



August 21, 2024 / Calendar No. 4

C 240301 HAM

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD)

- 1) pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law of New York State for:
 - a. the designation of property located at 73 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, 64) as an Urban Development Action Area; and
 - b. an Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and
- 2) pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter for the disposition of such property to developer to be selected by HPD;

to facilitate the construction of a nine-story mixed-use building containing approximately 108 affordable housing units, and community facility space, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 10.

1. Approval of three separate matters is required: The designation of property located at 173 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, and 64) in the Borough of Manhattan, as an Urban Development Action Area (UDAA); and
2. An Urban Development Action Area Project (UDAAP) for such area; and
3. The disposition of such property, to a developer selected by HPD

This application for the UDAAP designation, project approval, and disposition of City-owned property (C 240301 HAM) was filed by HPD on April 24, 2024. Approval of this application would facilitate the development of a two-tower, 9-story mixed-use development containing approximately 108 affordable housing units and the renovation and update of the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market at 52 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, and 64), in the Harlem neighborhood of Manhattan, Community District 10.

HPD states in its application that:

“The Development Site consists of underutilized land that tends to impair or arrest the

sound development of the surrounding community, with or without tangible physical blight. Incentives are needed in order to induce the correction of these substandard, insanitary, and blighting conditions. The project activities will protect and promote health and safety and encourage sound growth and development. The Development Site is therefore eligible to be an Urban Development Action Area and the Proposed Development is therefore eligible to be an Urban Development Action Area Project pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law.”

BACKGROUND

HPD seeks UDAAP designation, project approval, and disposition of City-owned property located at 173 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, and 64). The proposed development would include approximately 108 income-restricted housing units (IRHUs) and a replacement vendor space for the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market, a not-for-profit business incubator in the Harlem neighborhood of Manhattan, Community District 10.

The Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market was established in 1994 as an open air market for vendors of primarily West African origin who were previously located along 125th Street in Harlem. The market was founded by the Malcolm Shabazz Development Corporation (“MSDC”), a community development corporation associated with the Masjid Malcolm Shabazz, which continues to operate the market as a non-profit business incubator today.

The development site consists of four contiguous lots located within the Milbank-Frawley Circle West Urban Renewal Area, originally approved by the City Planning Commission in 1967 as part of a larger Urban Renewal Plan (CP No. 19888). The Milbank-Frawley Circle West Urban Renewal Area is generally bounded by West 125th Street on the north, Fifth Avenue on the east, West 110th Street on the south, and St. Nicholas Avenue and Malcolm X Boulevard on the west. The development site is designated as Site 32D within the urban renewal plan which allows commercial and residential uses on the subject site.

Since the 1961 Zoning Resolution was adopted, several significant zoning actions have taken place affecting the project area and the surrounding area. Along with the first amendment to the Milbank

Frawley Circle West Urban Renewal Plan, in 1998 the CPC approved a Zoning Map Amendment (C 980163 ZMM) to change the existing zoning of the development site and several adjacent lots from an R7-2 district with a C1-4 overlay to a C4-5X district. In 2003, in conjunction with the Second Amended Milbank Fraley Circle West Urban Renewal Plan (C 030243 HUM), the CPC approved the rezoning of the entirety of the block bounded by Malcolm X Boulevard, Fifth Avenue, West 115th and West 116th Streets from an R7-2 zoning district with a C1-4 commercial overlay to a C4-5X zoning district (C 030244 ZMM). Both approvals were designed to advance HPD's housing program in the immediate area.

In 2005, the CPC approved an Urban Development Action Area designation and project approval and the disposition of property by the City (C 050164 HAM) for fourteen City-owned lots located immediately east of the development site (Block 1599, Lots 13-15, 1718, 47-53, 56, 58-59). The approvals facilitated the development of The Kalahari, an eight- to twelve-story mixed-use affordable housing project containing approximately 249 units and commercial and community facility space developed under HPD's Cornerstone program. In 2011, the CPC approved a zoning map amendment extending the newly mapped C4-5X zoning district to encompass the eastern portion of Block 1600, north of the project site (C 110243 ZMM).

