11:57.070 --> 03:12:01.010

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Next up is Sharon Wedderburn, Ms. Wedderburn Welcome.

861

03:12:01.130 --> 03:12:16.129

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): followed by Kari Williams, Chloe Stern, and Robert Witherwax. And let me just make a quick public service announcement for a moment here before you start. If you're interested in being heard on this item, we're getting close to the end of the line. So please sign up.

862

03:12:16.190 --> 03:12:40.220

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): Welcome. Good afternoon. Everyone. Thank you for your careful consideration of this project. As it has been said before, this has been a more than decade long. Endeavor first started with the Community Board in order for us to be able to one provide housing and two to provide jobs that people who do not have college degrees will be able to make a better salary to enable them to stay within the city.

863

03:12:40.310 --> 03:13:04.799

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): I'm not going to beat some horses dead. But I want to tell you this. We actually approved this unanimously, but our vote was yes, but so things that are critical because because I cheer housing, advocacy and land use. I've heard from multiple stakeholders over and over and over again. And as a resident of this community, I've also experienced in terms of what happens with different types of housing

864

03:13:04.800 --> 03:13:29.210

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): and the vast loss of our residents. Over a 10 to 15 year period, we first started seeing a lot of displacement beginning around 2012. Some of it was stemmed in 2019 with the passing of the State laws regarding rental tenant protections. So let's start at the very beginning. We are all always in favor of having more affordable housing.

865

03:13:29.290 --> 03:13:49.829

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): Specifically, to this district. There are two projects that were designated to be raised to R7D zoning. We only want this zoning to be possible. If it is 100% affordable. It's important to our community and being enabling people to remain.

866

03:13:49.830 --> 03:14:14.400

Wedderburn-01

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): The thing that I'm really concerned about are tenant protections. So we know that people that are facing evictions are more likely to be successful in saving their evictions. If they have legal representation, as we know, from different zones within or near our communities, specifically zip codes of 11213, 11216, 11238, 11233. We've had a lot of displacement. Representation makes a difference

867

03:14:14.400 --> 03:14:38.949

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): of someone being able to stay there. And it's not unrealistic, you know. Lofty to say that you know 10 million dollars annually. Will that cover everybody's needs? We doubt it, but we need to be able to approach a number that it gives everybody a fair opportunity to remain in the community, because oftentimes the displacement occurred in the constructive evictions where landlords were able to double the rents of

868

03:14:38.950 --> 03:14:50.260

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): nothing changed in the apartment but the people who were occupying them. Right? So you know, just being able to be in a well located, well-resourced community is important.

869

03:14:50.260 --> 03:15:14.689

Wedderburn-02

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): The next thing is the establishment for the registry. For those who have been displaced. We strongly support this, and this is something that did not, that came from the community directly, that in order to be able to maintain the character of a community. A community is not buildings, it is not open space buildings, open space, and its residents, and it gives a history to the community. Our community is very rich in terms of long-term residents.

870

03:15:14.690 --> 03:15:23.019

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): and we have people who have been able to live there throughout their lives. And I'm talking about the octogenarians within our community that give us a great sense of history.

871

03:15:23.270 --> 03:15:33.060

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Ms. Wedderburn, you have a question from Vice Chair knuckles, so there may be occasion to, if there are more things that you wanted to say might be a chance there. Thank you.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Vice Chair Knuckles): Did you want to conclude your remarks in one or two sentences.

872

03:15:33.060 --> 03:15:56.860

Wedderburn-03

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): This is very important that we get this project to proceed as quickly as possible. We've been waiting for a long time. We need to take special consideration for those who have been included in many of the planning of the new development coming online, and as looking to the Atlantic Yards project, and what it has not been able to deliver, it has not been able to deliver the community's voice.

873

03:15:56.860 --> 03:16:06.830

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): and we urge the funding of an ongoing monitoring group so that we would be able to continue to monitor progress and monitor the obligations, as stated at this time.

874

03:16:06.860 --> 03:16:16.340

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Vice Chair Knuckles): Thank you. Two long sentences

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): That's me. I wanted. I wanted to thank you for your testimony and and for your

875

03:16:16.420 --> 03:16:24.599

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Vice Chair Knuckles): commitment to your to your community. I wanted to ask you mentioned 100% affordability.

876

03:16:24.710 --> 03:16:49.140

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Vice Chair Knuckles): What AMIs do you believe constitute 100%?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): So the people that are most struggling are the people that are to remain within the community, or people that are earning salaries between 45, and $80,000, too much money oftentimes for them to be subsidized, too much money coming out of their net income from their working. So that posits something that goes between 45 and

877

03:16:49.530 --> 03:16:55.210

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): 60% affordability. 80%, 80% AMI is de facto market.

878

03:17:01.020 --> 03:17:25.810

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, thank you all. Thank you. Thank you. Stay right there, Commissioner.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Sorry I was a question. Thank you chair. Thank you for being here. Thank you for your testimony. We heard earlier from HPD in terms of you know their constraints in terms of fully responding to what's both kind of like the tenant displacement registry and the housing preference program. And so I'm wondering if HPD has reached out to you? Has there been conversations, have they?

879

03:17:25.810 --> 03:17:38.180

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Those? Have there been opportunities to brainstorm around ways to address it?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): We haven't brainstormed together. There is some awareness about that because it's like, Wow, this is bold proposal, but this is our opportunity to ask for it. So

880

03:17:38.390 --> 03:17:56.689

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): we and and there are members of the committee that have professional experience in terms of, you know, looking at buildings and looking at project viability. So we understand that there is a risk. But there is a risk well worth taking, and I think between the community being involved and the planning professionals being involved, we can come to a good resolution.

881

03:17:56.870 --> 03:18:00.289

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you for your recommendations and for your testimony.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Sharon Wedderburn): Thank you so much.

882

03:18:00.530 --> 03:18:01.670

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you.

883

03:18:02.900 --> 03:18:10.020

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay. Next up is Kari Williams on Zoom, Chloe Stern, and Robert Witherwax.

884

03:18:12.650 --> 03:18:14.309

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: Good afternoon. Can you guys hear me.

885

03:18:14.810 --> 03:18:15.810

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): We can.

886

03:18:16.210 --> 03:18:16.990

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: Awesome.

887

03:18:18.463 --> 03:18:41.059

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: Okay. Well, hello. My name is Kari Williams. I am a community member and neighbor as well as a member of the local Westbrook Memorial Garden, which is a Brooklyn Queensland Trust Community Garden, located at 1233 Pacific Street, which is Block 1200 Lot 70, and would be impacted by the Atlantic Avenue, any developments on the Atlantic Avenue on Lots

888

03:18:41.060 --> 03:18:53.780

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: 5, 1621 and 27. The Pacific Street is zoned as R6A and the Atlantic Avenue side is currently zoned as M1-1 and R6A and similar to

889

03:18:53.920 --> 03:18:58.059

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: some previous speakers. We'd like to suggest

890

03:18:58.160 --> 03:19:21.980

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: as a local community member. I guess I'll be transparent and saying, I think there's as word about the development continues to sort of be spread and get out. There's a lot of confusion and fear specifically about the details of the rezoning and the densities, and specifically, like shifting to higher density models in like R9A, specifically, I know, like not all properties are being suggested to

891

03:19:22.400 --> 03:19:41.039

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: to be driven up to R9A. However, the idea of the development impacting the local neighborhood in a, in an environmental aspect, in a communal aspect, and in sort of like a day to day. Life aspect is pretty important but for this meeting, particularly we wanted to

892

03:19:41.040 --> 03:20:05.550

Williams-02

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: kindly request that, like as part of the environmental impact studies, that shade studies be done with any proposed development on that 1200 Block. So that's like right where that's like in between Atlantic and Bedford Avenue. So that's like, right on Atlantic and in within the AAMUP, because that would largely impact our space as well as like the local sort of like rental spaces, like a lot of like light.

893

03:20:05.550 --> 03:20:32.310

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: Would a lot of like light, and, like that current renters depend on would be shifted. On this we, as many other speakers, support this plan. We think environment, or we think the shift in housing is important. We are living in a housing crisis. We've worked with our Council member to get more aspect on this, and we also know that outside of the housing crisis there's a lot of private interest in this land, so development is likely to be slated regardless.

Williams-03

894

03:20:32.310 --> 03:20:38.314

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: And within this, on a block, with a lot of members who are rent, stabilized, who

895

03:20:38.820 --> 03:20:56.086

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: are currently struggling with current deregulation, current deregulation and displacement. That these these shade studies, that the environmental impact study as well as like our the previous concerns about deep affordability and

896

03:20:56.830 --> 03:21:04.950

PH05 - 23 - Kari Wiliams: deep affordability. Open space and community impact are are highlighted. And yeah, thank you for your time.

897

03:21:07.000 --> 03:21:11.750

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you very much, Ms. Williams, we appreciate it. Okay. Next up is Chloe Stern.

898

03:21:12.430 --> 03:21:22.310

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): I do not have Chloe stern chair.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay. And, Mr. Witherwax. You may be the last word. We'll see if Ms. Stern comes back to join us, but I will just again.

899

03:21:22.310 --> 03:21:45.949

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): I encourage anybody who wants to be heard today. This is your chance to sign up.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): Great, I am cognizant that I'm what stands between you and lunch, so I will keep this brief. I am Robert Witherwax. I'm the chair of Community Board, Eight's Environment Sanitation and Transportation Committee. You already heard from my colleague and friend for many years Sharon Wedderburn, our land use and housing chair. You've also heard from Gib Veconi, who serves on Community Board 8 along with us.

900

03:21:46.040 --> 03:22:15.629

Witherwax-01

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): So I'm just going to hit some of the spots that they kind of missed or didn't come up in their testimony. One of the tent poles of AAMUP and M CROWN as Community Board 8 has dealt with it for the past 10 years has been a cross subsidy to keep the light manufacturing uses that currently exist in this space under the M1-1 to keep them

viable, even as we move into a residential framework. So items number 2 and 3 on our comments on AAMUP really go to that. And we want to refer you to the Gowanus mix

901

03:22:15.730 --> 03:22:30.190

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): that was approved in the recent years as a model that we think is applicable to these spaces. Moving on to some of the economic development aspects of our comments on the AAMUP.

Witherwax-02

902

03:22:30.190 --> 03:22:53.649

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): the workforce development programs, the career development programs for youth and young adults. Right? The apprenticeship incentive programs go hand in glove with keeping those kind of uses here present in an otherwise residential community, in ways that are compatible and non-exclusive. The local entrepreneur capital fund, for example, as well as the green technology incubator, and even a relocation fund much like you would do with tenants

903

03:22:53.660 --> 03:22:57.860

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): who are displaced during the construction, residential tenants.

904

03:22:58.040 --> 03:23:26.839

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): perhaps a model for commercial tenants as well could be. It could be explored. And then, in conclusion, on my bailick of the streets. I just want to underline the fact that we have called for a master plan for the local stakeholder community to develop a comprehensive plan for the street network that addresses many of the concerns that the Commissioners have brought forth today, and that Dash Henley brought forth in his testimony, too. We're taking a more wait and see approach than perhaps the borough

Witherwax-03

905

03:23:26.840 --> 03:23:48.979

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): president did with calling for a road diet right away, but that would certainly be something we'd entertain at the Community Board level. And then finally, as an overarching element of all of this, again, our point 25. On our testimony, the city shall fund a consultant act as a facilitator of a community. Oversight body formed to oversee the city's delivery of all of these benefits

Witherwax-04

906

03:23:48.980 --> 03:23:57.270

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): as part of the aim up neighborhood rezoning to provide transparency and accountability with the funding and body described therein.