The development site is mapped with a C4-5X district, which is a contextual commercial district mapped primarily outside of central business districts where the commercial use serves a larger region. The maximum commercial FAR in C4-5X districts is 4.0 and accessory parking is not required. The residential district equivalent in a C4-5X district is R7X, which permits a residential FAR of 5.0 and a flexible building envelope with higher maximum buildings heights than other contextual R7 districts. A maximum FAR of 6.0 is available for developments participating in the Inclusionary Housing program. Outside of the C4-5X district, the surrounding area is mapped with an R7-2 residential district featuring C1-4 commercial overlays along the avenues and West 116th Street, a major crosstown thoroughfare.

Elsewhere in this geography, the otherwise prevailing context of mixed-use elevator apartment buildings is punctuated by houses of worship, a single-story commercial structure immediately to the west of the development site, a narrow vacant City-owned lot, and a few surviving pre-war

tenements fronting Malcolm X Boulevard. The broader surrounding area is predominately residential in character, typified by pre-war three to four story row houses and four to five story multiple dwellings. Other residential land uses include newer elevator buildings which generally do not exceed thirteen stories and numerous commercial buildings. The development site faces the New York City Housing Authority's Martin Luther King Jr. Towers to the south along 115th Street. Arranged on a superblock extending three blocks south to West 115th Street, the Martin Luther King Jr. Towers campus encompasses ten fourteen-story towers. Ground floor retail activity can be found along West 116th Street and along portions of Malcolm X Boulevard. The neighborhood is well served by mass transit, with subway access provided at West 116th Street and Malcolm X Boulevard by the IRT Nos. 2 and 3 lines. Bus service is also available on Malcolm X Boulevard, Fifth Avenue and West 116th Street.

The project area, coterminous with the development site, is a through-lot site located mid-street on a block bounded by Malcolm X Boulevard and Fifth Avenue, with frontage on West 115th and West 116th Streets, both wide streets. It comprises four contiguous City-owned lots (Block 1599: Lots 9, 61, 62, and 64), measuring about 2,100 square feet of lot area. The project area, coterminous with the development site, is a through-lot site located mid-street on a block bounded by Malcolm X Boulevard and Fifth Avenue. The development site has frontages on West 116th and West 115th Streets, both wide streets.

HPD proposes to develop the site as a single structure with two nine-story towers above a single-story community facility podium. The community facility podium would feature the new vendor market and cover nearly the entire zoning lot. The bulk of the proposed development would be as-of-right pursuant to the underlying C4-5X zoning district. The residential towers would cover roughly 57 percent of the lot area and will front both West 115th and West 116th Streets. The proposed development would have a total of approximately 105,000 zoning square feet of floor area (4.91 FAR), including approximately 85,000 square feet of residential floor area (3.97 FAR) and approximately 20,000 square feet of community facility floor area (0.94 FAR). The residential component would contain approximately 108 affordable rental units, plus one superintendent's unit, with a mix of studios, one-, two-, and three-bedroom apartments. Pursuant to the terms of HPD's Extremely Low- and Low-Income Affordability Program (ELLA) term sheet, at least 15

percent of the units would be set aside to formerly homeless individuals. The balance of the units would have varying affordability levels, with all at low-income rents affordable to households earning up to 80 percent of the Area Median Income (AMI).

The ground floor community facility of the building would serve as a permanent space for the vendors market, featuring 60 stalls with the anticipation that approximately 11 stalls would be rented as food business incubators. The ground floor would provide a fully enclosed space for the market with HVAC, and an approximately 1,000 square foot event space. The market entrances along 115th and 116th Streets would set back six feet from the property line to facilitate access by customers without affecting the pedestrian experience. The residential floors of the building would rise to approximately 95 feet on both 115th and 116th Streets and connect via an approximately 8,000 square foot landscaped open terrace on the second floor accessible to the building's tenants. The existing curb cuts located on West 115th and West 116th Streets would not be altered. Other amenities for tenants would include laundry and community rooms, as well as basement bicycle and storage areas.

During construction, it is anticipated that approximately 36 vendors would be temporarily relocated to a vacant, city-owned parcel at 68 West 116th Street (Manhattan Block 1599, Lot 69) located approximately 100 feet from the development site. 12 vendors whose tailoring businesses are primarily driven by referral would be permanently relocated to a retail storefront in Central Harlem.