907

03:23:57.270 --> 03:24:20.190

Witherwax-05

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): So with all that, I encourage the Commission to support AAMUP. Thank you very much.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Great. Thank you. We have a question from Commissioner Osorio.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Thank you, Chair. Thank you so much for being here for your testimony, but also for the thoughtfulness of the recommendations. I'm particularly very interested in the economic development recommendations, and I'm wondering if you know, we heard earlier from GMDC.

908

03:24:20.190 --> 03:24:36.129

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): And so I'm interested in hearing a little bit more about what's been the process to develop them? Have you had opportunities to discuss them with the City specifically, but also, has GMDC. Been part of these conversations like, how can tell us a little bit more about the process behind this? How did you get there.

909

03:24:36.680 --> 03:25:00.900

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): I, personally, wasn't very integral to the development of those points, so I can't speak to whether GMDC has been a part of them or not, but I know, really they came from the community to a large degree. They came from the members of our

Board and the committees of our Board that work on these things professionally, and have a vision which was shared for the community.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commissioner Osorio): Fair enough, thank you. And what's been the response? So far to your recommendations.

910

03:25:01.210 --> 03:25:03.760

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Robert Witherwax): I I have not heard. Okay, thank you.

911

03:25:04.390 --> 03:25:33.990

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Thank you, Commissioner. Thank you, Mr. Witherwax. We appreciate you and all the members of Community Board 8 who've been part of this process for so long. We very much appreciate everything that you have done to get us to today. I'm going to just do a quick canvas to see if there's anybody else who is looking to be heard on this item today. Madam Secretary, do you see anybody?

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): No chair. I do not.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Okay, I will note that before I close this hearing, the record will remain open on calendars 22 to 31

912

03:25:33.990 --> 03:25:42.770

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): through 5 o'clock on Tuesday, February 18th 2025, to receive written comments on the DEIS.

913

03:25:43.120 --> 03:26:12.879

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Now I will close the hearing on calendars 22 to 31, and ask you, madam Secretary, if there is any other business before the Commission today.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): No Chair Garodnick, there is no other business before the Commission for the public meeting, but I do have some information to share, for those of you who are unable to or did not wish to testify. You can submit written testimony online

by selecting this hearing on the NYC Engage Portal through DCP's website, or by mailing your comments to City Planning Commission, Calendar Office

914

03:26:13.330 --> 03:26:23.620

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Commission Secretary): Calendar Information Office, 120 Broadway, 31st Floor, New York, New York, 10271. The time is 1:28 pm.

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Great. Just want to note.

915

03:26:23.790 --> 03:26:46.709

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): So maybe come 1:29 pm. I will just say we appreciate everybody who turned up today to testify on all the items that we heard. Thank you to the Department City Planning staff, Brooklyn office in particular, on AAMUP. Thank you. And our partner agencies at HPD and

916

03:26:46.710 --> 03:26:58.860

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): the others who were here today. We thank you very much for all of your time and attention, of course, to the Commission as always, appreciate your attentiveness and patience throughout this process. So with that now at

917

03:26:59.260 --> 03:27:05.469

120 Broadway Hearing Room (Chair Garodnick): Madam Secretary, you can call the time 1:28 pm. So 1:28, we are adjourned. Thank you.

From: Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To: Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject: Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date: Wednesday, February 5, 2025 9:50:26 AM

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Paula Young**
Zip: **11216**

I represent: **Myself|A local community group or organization**

Details for "I Represent": **Westbrook Memorial Garden**

My Comments:

Vote: I am **other**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information?

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments: Young-01

Westbrook Memorial Garden is a Brooklyn Queens Land Trust (BQLT) community garden located at 1233 Pacific Street (Block 1200; Lot 70) and would be impacted by development on Atlantic Avenue on Lots 5, 16, 21, and 27. The Pacific Street side is zoned as R6A, and the Atlantic Avenue side is currently zoned at M1-1 & R6A. Lot 21 currently is a warehouse building that is currently full of loft tenants. We are a thriving community garden with approximately 90 members, and the green space is home to a large pollinator garden with over 60 perennials and native plantings, in thanks to two Citizens Committee of NY 'All In Neighborhood' grants. The community space also has raised garden beds and grow pots with over 40 neighbors growing food, and is a local gathering spot for community events like a Halloween celebration for the children, a Thanksgiving Hot Meal Giveaway, tenant rights information sessions, open garden days, etc. The community garden serves as a connector across environmental and social programs. I would like to kindly request that shade studies be done with any proposed development on the block, and to have the community garden in mind and conversation, an important part of holistic urban planning and landscape urbanism. The 1200 block, and community garden members, consist mostly of renters, many of whom are rent stabilized and struggle against ongoing deregulation in our neighborhood and so understand the threat of displacement and the need for maintaining current, and, future affordable housing. There is also an opportunity for an additional green space for our

community at the empty lot (Lot 11; 1134 Pacific Street), adjacent to a proposed new housing development on Lot 14. Thank you to Chi Ossé's team, and to everyone for your hard work and vision of AAMUP. I appreciate your consideration of our current community environmental spaces and making these integral to the planning process.

From:	Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To:	Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject:	Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date:	Wednesday, February 5, 2025 10:10:23 AM
Attachments:	TABK AAMUP letter.pdf

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Alex Morano**
Zip: **11216**

I represent: **A local community group or organization**

Details for "I Represent": **I represent the Transportation Alternatives Brooklyn Activist Committee (TABK)**

My Comments:

Vote: I am **other**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **No**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments:
Please see the comments and recommendations of TABK in the attached letter. Thank you.

TRANSPORTATION ALTERNATIVES

Dear Councilmember Hudson, Brooklyn Borough President Reynoso, Department of City Planning Chair Garodnick, and Department of Transportation Commissioner Rodriguez,

Morano-01

The AAMUP rezoning presents a generational opportunity to transform the Atlantic Avenue streetscape in the project zone and Council District 35. Atlantic Avenue was once the home of thriving working-class communities. Now, it is one of the most dangerous streets in the city, primarily serving the needs of people cutting through the corridor rather than the people who live on or near it.