Pursuant to ZR 25-251, accessory off-street parking is not required for IRHUs in the Transit Zone; as a result, off-street parking spaces would not be provided in the proposed development.

The building is proposed to be built to Enterprise Green Communities standards. The building's design is expected to incorporate sustainable features such as increased insulation, efficient mechanicals, airtight construction to maintain interior temperature and air-quality while minimizing electrical loads, and solar panels in the rooftop. These sustainable features would conserve energy and promote the health of residents.

To facilitate the Proposed Development, the following action is requested:

Urban Development Action Area Project (C 240301 HAM)

HPD proposes a UDAAP designation, project approval, and disposition of City-owned property for the proposed development site (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, and 64) to be conveyed to a developer to be selected by HPD. The requested UDAAP and disposition actions, in conjunction with the related action, would enable HPD to achieve the overall development objectives for this project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 240301 HAM) was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The lead agency is HPD. The designated CEQR number is 21HPD005M.

After a study of the potential environmental impact of the proposed actions, a Negative Declaration was issued on March 22, 2024. The Negative Declaration included measures that will be required through provisions contained in the Land Disposition Agreement and/or Regulatory Agreement(s) between HPD and the project sponsor to avoid the potential for significant adverse impacts related to noise and hazardous materials. The requirements of the provisions are described in the Environmental Assessment Statement and Negative Declaration

The measures will be required through provisions contained in the Land Disposition Agreement and/or Regulatory Agreement(s) between HPD and the project sponsor, measures in the LDA are binding and will ensure that the identified mitigation measures are implemented. With implementation of these measures, no significant adverse impacts related to noise or hazardous materials is expected to occur during or following construction of the Proposed Project.

On July 23, 2024, a Technical Memorandum was issued to analyze the potential effects of the proposed City of Yes for Housing Opportunity (CHO) zoning text amendment (CEQR No.

24DCP033Y) on the Proposed Project. The Technical Memorandum concludes that the potential changes proposed by CHO, would not exceed thresholds nor create conditions that require new analysis, nor would the proposed changes affect the conclusions presented within the EAS.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 240301 HAM) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on April 15, 2024, and was duly referred to Manhattan Community Board 10 and the Manhattan Borough President in accordance with Title 62 of the rules of the City of New York, Section 2-02(b).

Community Board Public Hearing

Manhattan Community Board 10 held a public hearing on this application (C 240301 HAM) on May 16, 2024, and on June 6, 2024 by a vote of 26 in favor, one opposed, and one abstaining, adopted a resolution recommending approval.

Borough President Recommendation

On June 10, 2024, the Manhattan Borough President recommended approval of the actions with the following conditions:

- “1. That the Applicant demonstrate vendors’ buy-in for the project;
2. That the Applicant work with local service providers to inform and connect with Harlem residents in need of housing;
3. That the Applicant maintain consistent communication with the community about the status of the storefront location for tailoring tenants, including timeline, cost to tenants, and move-in date; and
4. That the Applicant hire locally for the construction of the Proposed Building.”

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On July 10, 2024 (Calendar No. 3), the City Planning Commission scheduled July 24, 2024 for a public hearing on this application (C 240301 HAM). The hearing was duly held on July 24, 2024 (Calendar No. 28). Three speakers testified in favor of the application and none in opposition.

The applicant team, comprising representatives from HPD and the project developer and architect, spoke in favor of the application. A representative from HPD introduced the project team and provided a high-level overview of the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza project, including its location and the requested land use actions to facilitate the Proposed Development. The developer described the organizational structure of Shabazz Procida, LLC, a joint venture entity established to sponsor the project consisting of Procida Development, LLC and the Malcolm Shabazz Development Corporation, the operators and founders of today's Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market.

The applicant team provided the historical context of the market's creation in 1995 as a result of the mayoral administration's enforcement campaign against unlicensed street vending. The applicant team further described the proposed unit mix and affordability levels, both of which would be structured in compliance with HPD's ELLA term sheet. All 108 units would be permanently income restricted and affordable to households earning between 30 percent and 80 percent of Area Median Incomes. The applicant noted that the proposed unit mix exceeds the requirement of the ELLA term sheet that at least 30 percent of units have two or more bedrooms with 36 percent of the units slated to be family sized, in response to the strong urging of Community Board 10.

The applicant team noted that the entire ground floor less circulation and lobby space for the northern and southern residential towers would be devoted to replacement facilities for the vendors. The applicant recounted the project team's public engagement efforts with Community Board 10 dating back to 2019.

The applicant team also stated their intention to leverage the preferential FARs the City is proposing to make available through its CHO text amendment. That text amendment's proposed Universal Affordability Preference Program (UAP) would allow for modest increases in residential FAR in new developments and enlargements provided that the entirety of the bonused floor area is devoted to the creation of permanently income-restricted housing. The developer anticipates that this program would allow the proposed development to achieve an additional story in each of its residential towers and an incremental addition of 14 IRHUs, assuming the adoption of the UAP

zoning text as referred.

The applicant recounted the positive outcomes of the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market in launching roughly 40 brick-and-mortar businesses since its inception and its widely held reputation as a renowned institution within Harlem. In noting the advantages of an enclosed replacement vendor space for the market, the applicant noted that the enclosed facility will ensure greater predictability in hours of operations, improve working conditions and that the introduction of food uses will enliven the market. All non-tailoring vendors will be given the option to return following completion of construction, the developer stated, while also acknowledging that the temporary relocation of existing vendors during the construction period will pose logistical challenges. The developer proceeded to elaborate that the roughly twelve tailoring vendors, the businesses of whom are primarily referral-based, will be permanently relocated to a yet-to-be-identified retail storefront in central Harlem and that they will be appropriately supported in the buildout of said space. The balance of the vendors will occupy a vacant City-owned lot on Block 1599 during the construction period.

The Commission echoed the recommendations of Manhattan Community Board 10 and the Manhattan Borough President that transparent communication with the vendors will be of paramount importance throughout the construction period. The Commission requested further clarification on the planned nominal increase in daily rents for vending space at the replacement market which a representative from the MSDC provided. Further clarification was requested on the details of the tenure arrangement between the vendors and MSDC, the rationale for the permanent relocation of the tailors, and the business incubator functions of the market. A follow-up memorandum was requested on how the proposed development will achieve passive house design standards. In response to a question from the Commission, the developer provided insight on how the HVAC system will prevent odors in the dry goods section of the replacement market and how natural light will be allowed to penetrate the vending space.

Finally, the Commission asked the applicant team to what extent the vendors were engaged in the design process to which the developer stated that the vendors were surveyed on their business requirements and that this input will inform the program of the replacement booths.

There were no other speakers, and the hearing was closed.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this application for the UDAAP designation and project approval, disposition of City-owned land, is appropriate. The requested actions will facilitate a nine-story mixed-use development containing 108 units of permanently and deeply affordable housing on an underutilized public site.

The requested action of this report complements previous work by HPD to redevelop blocks located along West 116th Street and Malcolm X Boulevard, which had in previous decades featured substantial vacant City-owned land that had been cleared in anticipation of unrealized urban renewal efforts. The Commission believes the proposed development will create much-needed affordable housing while preserving the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market, a vibrant cultural and economic asset in Harlem. The Commission believes the proposed development site's program of the replacement vendor space on the ground floor of the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza will provide a more comfortable working environment to current and future vendors and will enrich the experience of the market through the introduction of food uses and cultural programming within the facilities event space. The inclusion of natural light via skylights and the retention of through lot pedestrian circulation enjoyed by today's market will minimize disruption to the experience of the market while providing protection from the elements.

However, the Commission underscores the imperative for consistent, transparent communication with the current vendors throughout the construction period. Of particular importance to the Commission is that the applicant team be held accountable regarding the permanent relocation of the tailoring vendors present at today's market. For this reason, the Commission requests that the applicant provide periodic updates on the site selection process for the retail storefront in Central Harlem as well as the subsequent buildout and tenanting of the space.

The massing of the residential towers along the West 115th and 116th street frontages will complement the street wall of the adjacent Kalahari and is appropriate for the emerging built

context of West 116th Street, which HPD has been instrumental in establishing through its housing projects and related land use actions in this corridor since the 1990s.