To create a holistic plan for Atlantic Avenue, which spans Crown Heights, Prospect Heights, and Bed-Stuy, it is essential to center street safety for all. The plan should prioritize creating essential public resources, like green space, fast and reliable transit networks, public open space, and safe cycling infrastructure, while addressing the harm caused by the car-centric planning practices of the 20th century.

Safety

Atlantic Avenue has been unsafe for all road users for decades. The following excerpt is from Councilmember Hudson's own Community Vision and Priorities report:

> *In the time period between 2016 and 2020,* ***there have been two pedestrian fatalities at the intersection of Atlantic Avenue and Bedford Avenue*** *[emphasis added]. In the same five-year period, there have been* ***569 traffic-related injuries along the one-mile stretch of Atlantic Avenue through the Project Area*** *[emphasis added], including 31 severe injuries (12 pedestrians, 8 bicyclists, and 11 motorists).*

Between 2021 and the end of 2024, additional fatalities and injuries on Atlantic Avenue within the project zone include:

- Four fatalities — two motorists and two pedestrians;
- 473 total injuries;
- 831 total crashes, averaging approximately four crashes per week

Morano-02

Public open space

Atlantic Avenue is 120 feet wide throughout almost all of the project zone. Over 80% of this public land is dedicated to moving or storing vehicles, 18% for pedestrians, 0% for buses, and 0% for cyclists. The Avenue's car and parking lanes stretch 94 feet, which could fit an eight-lane highway.

As also noted in Councilmember Hudson's Community Vision and Priorities report, the Project Area lacks public open, green, and recreational space, and those existing spaces are in dire

need of revitalization. Some parts of the Project Area fall outside the NYC Parks Department's "walk to park" zone, meaning they are more than a 5-10 minute walk away from open or green space. New public spaces and revitalization of existing spaces are greatly needed.

Climate/environment

The concentrated vehicle traffic through this corridor, combined with a design that prioritizes traffic, creates harmful externalities for everyone in the surrounding neighborhoods in addition to the overt harm caused by crashes. Notably:

- Asthma hospitalizations in this area are 2x higher than the citywide average.
- The lack of permeable surfaces led to 12+ inches of flooding reported during Hurricane Ida in 2021.
- The community districts here rate high on the Climate Change Vulnerability Index.

Morano-03

Recommendations

Immediate and short-term

Given that capital infrastructure projects have long timelines, Atlantic Avenue is a Vision Zero Priority corridor, and there is a lack of public open space in the project zone, we suggest the immediate implementation of the following temporary/short-term measures to improve street safety and public space access:

Morano-04

1. **Implement a road diet on Atlantic Avenue east of Flatbush Avenue:**
    a. Convert this stretch of the Avenue to two general travel lanes in each direction, aligning it with Atlantic Avenue to the west of 4th Avenue and east of Nostrand Avenue.
    b. Repurpose the removed travel lanes to install parking-protected bike lanes in both directions.
    c. Convert Atlantic Avenue between Flatbush and 6th Avenues into a pedestrian plaza.
    d. Where possible, eliminate turns and remove turn lanes/turn bays.
    e. Remove all slip lanes and use curb extensions to calm turning traffic at diagonally intersecting streets.
    f. Plant additional trees along the avenue at the most frequent interval possible.
2. **Add protected cycling infrastructure to the north- and south-running approach blocks that are major cycling corridors:**
    a. For example, the block of Vanderbilt Avenue between Pacific Street and Atlantic Avenue can support barrier-protected bike lanes, as can the same block on

Franklin Avenue. These approaches should be protected to increase safety for cyclists entering the intersection.

Morano-05

3. **Implement pedestrian safety improvement using "light-touch" measures:**
    a. Add fully protected light cycles for pedestrians and cyclists, in which concurrent vehicular turns are banned, to all intersections within the project zone. This could be implemented as a Barnes Dance — in which only pedestrians and cyclists can cross, and all vehicle traffic is stopped.
    b. Daylight all intersections within the project zone using hardened barriers.
    c. Build out pedestrian refuge islands using concrete on all north-south crossings.

Morano-06

4. **Redesign Dean and Bergen Streets as bike boulevards to facilitate east-west bicycle travel through the project zone:**
    a. Reduce speed limits on Bergen and Dean Streets to 15 mph.
    b. Implement green wave timing that will prioritize bike traffic.
    c. Add Leading Pedestrian Intervals (LPIs) at every intersection.
    d. Install clear signage indicating that children and cyclists are using the street.
    e. Implement daylighting at critical intersections, with hard infrastructure and build curb extensions to shorten crossings.
    f. Reverse the car traffic direction of select Bergen and Dean Streets blocks and add modal filters to prioritize people biking and discourage cut-through traffic.
    g. Eliminate truck routes near schools along Bergen Street.
    h. Install bike corrals at the corners of school streets on and within 0.5 miles of Bergen/Dean Streets.
    i. On parts of this corridor including bus routes, transit plaza blocks or similar treatments should be implemented that prioritize buses in addition to cyclists and pedestrians.
    j. Implement automated camera enforcement of bike lanes and double parking violations, as authorized by VTL § 1111-C-1.

Morano-07

5. **Convert Pacific Street between Washington and Underhill Avenues into a pedestrian plaza.**

Morano-08

6. **Install modular bus boarding islands to improve accessibility and allow passengers to board the bus at stops without requiring drivers to pull over to the curb.**

Morano-09

7. **Designate operating funding for public space programs within the project zone, including Open Streets and plaza programs.**

Morano-10

Long term

We strongly recommend the following infrastructure changes be implemented or considered as part of long-term planning for capital improvements:

Morano-11

1. **Redesign Atlantic Avenue as a linear park:**
    a. Eliminate additional general travel lanes in favor of expanding green space for pedestrians and center-running bus lanes.
    b. Repurpose all curb space to prioritize protected cycling infrastructure.
    c. Widen sidewalks and add trees.
    d. Implement curb management that includes/prioritizes loading zones, bike parking, outdoor dining, bioswales and containerized trash.
2. **Redesign Vanderbilt Avenue south of Atlantic Avenue as a slow street, including following elements:**
    a. A protected two-way bike lane.
    b. Transit plaza blocks.
    c. Expanded sidewalks and built-out curb extensions.
    d. Curb management that includes/prioritizes loading zones, bike parking, outdoor dining, bioswales, and containerized trash.
3. **Build out the Underhill Bike Boulevard:**
    a. Build out painted curb extensions and midblock islands as raised spaces incorporating plantings and bike parking.
    b. Include mid-block crossings.
    c. Redesign one-way blocks as shared blocks prioritizing cyclists (including contra-flow).