The Commission is pleased this project will bring 108 units of new income-restricted housing to CD 10 at deep affordability levels accessible to the average incomes of CD 10 residents and that will deliver a modern replacement facility for the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market. Accordingly, the Commission believes that the requested UDAAP action is appropriate.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impact on the environment; and

WHEREAS, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development has recommended the designation of property located at 73 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, 64) as an Urban Development Action Area; and

WHEREAS, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development has also recommended the approval of an Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and

THEREFORE, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission after due consideration of the appropriateness of the actions, certifies its unqualified approval of the following matters pursuant to the Urban Development Action Area Act:

- a. the designation of property located at 73 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, 64) as Urban Development Action Area; and
- b. an Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 197-c

and 201 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination and the consideration of this report, the application of the Department of Housing Preservation and Development for the disposition of city-owned property located at 73 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, 64) in Community District 10, Borough of Manhattan, to a developer to be selected by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development, is approved.

The above resolution (C 240301 HAM), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on August 21, 2024 (Calendar No. 17), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Borough President, in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

DANIEL R. GARODNICK Esq., Chair
KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, Esq., Vice-Chairman
GAIL BENJAMIN, ALFRED C. CERULLO III, ANTHONY W. CROWELL Esq.,
JOSEPH I. DOUEK, DAVID GOLD, Esq., LEAH GOODRIDGE, Esq.,
RASMIA KIRMANI-FRYE, ORLANDO MARÍN, JUAN CAMILO OSORIO,
RAJ RAMPERSHAD *Commissioners*

RAJU MANN, *Commissioner ABSTAINED*



COMMUNITY/BOROUGH BOARD RECOMMENDATION

Project Name: Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza			
Applicant:	HPD - NYC Dept of Housing Preservation & Development	Applicant's Primary Contact:	Agata Naklicka
Application #	240301HAM	Borough:	
CEQR Number:	TBD	Validated Community Districts:	M10

Docket Description:

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD)

1) pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law of New York State for:

a. the designation of property located at 73 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, 64) as an Urban Development Action Area; and

b. an Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and

2) pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter for the disposition of such property to a developer to be selected by HPD;

to facilitate the construction of a nine-story mixed-use building containing approximately 108 affordable housing units, and community facility space, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 10.

Please use the above application number on all correspondence concerning this application

RECOMMENDATION: Favorable			
# In Favor: 26	# Against: 1	# Abstaining: 1	Total members appointed to the board: 28
Date of Vote: 6/6/2024 12:00 AM		Vote Location: 231 West 124th Street	

Please attach any further explanation of the recommendation on additional sheets as necessary

Date of Public Hearing: 5/16/2024 6:30 PM	
Was a quorum present? Yes	<i>A public hearing requires a quorum of 20% of the appointed members of the board but in no event fewer than seven such members</i>
Public Hearing Location:	Manh. Community Board 10 Office - 215 West 125th Street, 4th Floor New York, NY 10027 Zoom: https://us06web.zoom.us/join/1qjUv4QnEvmx94sD-wA

CONSIDERATION: Resolution is attached, which was voted at General Board

Recommendation submitted by	MN CB10	Date: 6/7/2024 9:56 AM
-----------------------------	---------	------------------------



Hon. Marquis A. Harrison
Chairperson
Minah Whyte
District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD 10

215 West 125th Street, 4th Floor New York, NY 10027
T: 212-749-3105 F: 212-662-4215
Website: <https://cbmanhattan.cityofnewyork.us/cb10/>

Resolution Manhattan Community Board 10

RESOLUTION: To approve the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza ULURP application for an Urban Development Action Area (UDAA) designation and Urban Development Action Area Projects (UDAAP) approval and Disposition of the Development site.