Morano-12

4. **Further expand the footprint of Lowry Triangle/Underhill Plaza to incorporate the block of Pacific Street between Washington and Underhill Avenues.**
    a. Integrate the plaza into the Atlantic Avenue Linear Park.

Morano-13

5. **Create a north-south running protected bike lane along Vanderbilt Avenue from Grand Army Plaza all the way to the Flushing Avenue greenway.**

Morano-14

Thank you for considering these recommendations. We look forward to seeing an agreement reached that implements all of these suggestions where feasible and proposes reasonable alternatives or compromises where unfeasible.

Additionally, we request a meeting to discuss the possibilities for the AAMUP project zone in more detail and address any questions or concerns regarding our recommendations.

Sincerely,

Liz Denys, TABK co-chair
Alex Morano, TABK co-chair
Kathy Park-Price, TA Brooklyn organizer

From: Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To: Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject: Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date: Wednesday, February 5, 2025 10:40:06 AM

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Corey Leamon**
Zip: **11216**

I represent: **Myself**

Details for "I Represent":

My Comments:

Vote: I am **in favor**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **Yes**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments: Leamon-01

Having been a resident of Crown Heights beginning in 2012, I have crossed this neighborhood-splitting corridor countless times to access local businesses and key transit lines. Vehicle traffic along Atlantic is unsafe for bikes and pedestrians and, being largely industrial, currently provides limited benefit to nearby residents. I am in support of this proposal which will provide a safer, healthier environment with improved resources to local residents. I am in support of new street-scaping to provide tree cover and improve the health and safety of pedestrians and bicyclists, the addition of new housing capacity and affordable housing along an existing transit corridor, improvement of stormwater and sewage infrastructure to enhance the neighborhood's health and climate resiliency, and investment in playground facilities for local children. I implore that the proposal prioritize locally-owned small business in its commercial programming. Thank you.

Leamon-02

From:	Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To:	Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject:	Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date:	Wednesday, February 5, 2025 1:40:46 PM
Attachments:	20250205 AAMUP REBNY Testimony.pdf

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Maddie DeCerbo**
Zip: **11238**

I represent: **A local community group or organization**

Details for "I Represent": **REBNY**

My Comments:

Vote: I am **in favor**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **No**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments:
attached.

REBNY Testimony | February 5, 2025

The Real Estate Board of New York to

The Department of City Planning on The Atlantic Avenue Mixed Us Plan

The Real Estate Board of New York (REBNY) is the City's leading real estate trade association representing commercial, residential, and institutional property owners, builders, managers, investors, brokers, salespeople, and other organizations and individuals active in New York City real estate. REBNY appreciates the opportunity to comment on the Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan, CEQR No. 24DCP019K.

DeCerbo-01

REBNY supports the Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan (AAMUP), which seeks to rezone 21 blocks in Crown Heights and Bedford-Stuyvesant to facilitate 4,599 housing units and vital commercial, office, retail, community facility, local service, and industrial space over the next decade. The plan includes the Special Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use District, allowing light industrial and residential uses to coexist while ensuring active streetscapes, aligning with City of Yes for Economic Opportunity.

These changes are crucial for boosting housing development in a prime Brooklyn area and advancing the City's efforts to address the housing crisis, following the recent passage of City of Yes for Housing Opportunity (ZHO).

DeCerbo-02

Future rezonings, such as the AAMUP, are necessary to the success of ZHO. The proposed actions complement the changes created through ZHO such as the ability to utilize Universal Affordability Preference, eliminate or reduce parking minimums, and include new typologies of small and shared housing. Importantly, the mapping of residential districts within the project area will trigger Mandatory Inclusionary Housing and facilitate the development of affordable housing in these community districts.

REBNY applauds the Department of City Planning and Councilmember Crystal Hudson's work to establish the AAMUP rezoning. New York City needs to add 500,000 new units over the next ten years to meet the city's ever-growing population needs. The proposed actions including a zoning map and text change, disposition of City-owned property, Urban Development Action Area designation,

and Urban Development Action Area Project approval will facilitate both housing and job growth, responding to a need for housing for new and existing residents.

Thank you for the consideration of these points.

Maddie DeCerbo

Senior Urban Planner

Real Estate Board of New York

[redacted]

From:	Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To:	Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject:	Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date:	Wednesday, February 5, 2025 2:18:12 PM
Attachments:	AAMUP GMDC Testimony CPC Feb 2025.pdf

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Brian Coleman**
Zip: **11238**

I represent: **A local community group or organization**

Details for "I Represent": **Greenpoint Manufacturing and Design Center**

My Comments:

Vote: I am **in favor**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **No**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **Yes**

Additional Comments:
Please see attachment for public testimony.

Thank you for this opportunity to provide public testimony for the Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan. My name is Brian T. Coleman; I am the CEO of Greenpoint Manufacturing and Design Center.

GMDC is the City's premier non-profit industrial real estate developer of affordable manufacturing space. GMDC has developed over 725,000 SF of industrial space in Brooklyn and Queens for occupancy by small manufacturing businesses. We currently own and manage seven buildings which are home to over 760 manufacturing jobs among 130 businesses. Our tenants include woodworkers, cabinetmakers, display makers, metal workers, and a variety of artisanal trades and artists.

GMDC owns the multi-tenanted manufacturing center located at 1102 Atlantic Avenue which runs block through to 1093 Pacific Street. In 2012, we bought the former auto parts building from an owner/operator who initially had a total of four jobs in the building, including the two owners. Following renovation, it is now home to eight small businesses with 60 workers between them making an average annual salary of $54,587, well above typical retail and service salaries. Many of the small business owners and workers are also community residents residing in Crown Heights and Bed Stuy.

Coleman-01

GMDC appreciates the planning work that has gone into continuing to encourage modern manufacturing to flourish in the AAMUP area – from the work of the Community Board and their M-CROWN efforts to the support of the Department of City Planning, recognizing that many of today's manufacturers are good neighbors to both residential and commercial uses.

An example of what can be achieved in the AAMUP area is our latest project in Brownsville, at 805 Rockaway Avenue. It is the first mixed-use building in New York City to combine affordable housing and manufacturing space in one structure by safely separating the two uses through efficient and environmentally sustainable design. This project ensured the preservation of existing manufacturing uses on site, creating new jobs, while also providing much-needed affordable housing.

The success of the 805 Rockaway Avenue project was also due to the collaborative partnership between city agencies such as DCP, DEP, HPD, and EDC, which supported the mission-driven commitments of non-profit developers such as GMDC and our development partner, The Bridge.

Public-private partnerships can continue to create innovative projects such as 805 Rockaway and traditional multi-tenanted industrial buildings like 1102 Atlantic Avenue. These buildings can continue to operate in this area as a good neighbor, while also adopting new technologies and creative processes of the evolving and very important light manufacturing sector.

Coleman-01

We hope the conversation can continue as the rezoning moves through ULURP so that these mixed-use projects that incorporate industrial uses may have a chance to develop in the future AAMUP area and bring the good, quality jobs that come with them.

From: Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To: Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject: Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date: Wednesday, February 5, 2025 2:27:20 PM

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Inessah Selditz**
Zip: **11213**

I represent: **Myself**

Details for "I Represent": **I am a 19 year resident of Brooklyn (Lefferts Garden, Prospect + Crown Heights), and recent homeowner in Crown Heights.**

My Comments:

Vote: I am **in favor**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **No**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments:
I urge the CPC to approve the rezoning and redevelopment of Atlantic Ave. This underutilized, unsafe corridor holds immense potential to become a vibrant, green, and equitable district. With bold, visionary planning, NYC can lead the way in urban innovation—transforming Atlantic Ave into a thriving mixed-use hub with much-needed affordable and mid-tier housing. The demand is clear, and the moment is now to set a global example of thoughtful, future-forward development that meets the needs of 21st-century citizens.

From:	Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To:	Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject:	Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date:	Thursday, February 6, 2025 12:52:45 PM
Attachments:	Chi Osse´ CPC AAMUP Testimony.pdf

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Chi Osse**
Zip: **11216**

I represent: **Myself|An elected official**

Details for "I Represent": **Council Member for 36th Council District**

My Comments:

Vote: I am **in favor**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **No**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **Yes**

Additional Comments:
N/A

DISTRICT OFFICE
RESTORATION PLAZA
1360 FULTON STREET, SUITE 500
BROOKLYN, NY 11216
TEL: (718) 919-0740

CITY HALL OFFICE
250 BROADWAY, SUITE 1743
NEW YORK, NY 10007
TEL: (212) 788-7354

E-MAIL: District36@council.nyc.gov

THE COUNCIL
OF
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

CHI OSSÉ
COUNCIL MEMBER, 36TH DISTRICT, BROOKLYN

CO-CHAIR
BROOKLYN DELEGATION

COMMITTEES
CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTIONS
CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES,
AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
FINANCE
GENERAL WELFARE
PUBLIC HOUSING
PUBLIC SAFETY
YOUTH SERVICES

My name is Chi Ossé and I am the Councjl Member for the 36th Council District, representing the neighborhoods of Bedford-Stuyvesant and North Crown Heights. I am testifying on the Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan or also referred to as AAMUP. I cannot speak about this plan without first acknowledging the real housing crisis that severely impacts our city and the district I represent. From 2010-2020, Bedford-Stuyvesant lost more than 22,000 Black residents and this number has likely increased due to the strain of our housing crisis. Because of this, it is key that we as a city work to apply all available tools to both build and increase our affordable housing stock and ensure that residents in existing affordable housing can remain. Community rezonings, like AAMUP, are key to ensuring we not only meet our goal to bring more affordable housing but they also are necessary to make sure our neighborhoods are holistically invested into.

For the past three years, my colleague, Council Member Crystal Hudson, and I have advocated for a comprehensive rezoning plan that works for our communities. And I thank the Administration and the various agencies including the Department of City Planning for working on this rezoning with us. While the existing proposal touches upon our need for affordable housing and investments, I want to use my testimony today to remind the Administration that we still need to do more to ensure this plan works for all of our neighbors along Atlantic Avenue.

Osse-01

First, it is imperative that the Administration increase the amount of new affordable housing in the overall proposal. This community deserves to have every potential city-owned site in the area examined for maximum development of deeply affordable housing. We must also increase resources for HPD and our non-profit partners to help longtime tenants and homeowners securely remain in their existing affordable homes, safe from harassment and predatory practices.

Osse-02

Osse-03

Second, I ask the Administration to invest, through AAMUP, in our district's green and open spaces, including the Lefferts Place and Westbrook Memorial Community Gardens, Hancock and Potomac Playgrounds, and the schoolyards for PS3 and PS93. I ask that the Administration consider bringing in more resources and infrastructure improvements to these spaces. Moreover, I hear and understand the concerns brought to me by the Lefferts Place Block Association and

Osse-04

the impacts of shadows on their community garden. I hope to work with the Administration on this issue and look to consider solutions to mitigate this impact.

Thirdly, I urge the Administration to bring investments to improve the public realm at the Franklin Avenue station and the surrounding areas. According to the Environmental Impact Study, the highest number of incremental subway trips is expected to occur at the Franklin Avenue (C/S) station and with expected heavy usage of this station, it is key to ensure the aesthetics, sanitation, and public safety of the surrounding areas are met. I urge the

Osse-05

Administration to invest into supplemental cleaning services through DSNY and ACE and to invest in social services through DHS and Phoenix House along the Franklin Avenue station corridors. And I urge the Administration to work with the MTA to bring both structural

Osse-06

improvements to the station overpass and the small MTA properties surrounding it – some of which are covered with barbed wire fences, graffiti, and litter -- and system improvements for better train service.