WHEREAS, New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (*hereafter known as "HPD"*) is seeking approval for application, C240301HAM, for a UDAAP and disposition of city-owned property to facilitate a residential development with approximately 109, 100% affordable units and the redevelopment of the African Vendor Market in Central Harlem, Manhattan, Community District 10; and

WHEREAS, the development team is Malcolm Shabazz Development Corporation (*hereafter known as "MSDC"*) and Procida, the proposed project is a mixed-use building with 108 affordable residential units, plus one building manager's unit to be developed under HPD's Extremely Low & Low-income Affordability Program (ELLA) and ground floor community facility space located at 52 West 116th Street; and

WHEREAS, the proposed program will be developed on four city-owned lots located on 115th and 116th Streets between Malcom X. Blvd. and 5th Avenue; and

WHEREAS, there will be two-nine story mixed-use buildings with 108 100% affordable units for formerly homeless households, households earning between 30% and 80% AMI (incomes from \$32,610 for one person at the 30% level to \$144,080 for a family size of 6 at the 80% AMI level), as well as a ground floor community facility dedicated to the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Market; and

WHEREAS, the project will include sustainable designs that incorporates increased insulation, efficient construction, and solar panels on the rooftop, each residential building will have laundry and bicycle facilities, landscaped terraces, a virtual concierge, security cameras, and a multi-purpose community room; and

WHEREAS, the unit breakdown by apartment size and AMI levels is as follows:

- 24 studios, 45 one-bedrooms, 26 two-bedrooms, and 14 three-bedrooms.
- 10 units at 30% AMI, 34 units at 50% AMI, 47 units at 80% AMI, and 17 units for formerly homeless households. There will also be one two-bedroom unit for the superintendent.

WHEREAS, the monthly rents are based on 2023 AMIs that are subject to change, the rental range

for the 30% AMI units is \$544 - \$931, for the 50% AMI units is \$1010 - \$1739, and for the 80% AMI units is \$1709 - \$2950; and

WHEREAS, MSDC founded the Harlem Market Business Incubator Program in 1994, the current Market is occupied by 62 different vendors that are subject to the outside climate throughout the year. The new market will be an indoor community space with 49 craft stalls and 11 food vendor stalls. The new market will also have dry goods and consumer service spaces, culinary food prep and dining spaces, and special performance & and event space; and

WHEREAS, all existing vendors will be temporarily relocated during the construction, 36 vendors will be moved to a city-owned lot at 68 West 116th Street, while others will be relocated to storefronts located in the Harlem community; and

WHEREAS, MSDC's primary goal is for the current vendors to return to the new market. MSDC also included food vendor stalls in the market design to ensure that legally, certified food vendors were selling food compared to current vendors attempting to sell food to the public that was prepared in their homes; and

WHEREAS, MSDC explained that currently vendors are charged \$15-\$20/day, it is anticipated that the rent will increase approximately \$5/day for craft vendors. Food stall vendors will be charged a higher daily rate that has not yet been determined; and

WHEREAS, a minimum of 5% of the total number of dwelling units must be accessible and designated for households with a person with a mobility impairment, an additional 2% of the units must be designated for households with a person with a hearing or a vision impairment; and

WHEREAS, the developer is currently proposing OurSpace units for Formerly Homeless tenants which will include light touch services. These social services will assist formerly homeless households in making a successful transition to permanent housing as well as maintain tenancy in their affordable housing units. Services offered include eviction prevention, voucher assistance, benefit enrollment, financial coaches, etc. HPD requires one year of services for OurSpace units using a service provider on HPD's qualified list but anticipates ongoing social services may be provided for OurSpace units on a case-by-case basis; and

WHEREAS, on May 16, 2024 during a Land Use Committee public hearing, the project was reviewed and discussed. The committee and other board members voted to unanimously approve the application 11 Yes, 0 No, 0 Abstention, and 0 Recusal.

WHEREAS, on May 29, 2024, the Executive Committee voted 10 Yes, 0 No, 0 Abstention, and 0 Recusal to approve the application.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED

Manhattan Community Board 10 **supports the Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza ULURP application C240301HAM**. During the June 5, 2024 General Board Meeting, the board voted to approved the application 26 Yes, 1 No, 1 Abstention, and 0 Recusal.



BOROUGH PRESIDENT RECOMMENDATION

Project Name: Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza	
Applicant: HPD - NYC Dept of Housing Preservation & Development	Applicant's Administrator: Agata Naklicka
Application # 240301HAM	Borough: Manhattan
CEQR Number: TBD	Validated Community Districts: M10

Docket Description:

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD)

1) pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law of New York State for:

- a. the designation of property located at 73 West 115th Street and 52-58 West 116th Street (Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, 64) as an Urban Development Action Area; and
- b. an Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and

2) pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter for the disposition of such property to a developer to be selected by HPD;

to facilitate the construction of a nine-story mixed-use building containing approximately 108 affordable housing units, and community facility space, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 10.