Osse-07

Finally, I want to reiterate that we cannot add thousands of housing units to this stretch of Atlantic Avenue without a clear, fully funded commitment for a comprehensive redesign of this dangerous and inhospitable street.

Osse-08

In principle, I believe we need community rezonings like AAMUP to ensure we bring the housing and investments that are long overdue for our neighborhoods, but it is key to ensure this plan is one that truly works for everyone. I look forward to continuing my conversations with the Administration on this plan and building out a community rezoning we can all be proud of.

From:	Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To:	Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject:	Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date:	Sunday, February 9, 2025 11:54:17 AM

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Lana Irons**
Zip: **11222**

I represent: **Myself**

Details for "I Represent":

My Comments:

Vote: I am **in favor**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **No**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments:
To the City Planning Commission, My name is Lana Irons and I am a resident of Brooklyn who often works, travels, and visits the area being proposed AAMU plan. I am submitting testimony in support of the plan and from the perspective of someone who works with domestic violence survivors in the city shelter system. At this time NYC is going through a housing crisis where there simply is not enough housing. So many people in our city, including those who work are unable to find affordable housing for themselves and their children. This plan is part of a broader need for reforms that allow for more housing construction including affordable housing. I want to offer my endorsement on this rezoning and urge the commission to greenlight these changes. Thank you for your time. Regards, Lana Irons

Irons-01

From: Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To: Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject: Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date: Tuesday, February 18, 2025 7:41:31 AM

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Jessica Backus**
Zip: **11238**

I represent: **Myself**

Details for "I Represent":

My Comments:

Vote: I am **in favor**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information?

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments:

Backus-01

We need more housing in the city, and the current stretch along Atlantic is a wasteland. This rezoning is long overdue. However, I'd like to see tangible commitments to improving the Franklin subway and bus station, particularly the underpass at Lefferts. We routinely see drug dealing at this corner. Please also ensure to preserve light for existing community green spaces, notably the Lefferts Place Community Garden.

Backus-02

Backus-03

From: Avery Medjuck
To: 24DCP019K_DL
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan – C 250014 ZMK
Date: Tuesday, February 18, 2025 5:01:26 PM
Attachments: AAMUP Testimony_C 250014 ZMK_Medjuck.pdf

Some people who received this message don't often get email from averymedjuck@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION! EXTERNAL SENDER. Never click on links or open attachments if sender is unknown, and never provide user ID or password. If **suspicious**, report this email by hitting the **Phish Alert Button**. If the button is unavailable or you are on a mobile device, forward as an attachment to phish@oti.nyc.gov.

Please find my testimony regarding the DEIS in the above captioned matter attached. I will also submit it through the portal.

Best,
Avery Medjuck

February 18, 2025

VIA Email & Public Hearing Comments Online Portal
City Planning Commission
Calendar Information Office – 31st Floor
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
24DCP019K_DL@planning.nyc.gov

Re: Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan – C 250014 ZMK

Dear Commissioners:

Medjuck-01

I am a resident of Lefferts Place and a member of the Lefferts Place Community Garden f/k/a the Lefferts Place Block Association Garden. I am writing to urge the Commission to approve the Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan ("AAMUP" or the "Plan") ***solely to the extent the Plan is amended—consistent with the conditions adopted by Community Board 3—to ensure the preservation of the Lefferts Place Community Garden.***

Throughout AAMUP's planning process, community members—including Community Board 3 and the Lefferts Place Block Association—have consistently engaged with DCP and elected community leaders to express concerns about the impact of AAMUP on the portion of Lefferts Place between Classon Avenue and Franklin Avenue. Indeed, at the Commission's October 15, 2024 Review Session, ***Commissioner Benjamin specifically asked DCP to consider ways to mitigate the impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place.*** By all appearances, however, DCP has made no material changes to the Plan in response to this engagement, despite repeat assurances, across years, that it would "think about" the concerns raised by the community.

Medjuck-02

The impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place will be felt most acutely by the Garden, which has existed in the same location for over 40 years. Per Section 6 of the DEIS, AAMUP will cause 100% of the Garden to be covered in shadows for significant periods during the growing season. To put it bluntly, ***AAMUP will kill the Garden***.

When confronted with this reality, DCP's only real response has been to, in effect, offer thoughts and prayers. DCP's lack of a viable solution to preserve the Garden is especially alarming given that, per Section 5 of the DEIS, AAMUP will reduce open space per capita in the area by 6.29%. At the Commission's October 15, 2024 Review Session, ***Commissioner Osorio urged DCP to find ways to mitigate Plan's effect on open space*** in an area already with minimal access to parks. Council Member Chi Ossé echoed that plea when he testified before the Commission on February 5, 2025. Again, while professing to be "evaluating" solutions, DCP has failed to alter the plan in any way in response to these concerns.

Medjuck-03

I am lucid about the reality that effective urban planning has winners and losers, and that any large-scale plan like AAMUP requires careful balancing of policy considerations. But the implicit suggestion that the destruction of the Lefferts Place Community Garden is simply a necessary cost is hard to swallow given DCP's avowed commitment to mitigating the impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place, especially given that AAMUP inexplicably does not call for *any*

Medjuck-04

upzoning of the north side of Atlantic Avenue west of Classon, *i.e.* south of the *wealthier* blocks on Lefferts Place that are part of Community District 2.

I urge the Commission to approve AAMUP with the conditions relating to the Lefferts Place Community Garden recommended by CB3, or to require alternative amendments to the Plan to ensure preservation of the Garden in its current location.

Sincerely,

Avery Medjuck

From:	Public Hearing Comments (Do not reply)
To:	Jonah Rogoff (DCP); Louise Cafiero (DCP); BrooklynComments_DL
Subject:	Comments re: C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan
Date:	Tuesday, February 18, 2025 5:01:59 PM
Attachments:	AAMUP Testimony_C 250014 ZMK_Medjuck.pdf

Re. Project: **C 250014 ZMK - Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan**

Submitted by:

Name: **Avery Medjuck**
Zip: **11238**

I represent: **Myself**

Details for "I Represent":

My Comments:

Vote: I am **opposed**

Have you previously submitted comments on this project? **No**
If yes, are you now submitting new information? **No**

I have attended or will attend the City Planning Commission's Public hearing on this project: **No**

Additional Comments:
Dear Commissioners: I am a resident of Lefferts Place and a member of the Lefferts Place Community Garden f/k/a the Lefferts Place Block Association Garden. I am writing to urge the Commission to approve the Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan ("AAMUP" or the "Plan") solely to the extent the Plan is amended—consistent with the conditions adopted by Community Board 3—to ensure the preservation of the Lefferts Place Community Garden. Throughout AAMUP's planning process, community members—including Community Board 3 and the Lefferts Place Block Association—have consistently engaged with DCP and elected community leaders to express concerns about the impact of AAMUP on the portion of Lefferts Place between Classon Avenue and Franklin Avenue. Indeed, at the Commission's October 15, 2024 Review Session, Commissioner Benjamin specifically asked DCP to consider ways to mitigate the impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place. By all appearances, however, DCP has made no material changes to the Plan in response to this engagement, despite repeat assurances, across years, that it would "think about" the concerns raised by the community. The impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place will be felt most acutely by the Garden, which has existed in the same location for over 40 years. Per Section 6 of the DEIS, AAMUP will cause 100% of the Garden to be covered in shadows for significant periods during the growing season. To put it bluntly, AAMUP will kill the Garden. When confronted with this reality, DCP's only real response has been to, in effect, offer thoughts and prayers. DCP's lack of a

viable solution to preserve the Garden is especially alarming given that, per Section 5 of the DEIS, AAMUP will reduce open space per capita in the area by 6.29%. At the Commission's October 15, 2024 Review Session, Commissioner Osorio urged DCP to find ways to mitigate Plan's effect on open space in an area already with minimal access to parks. Council Member Chi Ossé echoed that plea when he testified before the Commission on February 5, 2025. Again, while professing to be "evaluating" solutions, DCP has failed to alter the plan in any way in response to these concerns. I am lucid about the reality that effective urban planning has winners and losers, and that any large-scale plan like AAMUP requires careful balancing of policy considerations. But the implicit suggestion that the destruction of the Lefferts Place Community Garden is simply a necessary cost is hard to swallow given DCP's avowed commitment to mitigating the impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place, especially given that AAMUP inexplicably does not call for any upzoning of the north side of Atlantic Avenue west of Classon, i.e. south of the wealthier blocks on Lefferts Place that are part of Community District 2. I urge the Commission to approve AAMUP with the conditions relating to the Lefferts Place Community Garden recommended by CB3, or to require alternative amendments to the Plan to ensure preservation of the Garden in its current location. Sincerely, Avery Medjuck

February 18, 2025

VIA Email & Public Hearing Comments Online Portal
City Planning Commission
Calendar Information Office – 31st Floor
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
24DCP019K_DL@planning.nyc.gov

Re: Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan – C 250014 ZMK

Dear Commissioners:

I am a resident of Lefferts Place and a member of the Lefferts Place Community Garden f/k/a the Lefferts Place Block Association Garden. I am writing to urge the Commission to approve the Atlantic Avenue Mixed Use Plan ("AAMUP" or the "Plan") ***solely to the extent the Plan is amended—consistent with the conditions adopted by Community Board 3—to ensure the preservation of the Lefferts Place Community Garden.***

Throughout AAMUP's planning process, community members—including Community Board 3 and the Lefferts Place Block Association—have consistently engaged with DCP and elected community leaders to express concerns about the impact of AAMUP on the portion of Lefferts Place between Classon Avenue and Franklin Avenue. Indeed, at the Commission's October 15, 2024 Review Session, ***Commissioner Benjamin specifically asked DCP to consider ways to mitigate the impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place.*** By all appearances, however, DCP has made no material changes to the Plan in response to this engagement, despite repeat assurances, across years, that it would "think about" the concerns raised by the community.

The impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place will be felt most acutely by the Garden, which has existed in the same location for over 40 years. Per Section 6 of the DEIS, AAMUP will cause 100% of the Garden to be covered in shadows for significant periods during the growing season. To put it bluntly, ***AAMUP will kill the Garden***.

When confronted with this reality, DCP's only real response has been to, in effect, offer thoughts and prayers. DCP's lack of a viable solution to preserve the Garden is especially alarming given that, per Section 5 of the DEIS, AAMUP will reduce open space per capita in the area by 6.29%. At the Commission's October 15, 2024 Review Session, ***Commissioner Osorio urged DCP to find ways to mitigate Plan's effect on open space*** in an area already with minimal access to parks. Council Member Chi Ossé echoed that plea when he testified before the Commission on February 5, 2025. Again, while professing to be "evaluating" solutions, DCP has failed to alter the plan in any way in response to these concerns.

I am lucid about the reality that effective urban planning has winners and losers, and that any large-scale plan like AAMUP requires careful balancing of policy considerations. But the implicit suggestion that the destruction of the Lefferts Place Community Garden is simply a necessary cost is hard to swallow given DCP's avowed commitment to mitigating the impact of AAMUP on Lefferts Place, especially given that AAMUP inexplicably does not call for *any*

upzoning of the north side of Atlantic Avenue west of Classon, *i.e.* south of the *wealthier* blocks on Lefferts Place that are part of Community District 2.

I urge the Commission to approve AAMUP with the conditions relating to the Lefferts Place Community Garden recommended by CB3, or to require alternative amendments to the Plan to ensure preservation of the Garden in its current location.

Sincerely,

Avery Medjuck