Please use the above application number on all correspondence concerning this application

RECOMMENDATION: Conditional Favorable

Please attach any further explanation of the recommendation on additional sheets as necessary

CONSIDERATION:

Recommendation submitted by	MN BP	Date: 6/10/2024 5:22 PM
-----------------------------	-------	-------------------------



OFFICE OF THE

MANHATTAN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

1 Centre Street, 19th Floor, New York, NY 10007
(212) 669-8300 p (212) 669-4306 f
431 West 125th Street, New York, NY 10027
(212) 531-1609 p (212) 531-4615 f
www.manhattanbp.nyc.gov
Mark Levine, Borough President

Recommendation on ULURP Application No. 240301HAM Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza By HPD - NYC Dept. of Housing Preservation & Development

PROPOSED ACTION

NYC Department of Housing Preservation & Development (HPD), the owner of Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza (Manhattan Block 1599, Lots 9, 61, 62, and 64) is seeking designation of an Urban Development Action Area (“UDAA”), approval of an Urban Development Action Area Project (“UDAAP”), and disposition of City-owned property (“Development Site”) currently being utilized as the African Vendor Market in Central Harlem, Manhattan, Community District 10. These actions would facilitate a residential development with approximately 108 affordable housing units, plus one superintendent’s unit and a vendor’s market. HPD proposes the disposition of the City-owned development site to a developer selected by HPD to facilitate the proposed mixed-use affordable housing development.

BACKGROUND

The Development Site is located within the Milbank Frawley Circle West Urban Renewal Area, which was first approved in 1997 as a spin-off of the 1967 Milbank Frawley Circle Community Development Plan/Urban Renewal Plan. Since then, amendments have been approved twice, both in 1998 and 2003. Both of these amendments altered the area impacted by the Plan and were coupled with zoning map amendments rezoning areas to C4-5X districts. In 2005, the City disposed of 14 sites immediately east of the Development Site which facilitated the development of the Kalahari, a development of 249 affordable housing units. The C4-5X district was further extended in 2011 to the east and north of the site to facilitate the redevelopment of 23 West 116th Street, which contains 192 units including 83 condominium and 109 affordable apartments,¹ and 11 West 116th Street, which has 30 condominium units.²

A vendor’s market has been in operation on the Development Site since 1994, with 46 vendor stalls, each around 8 square feet. Vendors generally sell items that include health and beauty supplies, clothing, art, jewelry, and more.

¹ <https://www.corcoran.com/building/south-harlem/186158>

² <https://www.hlres.com/buildings/nyc/the-patagonia-11-west-116th-street/787373/condo#:~:text=THE%20PATAGONIA%20is%20a%20distinguished,diverse%20array%20of%20living%20options.>

Proposed Development

The proposed building would have 109 units as shown below.

Unit Type	30% AMI	50% AMI	80% AMI	Formerly Homeless Households	Super's Unit	Total	% Units by Unit Type
Studio	2	10	10	2		24	22%
1 Bedroom	3	12	23	7		45	42%
2 Bedroom	2	6	13	4	1	26	24%
3 Bedroom	3	6	1	4		14	13%
Total Units	10	34	47	17	1	1	
% Units by AMI	9%	31%	43%	16%		109	100%

The ground-floor community facility space would serve as a permanent space for the vendor's market that is currently located on the lot, and will include approximately 60 stalls, with 11 potential food business incubators. During construction, around 36 vendors would temporarily relocate to a nearby vacant City-owned lot located four blocks to the west at 68 West 116th Street in temporary enclosures that are similarly sized to their current 8-foot by 8-foot stalls. The temporary relocation site will be maintained by the development team. Ten tailoring vendors would permanently move to a Central Harlem retail space that will be identified six months prior to construction. The vendors' floor would be fully enclosed and include a 1,000-square-foot event space. Market entrances on West 115th and West 116th Streets would be set back six feet from the property line to mitigate disruption to pedestrians.

The residential floors would rise to approximately 95 feet on both West 115th and West 116th Streets, and curb cuts on both streets would remain in place. The residential floors would be connected by an 8,474-square-foot open second-floor terrace for tenant use. Other amenities for tenants would include laundry and community rooms, as well as basement bicycle and storage areas. The Proposed Development would be built to Enterprise Green Communities standards and incorporate sustainable design features.

Area Context

The development site is located in Central Harlem within Community District 10. The surrounding area includes a mix of residential, commercial, community facility, public, and parking uses. The predominant zoning districts are R7-2 and C4-5X. R7-2 districts allow for mid-density residential buildings with height factor or Quality Housing regulations. The C4-5X district permits commercial and residential buildings with higher FAR and density than surrounding areas and has no parking requirements. A C1-4 commercial overlay along surrounding streets allows local retail like grocery stores, restaurants, and salons on the ground floor.

The area is characterized by low- to mid-rise multifamily walk-up and elevator buildings, as well as commercial buildings. Nearby developments include the NYCHA Martin Luther King Jr.

Towers totaling 14 stories and 527 units south of the site, and the Kalahari with 12 stories and 249 affordable units to the east. The median monthly rent in CB 10 is around \$2,900,³ while median average income is \$62,056.⁴ 44% of CB 10 residents are rent burdened, meaning they spend more than 30% of their income on rent; that percentage jumps to 75% for households that earn less than \$50,000. In Council District 9, which encompasses much of Community District 10, affordable housing construction has lagged behind other districts, and is ranked 19th citywide.⁵

The area benefits from robust transit access and is located within the Transit Zone. The site is approximately 350 feet from the 2/3 subway at West 116th Street, and about a half mile from the 116th Street station served by the B/C lines. The M7 and M102 provide area residents with service uptown and downtown, while the M116 bus provides service crosstown.

COMMUNITY BOARD RESOLUTION

On June 5, 2024, Manhattan Community Board 10 voted to recommend approval of the application. During its evaluation of the application, Board members noted the importance of receiving consistent updates from the development team about the location of the permanent relocation for the tailors as well as the developer's marketing and outreach plan for their units as well as a commitment from the development team to hire locally.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S COMMENTS

The Malcolm Shabazz Harlem Plaza project promises to bring much-needed affordable housing and preserve the vibrant African vendor market, a cultural and economic asset in Harlem. This long-awaited development, supported by Manhattan Community Board 10 over four years ago, is exactly the kind of development we want to see on our publicly owned land near major transportation – deeply affordable, prioritizing local entrepreneurs, and providing desperately needed units for Harlem residents.

That's why, in my report "Housing Manhattanites," I identified this site as a prime candidate for development and committed to accelerating it through ULURP. After working closely with Community Board 10, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD), and other stakeholders, I am thrilled to lend my full support to this project.

As this proposal makes its way through the process, I urge the development team to secure substantial buy-in from the African vendors who currently operate on the site. With an estimated 1,000 daily visitors, this market is an economic engine and cultural touchstone for Harlem. The development team must present a comprehensive relocation plan that ensures the vendors' approval of both their permanent and temporary relocation during construction and maintains the market's vibrancy.

³ <https://streeteasy.com/blog/data-dashboard/?agg=Total&metric=Inventory&type=Sales&bedrooms=Any%20Bedrooms&property=Any%20Property%20Type&minDate=2010-01-01&maxDate=2022-11-01&area=Flatiron,Brooklyn%20Heights>

⁴ U.S. Census Bureau 2021 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates

⁵ <https://tracker.thenyh.org/>

Lastly, I urge HPD to think holistically about this entire city block. The agency should return to Community Board 10 with a redevelopment proposal for the lot that will temporarily accommodate the vendors during construction. This site contains up to 18,168 square feet of developable space – enough to deliver about 30 additional affordable housing units.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

I therefore recommend **approval of Application No. 240301HAM with the following conditions.**

1. That the Applicant demonstrate vendors' buy-in for the project;
2. That the Applicant work with local service providers to inform and connect with Harlem residents in need of housing;
3. That the Applicant maintain consistent communication with the community about the status of the storefront location for tailoring tenants, including timeline, cost to tenants, and move-in date; and
4. That the Applicant hire locally for the construction of the Proposed Building.



Mark Levine
Manhattan Borough President